

THE TIMES WEDNESDAY JANUARY 27

TIMES

27 JAN 1993

TIMES

27 JAN 1993

# South Africa to demolish education apartheid

■ The Bantu Education Act is a dead letter.  
Racial schools will not receive state money

FROM MICHAEL HAMLYN IN CAPE TOWN

A REVOLUTION in education, establishing a totally non-racial and equitable system throughout South Africa, was announced yesterday by Piet Marais, the minister for national education.

The announcement, set out in the equivalent of a departmental white paper and called the Education Renewal Strategy, proposes a single non-racial education policy, in which every child is entitled to schooling up to the highest level according to his ability.

This unitary education policy will be laid down by a central authority but administered regionally through democratically elected bodies. Every child will be subjected to compulsory education for nine years, generally from the age of six to 15.

The proposals represent government thinking but are still subject to negotiation with other political groupings. But Mr Marais insisted that taking race out of education need not wait for the political process to develop. He announced that from now on it would not be possible for the government to fund schools which admitted pupils on racial grounds. No school that received government money would be able to exclude a pupil for any reason other than academic.

The difference in the quality of black and white education has long been one of the bitterly resented products of apartheid, stemming from the policy of Hendrik Verwoerd, the architect of apartheid, who explained in the senate debate on his Bantu Education Act of 1954 that school "must equip the Bantu to meet the demands which the economic

life of South Africa will impose on him", and asked: "What is the use of teaching a Bantu child mathematics when it cannot use it in practice?"

In the next ten years spending on black education dropped (in real terms) from 8.7 rands (about £2) a child to 4.9 rands, while spending on each white child rose from 50 rands to 75 rands. At the same time, the kind of university education that had equipped generations of black political leaders, such as Nelson Mandela, Mangosuthu Buthelezi and Robert Mugabe, was closed to the next generations.

Now, Mr Marais declared, the government intended to eliminate inequalities in spending. Given the pressures on government expenditure this was unlikely to be achieved in fewer than ten years, he said, giving a target date of 2003.

Nor will it be possible, a government booklet on the new policy says, for the present levels of education for whites to be taken as the national norm for the future. It would cost too much. Accordingly, schools wanting to maintain these levels or improve on them will have to find their own funds. The possibility then is of segregation continuing but on economic rather than racial grounds.

The new policy has been welcomed by white liberals in the Democratic party who insist that the government has finally come round to their way of thinking. It was instantly condemned by white hardliners of the Conservative party who said that it was wholly opposed to the idea of a unitary system of education.



GUARDIAN

27 JAN 1993

# Little headway in S Africa talks

David Beresford  
in Johannesburg

**T**HE African National Congress and the South African government yesterday completed five days of crucial talks on ways of getting negotiations re-started, but early indications were that progress had been limited.

In a joint statement, the two sides said that they would be "reporting to their principals with a view to resolving matters and facilitating the resumption of multi-party negotiations." Further talks between the two sides would be taking place.

The ANC went into the talks hoping to get broad agreement on the creation of a government of national unity by early April and non-racial general elections by early next year. There are fears that if they do not get substantive concessions from the government, Nelson Mandela will be forced to give way to militant demands in the ANC for a programme of "mass action" to break the will of the administration of President F. W. de Klerk.

The government's negotiating team is expected to meet Inkatha today in an attempt to patch up a row which blew up between them last week over the alleged obstructionism of white advisers to the predominantly Zulu organisation.

Meanwhile, South African

police yesterday prepared to charge a former officer with perjury over his allegations that he could point out mass burial sites of anti-apartheid activists murdered by colleagues.

After 24 hours of digging under the watchful eyes of journalists and lawyers, the "scandal" over secret burials of police victims was developing into a public relations triumph for the force. Not a single skeleton had been discovered by late yesterday, although police investigators were still ostentatiously pursuing rumours of other burial grounds.

The graves hunt was started by the Johannesburg newspaper, the Sowetan, which on Monday quoted sworn statements by a disaffected policeman, Johnny Mokale, that he had witnessed the torture, killing and burial of activists on a farm in the Western Transvaal.

A police task force headed by two generals and using earth-moving equipment worked until late on Monday night excavating a giant hole on the spot where Mr Mokale claimed the corpses were hidden.

Yesterday they continued the search, digging up the backyard of a police station, near the town of Carltonville, where Mr Mokale claimed more bodies had been buried. Again no evidence of burials was discovered.



# S. Africa pledges parity in schools

## Education chief offers plan but can't name date when inequality in funding will end

By Brendan Boyle

REUTER

CAPE TOWN, South Africa — South Africa's education chief Tuesday repudiated 40 years of racially segregated education but said he could not promise to bring black schools up to white standards before the turn of the century.

Presenting an education renewal blueprint that has been vetted by the white cabinet but not by Nelson Mandela's African National Congress, Education Minister Piet Marais said: "The removal of racial inequality is our immediate priority."

Pressed to give a target date for parity between black and white education, Marais said it was unlikely that spending could be brought in line by the year 2000.

"I cannot give you a date... the important thing is we are absolutely committed to parity as soon as possible," he said.

ANC education spokesman John Samuels called the blueprint "a shift in the right direction."

"However, it's important to see this as a discussion document. We in the ANC also have a set of proposals and we now need to work towards a mechanism that would enable us to discuss these proposals," he said.

Government spending on each white child is currently 4.2 times the budget for each black child, an improvement from a ratio of 18 to 1 in 1970.

Black school classes have an average of 51 pupils, while in white schools each teacher is responsible for 19 children.

Marais said the 140-page renewal plan, drawn up by the government's Committee of Heads of Education Departments, would form a basis for dismantling apartheid in schools.

The committee proposed a single education ministry to replace the four that now exist for black, white, colored (mixed race) and Indian education.

Marais said whites-only schools would remain legal but would not receive state funds. But schools that admit pupils on the basis of religion or culture could receive state funds.

South Africa began to relax 40 years of strict apartheid in schools two years ago, but most black pupils are still educated in crowded and under-funded township schools.

The report said the country needed to open a school a day to keep up with the 4.3 percent annual growth in the number of black pupils, who outnumber whites by more than 7 to 1 in the 40 million population.

A-8 Wednesday, January 27, 1993 ★

SAN FRANCISCO EXAMINER



# Govt plans for nonracial overhaul of education welcomed by ANC

CAPE TOWN — Government's proposed plan to restructure education along non-racial lines, with a strong regional component, was welcomed by the ANC yesterday. The plans, outlined in a 141-page education renewal strategy document, constitute government's opening negotiating position, and few of the proposals will be implemented immediately. They provide a new vision for a deracialised education system with a single ministry but several regional departments.

The proposal suggests compulsory education for all for at least nine years. For

the first nine years the state would finance 95% of the schooling, and for the final three years 75%. By comparison, Model C schools are 83% state-financed.

To equalise expenditure on black and white pupils without overburdening the exchequer, the strategy suggests an extension in "distance education" and vocational training.

Capital expenditure is slashed 25%, with space and cost norms scaled down dramatically, while the "learner-to-educator" ratio is increased to 35:1 at primary school and 32:1 at secondary school.

**KATHRYN STRACHAN  
and TIM COHEN**

The plan is based on a spending level for education of 6% of GDP and an economic growth rate of 3% to 4% a year. It will involve an increase in the education budget from the current R22bn to R33bn (at 1992 rand value) by 2003.

The plan suggests that a national education authority be responsible for the core curriculum, the setting of examinations and the financial structure. However, the "maximum functionally justifiable devolu-

tion of decision-making power" will go to regional departments, communities and institutions.

Presenting the proposal yesterday, National Education Minister Piel Marais would not be drawn on a date by when education expenditure would be equalised, saying this needed to be negotiated. Dismantling the racial aspect of education would start as soon as possible, but "completion would take a little longer".

Although it was still possible for an Own Affairs school to refuse admission to a pupil on the basis of colour, government was

committed to a nonracial future, and "the life expectancy of such possibilities will be removed quickly".

ANC education spokesman Lindelwa Mabandla said the proposals would move education forward. The goal of nine years' compulsory education in particular was welcomed.

He agreed in principle that the move towards parity in per capita spending between black and white pupils could not be achieved "overnight", but added it was essential that the backlog in black education

□ To Page 2

## Education

be made up as quickly as possible.

The proposals were a realistic attempt to solve the problem, he said, and in the light of existing financial constraints, the ANC itself had not envisaged a budgetary allocation of more than 6% for education.

He said the financial limitations had also made it necessary to offer a system of differing options for schooling, such as models where parents and the community were responsible for financing schools.

DP education spokesman Roger Burrows also welcomed the document, but was concerned about the lack of political will to eliminate racial inequalities in the supply of resources within a given timeframe.

□ From Page 1

Government would have to channel every resource, including foreign funding, into "extremely rapid" elimination of backlogs.

"While certain aspects of the proposals can be criticised, they represent a major shift away from racial thinking in education towards a more equitable consideration of our total population," he said.

The CP rejected the plan. Spokesman Andrew Gerber said it would do everything in its power to mobilise Afrikaners and whites against the "foolish direction" in which education was being sent.

● See Page 4  
● Comment: Page 10



## Election turnout could be low

SIMON BARBER

WASHINGTON — Fear, cynicism and confusion could lead to a disappointingly low black turnout in SA's first nonracial election, soon to be published research sponsored by the Matla Trust shows.

"It would be a mistake to believe that voter turnout will be high," Craig Charney, the Wits sociologist who is running the study, told the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace yesterday.

The finding, based on interviews with 24 focus groups throughout SA last November, appeared to reinforce ANC president Nelson Mandela's appeal for electoral assistance during his visit here last week.

Key factors included "widespread fear of retribution", Charney said. Interviewees "were afraid of violence if they do vote, if they don't vote, or if they vote for the wrong people".

The researcher quoted as typical a

woman in the Free State who said: "I would be afraid to vote because I am afraid to die."

There was widespread cynicism, not only about the fairness of the process and the secrecy of ballots, but about the capabilities of the resulting black government.

There was also confusion about what voting entailed, indicating the need for a massive voter education programme.

For many interviewees, the costs of voting seemed to outweigh the perceived benefits, a situation those with an interest in a low turnout would seek to exploit.

Foreign governments, the UN and private groups could play an important part in supporting voter education, mediating disputes on electoral codes and rules, and in providing monitoring and security.



## ANC says 'no' to Inkatha proposal for peace rallies

THE ANC yesterday rejected an appeal by Inkatha leader Mangosuthu Buthelezi that the two organisations short-circuit preparatory talks in favour of high-profile peace rallies in conflict areas of Natal.

The ANC said in a statement it had no objection in principle to ANC president Nelson Mandela jointly addressing rallies with Buthelezi, but added that "such events should be part of a comprehensive approach currently under discussion".

Buthelezi said earlier he and Mandela urgently needed to address meetings jointly, which would result in a "massive movement for peace", instead of engaging in "posturing, skirmishing and manoeuvring for peace".

The ANC said discussions were aimed at "resolving differences and laying the basis for a successful meeting between the leadership of both organisations. . ."

The two parties had in recent weeks held

RAY HARTLEY

a series of meetings to address all issues relating to violence and ensure the creation of a climate for free political activity and tolerance, the ANC said.

Delegations headed by ANC deputy secretary-general Jacob Zuma and Inkatha national chairman Frank Mdlalose had identified and discussed issues.

"The ANC looks forward to further discussions with the IFP so all measures possible can be taken to address the violence and improve relations between the two organisations, both at leadership and membership level," it said in a statement. □ Hundreds of women and children from Maritzburg's Imbali township marched to police headquarters in the city yesterday to demand — among other things — deployment of a neutral security force in the area, Sapa reports.



# Govt, ANC to revive talks

## FROM PAGE 1

cratic South Africa-style talks is within reach.

The row which erupted between the IFP and the government on Monday and Tuesday last week is expected to be settled with more moderate exchanges at a scheduled five-hour meeting at the government's H F Verwoerd headquarters today.

The ANC and government each fielded 20-man negotiating teams in the second half of follow-up talks to the Record of Understanding signed on September 26 last year. Their brief was to address outstanding bilateral issues emanating from the agreement.

The teams spent five days of secluded "bosbe-raad" talks at the Presidencie in Pretoria and then at the De Hoop reserve on the southern Cape coast.

According to the joint media statement issued by Constitutional Development Minister Roelf Meyer and ANC secretary-general Cyril Ramaphosa, the first two days of talks in Pretoria focused on security matters.

These were set to include violence, the fur-

ther release of political prisoners, the ANC's armed wing Umkhonto we Sizwe, and the repeal of certain security legislation.

The teams are known also to have dealt with other legislative measures required to level the political playing fields, as well as transitional measures to prepare for the first open elections.

Technical committees presented the negotiating plenaries with reports and the focus fell on the formation and functioning of a transitional executive committee and its specialist sub-committees.

Three days were set aside to deal with constitutional matters, more particularly those areas in which the ANC and government failed to reach agreement at Codesa II, such as regionalism and deadlock-breaking mechanisms in the constitution-making and amending process. Their respective positions on the re-incorporation of the TBVC states were also addressed.

The joint statement said various models exploring issues such as a government of national unity and regional government were considered.

Before their talks both sides made it clear that bilateral agreements reached would be binding and that decisions affecting other parties would be subjected to multi-party agreement.

A special effort was made to try to address the IFP's opposition to the Record of Understanding, which it interprets as a ganging-up of the ANC and National Party to sideline the IFP in the negotiating process.

The IFP is seen as the most influential party in the Concerned South Africans Group (Cosag) which was formed to oppose the Record of Understanding.

The IFP has demanded a conference of review of the Codesa agreements and the establishment of an entirely new negotiating forum.

While the IFP has been accusing the government of conniving with the ANC, the ANC has been demanding that the government apply pressure on the IFP to return to a resumed Codesa process.

Negotiators believe the IFP would rather desert the Cosag grouping and rejoin Codesa-style talks if Cosag should persist in opposing Codesa's resumption.

The government is fed up with the squabbling between the ANC and IFP. It has also had enough of taking the blame for trouble between them.

Sources said that since Monday's outburst by the IFP delegation — a "last straw" to the government — both sides have been told to stop using the government as a go-between. The sources say that each time the government has delivered the opposing party's point of view, it has been accused of backing the other side.

The government is demanding that the two parties now get together. Some definite undertaking in this regard may be finalised this week.

Talks to get the ANC and IFP leaders — Mr Nelson Mandela and Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi — together are expected to be accelerated after today's meeting.

Yesterday there were early signs of new momentum when the ANC said joint ANC/IFP rallies addressed by Mr Mandela and Chief Buthelezi should form part of a comprehensive strategy to combat violence.

The ANC responded to the IFP leader's call to Mr Mandela to join him in visits to all strife-torn areas.

"The ANC has no ob-

jection in principle to the ANC and IFP addressing joint rallies, but such events should be part of such a comprehensive approach currently under discussion," the ANC said. — Sapa.



## **Govt, ANC plan to revive talks**

**CAPE TOWN.** — Government and African National Congress negotiators returned to Cape Town last night with plans for reviving all-party constitutional talks within weeks.

According to a brief joint statement issued on their return from two days of talks at the De Hoop nature reserve and missile range, some details still need to be resolved with their respective principals.

At least one further round of bilateral talks is expected.

If a follow-up meeting

between the government and the Inkatha Freedom Party today produces the desired result, a formal announcement on the resumption of multi-party talks may be included in State President De Klerk's opening address to Parliament on Friday.

Failing this, the government and ANC may disclose plans for keeping the process of transition to a democratic constitution going without the IFP and the militant Pan Africanist Congress for the time being.

Sources close to key negotiators in all three of the major parties believe

progress towards setting a date for a meeting preparing for the resumption of Convention for a Demo-

**TO PAGE 2**



# STRAIGHT FROM THE ANCISACP Elitist deal-cutting actually SA's best way forward

A STRANGE assortment of critics, from Winnie Mandela to the Sunday Times, have begun criticising the bilateral negotiations between the ANC and the National Party as elitist deal-cutting to share the spoils of power while the underprivileged masses are forgotten.

In Mrs Mandela's harsh phrase, "the NP elite is getting into bed with the ANC in order to preserve its silken sheets, and the leadership elite in the ANC is getting into bed with the NP to enjoy this new-found luxury".

The implication is that the form the negotiations has taken is essentially undemocratic and will produce a backlash from the disillusioned masses whose interests are being abandoned in the rush for the gravy train.

It is a criticism the political leaders should heed, to the extent that it is a warning of how careful they must be not to give the impression of fat-cutting once they are part of an interim government. But in itself the criticism is a serious misinterpretation of the process taking place.

What is happening is the negotiating of a series of pacts between the major political organi-



Allister Sparks

sations, which is the classical form for a transition to democracy to take.

The process is well established. Four years ago, South African political analysts became aware of an extensive study by a team of American scholars of 13 countries — including Spain, Greece, Brazil, Venezuela, Uruguay and Argentina — that have moved from right-wing authoritarianism to democracy without revolution since World War 2.

One of the tears, Philippe Schmitter, came here as a guest of Idasa. He has since sent me his further studies of transitions in Chile and eastern Europe.

In attempting to pinpoint the key factors which enabled these transitions to take place, the authors of what is now a weighty literature on the subject found that "pacting", or negotiated compromises between the major political players, was the most important.

These pacts usually emerge, the authors say, when a series of crises has created an "unstable equilibrium" between the authoritarian forces of the state and those thrusting for democracy, when the regime loses legitimacy but the democratic forces still cannot oust it.

Exactly what has happened in South Africa.

The two sides then try to negotiate a new dispensation. Attempts to do this in large democratic forums usually fail because of the disparity of views and the difficulty of making compromises to cherished positions in a public arena.

Hence the process of pact-forming by leaders. These pacts define the rules under which the parties will operate, with each agreeing to modify its own policy position to accommodate the other's vital interests. When the deal is struck a founding election is held, and the new dispensation is then legitimised by the population at large.

Since they are agreements reached by political leaders, they are obviously acts of political elitism. That means they are vulnerable to attack as undemocratic. Yet they are essential to achieving democracy.

As Schmitter and co-author Guillermo O'Donnell put it in a summing-up volume: "Ironically, such modern pacts move the polity towards democracy by undemocratic means. They are typically negotiated among a small number of participants representing established (and often highly oligarchical) groups or institutes; they tend to reduce competitiveness as well as conflict; they seek to limit accountability to wider publics; they attempt to control the agenda of policy concerns; and they deliberately distort the principle of citizen equality."

Nonetheless, they alter power relations, set loose new political processes and open the way to democracy.

"Pacts are not always possible," the authors say, "but we are convinced that where they are a feature of the transition, they are desirable — that is, they enhance the probability that the process will lead to a viable political democracy."

It is understandable that lay members feel uneasy when their leaders cut deals behind closed doors. But it is the end result that counts more than the means of getting there. The process, however elitist, is going to lead to an

election — and that is when the democracy will begin and the ordinary people have their say.

Even then it will not come to a single step but in instalments. The first steps will be limited: a transitional executive council with power clumsily shared; then an election and a new constitution followed by a "government of national unity", another awkward coalition but this time at least of elected representatives.

With each step the democracy will be widened and the people will become more involved. That is the transforming process. Democracy itself changes the whole game, opening the way for the emergence of new forces. The relationship between the old players will change and new players will emerge. A changing class stratification will transform the political landscape.

The mistake is to imagine we are creating the whole thing now, designing Utopia in one great act of political creation. What we are doing is starting a democratising process. Even then democracy is not an end, but a beginning. It does not end the struggles over the form and purpose of politics. All it does is institutionalise those struggles, providing a framework

in which they can take place constitutionally and peacefully.

The struggle Mrs Mandela speaks of, to promote the cause of the impoverished and unemployed, the people disadvantaged for centuries by colonialism, segregation and apartheid, will go on well beyond her lifetime and mine. It will be the stuff of South African politics for the next 50 years or more.

Democracy provides the means to wage that struggle, and pacting is the most effective way to attain democracy.

Yes, it is important for the NP and ANC leaders to keep their members informed of what is happening in the negotiations, to counter perceptions of bedfellowing and bring their supporters along with them into the deal.

In this the ANC has done rather better than the NP, with its vigorous internal debate over "sunset clauses" and the return to negotiations — which some media critics promptly derided as a sign of divisions and confusion.

But the best way to carry the people along is to build up a sense of momentum. It is endless argument and stalemate that breeds disillusionment. Again, pact-forming is the way. □



## 1 killed, 2 policemen wounded in Natal

DURBAN. — At least one person was killed and two policemen were injured in violence in Natal on Monday, police said.

KwaZulu Police said Bonginkosi Mzobe (20), was shot dead by unknown people late on Monday night in KwaMakhutha, south of Durban.

There were no further details.

KZP Special Constable K Ntshangase was attacked at his

home in Msangweni, KwaMakhutha, also on Monday. Several shots were fired at his house, hitting him in his head and chest.

He was taken to hospital in a critical condition and police are investigating a case of attempted murder.

South African Police spokesman Captain Bala Naidoo reported two ambushes on police vehicles in Natal's Midlands on Monday.

He said Constable Rudi Kock was shot in the leg in Ndaleni, Richmond. He was leaving the township after arresting suspects in a theft case when shots were fired at his police vehicle.

Const Kock is recovering in hospital.

In Pietermaritzburg's Imbali township a patrolling police vehicle came under fire and was hit four times. No one was injured. — Sapa.



## Catholic Church focuses on democracy

THE Catholic Church should devote further attention to its Democracy Campaign, Southern African Catholic Bishops' Conference president Archbishop Wilfrid Napier said in Pretoria last night.

He said the SACBC had turned its attention to the "Get Your ID Document Campaign" to ensure that all who were

eligible would be able to vote.

Delivering his annual report at the SACBC's plenary session, he said the next phase of the campaign would be intense education on the meaning and implications of democracy, particularly the exigency of tolerance.

Reviewing the past year, Archbishop Napier said the major let-down had been the failure of

the politicians to bring Codesa Two to fruition and violence to an end.

"Just how disastrous this failure was, can be gauged by the cost in terms of human lives — 3 600 killed, 6 000 injured and well over 100 000 displaced."

He said judicial commissions of inquiry had exposed a "shocking morass of corruption in the

ranks of administration and the security forces".

They had deepened the crisis of confidence, by extending suspicion as far as President De Klerk.

Mr De Klerk had relapsed into the "kragdadigheid" (bullying) ways of his predecessor, Mr P W Botha, when, in his anxiety to get the Further Indemnity Bill through Parliament he resorted to

the loaded President's Council to break a deadlock.

"This action reinforced the suspicion that he had something to hide, or that he was under pressure to protect certain people."

Last year would be remembered as the year when the breakdown in moral standards at all levels of society reached its worst point. — Sapa.



## PMB township comes to halt as 'war' threatens

**PIETERMARITZBURG.** — Imbali township outside Pietermaritzburg came to a standstill yesterday as transport and schooling ground to a halt amid claims and counter claims of intimidation, and a threat by the African National Congress of war.

The area most affected was the Namibia section

of Stage Two, where many families have fled and others have taken refuge at the Dutch Reformed Church.

Hundreds of ANC supporters, mostly women, marched to the South African Police headquarters in Pietermaritzburg to protest against what they termed Inkatha Freedom Party-police collusion and a plan by IFP supporters from the city and Richmond to eject people from their homes.

They demanded the removal of police and the South African Army from Imbali.

ANC regional secretary Sifiso Nkabinde said his organisation was "tired of being a burial society and from now on it should be an eye-for-an-eye".

He said yesterday's march was the "last one".

"These marches are being treated as circuses and even the State enjoys them. We no longer even have to apply for a permit. They know we will

hand over a memorandum and go home.

"Instead we shall engage in action that will bring quick results. We will consider something like a consumer boycott to force the powers-that-be to end the suffering of our people. From today Imbali will become a regional issue and we will

channel all resources to it," he said.

ANC regional chairman Harry Gwala said ANC members would "remove" IFP members who had occupied their homes and "we want no protection from the army and the soldiers. We are capable of defending ourselves. — Sapa-AP.



## Man tells Goldstone he was shot by guard

A GOLDSTONE Committee witness testified yesterday that he escaped a panga and knife-wielding mob on a train — only to be shot in the neck by a security guard as he fled the station.

The man, "Mr C" from Nancefield Hostel, said

he was shot in the neck by a security officer clad in green as he fled the Mlamlankunzi Station on November 25 last year, following an attack on train commuters.

At the time he identified the man as a Springbok Patrols guard

Mr C told the committee in Pretoria that two shotgun pellets were later removed from his neck at the Baragwanath Hospital. He denied that he had had anything to do with the attack.

But Mr Jacob van Zyl, a director of Springbok Patrols, which is contracted by Spoornet to guard the Mlamlankunzi Station, said the firm's officers stopped wearing green uniforms at least a year ago.

One of the guards, Mr Zola Mathika, did however say that he had shot someone in the back of the head after firing a warning shot.

It also emerged yesterday that Springbok Patrols' brief was to protect Spoornet's property rather than passengers.

Mr Van Zyl confirmed that Springbok Patrols had conveyed different accounts of the incident to Spoornet, but that company director Mr Wahl Bartmann, who could shed more light on the matter, was in the Seychelles and could not be reached. — Sapa.



## Alleged ANC robbers threatened bank guard

Citizen Reporter

THREE alleged bankrobbers and self-confessed members of the African National Congress (ANC), threatened a Phola Park security guard with death if he did not help them "take the White people's money", the Rand Supreme Court heard yesterday.

Alert Industrial Security employee, Mr Ezra Sikwebu, told Mr Justice M J Strydom, that Solomon Mnqanqeni (33) and Mr William Makhosi (28), had threatened to kill him if he did not help them gain access to the Southdale Branch of the Standard Bank — his place of employment — in May 1991.

Mr Mnqanqeni, Mr Makhosi and a third accused, Mr Daniel Motaung (35), face various charges of murder, attempted murder, robbery with aggravating circumstances, housebreaking and the illegal possession of machine-guns, firearms and ammunition arising from a robbery at the Southdale Branch of the

Standard Bank on May 29, 1991, and a hold-up outside Corobrik, in Nigel, on November 25, 1991.

It is believed that Mr F R Memani, appearing for the three accused, was appointed by the ANC after Mr Mnqanqeni, Mr Makhosi and Mr Motaung claimed that the organisation had promised them legal representation.

Two Fidelity Guards employees, Mr Hermanus Lombaard and Mr Daniel Verster, were shot dead during the Corobrik robbery, after which the three accused and several accomplices allegedly escaped with R372 050.

The State, represented by Mr J Pretorius and Mr F Stander, allege further that Mr Mnqanqeni, Mr

Makhosi and Mr Motaung fatally wounded traffic officer Mr Jacobus van der Merwe, after being caught in a speed-trap in Alrode on March 27, 1992.

Mr Sikwebu told the court yesterday that Mr Makhosi (alias T-man), Mr Mnqanqeni ("Speech") and two men named Dlamini and Madiba, had visited him at his Phola Park squatter camp home, on the outskirts of Tokoza, during the week of May 29, 1991. Dlamini and Madiba were not present at court yesterday, he said.

It is alleged that the gang robbed the bank of R571 280 in cash.

The trial continues today.



# SADF, MK will merge — Dr T

THE South African Defence Force is to merge with the African National Congress's military wing Umkhonto we Sizwe (MK) soon, Conservative Party leader Dr Andries Treurnicht claimed yesterday.

**TO PAGE 2**

## 'Merger planned'

**FROM PAGE 1**

"MK will be taken up in the SADF with the understanding that it will be proportionally representative of the population and that the posts of generals who had been retired early will be taken up by Blacks," Dr Treurnicht said in Johannesburg at the opening of the all-White Mine Workers Union annual congress.

According to the CP leader the information was given to him by an informant in the SADF. He declined to give details but undertook to elaborate during the no-confidence debate in Parliament.

Dr Treurnicht warned delegates that should the SADF be taken over by "Communist-inspired forces", Whites would be left defenceless, making self-determination unattainable.

Sketching a scenario of how revolutionary forces had taken over politics in South Africa, Dr Treurnicht said the establishment of an interim government would be a "dishonourable capitulation" by Whites.

To prevent this "total onslaught" the only solution would be to embark on "aaneenlopende volksaksie" (rolling Afrikaner nationalist action), he said, adding that it was

"naive and dangerous disinformation to believe that communism was dead".

The Right-wing leader, who found some unlikely allies in the recent establishment of the Concerned South Africans Group (Cosag), including Inkatha Freedom Party leader Mangosuthu Buthelezi, claimed Cosag's leaders collectively enjoyed the support of the majority of the people in the country.

Dr Treurnicht said a negotiation forum such as Codesa would never be able to reach consensus, making another forum such as envisaged by Cosag a necessity.

Regarding the Afrikaaner-style rolling mass action, Dr Treurnicht said he looked forward to the co-operation of the Mine Workers Union, which would be important in the "mobilisation of the people".

Another speaker, Transvaal Agricultural Union (TAU) vice-president Willie Lewies, said he was not ashamed of being known as a militant: "Moderation would only lead to our demise."

Co-operation between White mineworkers and farmers was therefore needed as a matter of urgency to fight for White survival.

— Sapa.



## ANC Youth's Israeli stance 'disappoints'

Citizen Reporter

JEWISH community leaders in South Africa have expressed "disappointment" over statements made by the ANC's Youth League (Ancyl), a delegation of which is on a fact-finding mission to Israel.

The national chairman of the South African Board of Deputies, Mr Mervyn Smith, and the chairman of the South African Zionist Federation, Mr Abe Abrahamson, described remarks made by Ancyl spokesman, Mr Parks Mankahlana, as "harsh and one-sided".

"No recognition is given to Israel for being the only democracy in the Middle East and that Israel was actively pursuing peace.

"The sentiments ex-

pressed are negative and do not recognise the complexities of the current Middle East situation" the two leaders said in a joint statement.

The national director of the SAJBD, Mr Seymour Kopelowitz, said the Ancyl visit to Israel was as the initiative of the South African Union of Jewish Students and had the full support of the SAJBD.

It was hoped that, in spite of difficulties, dialogue between the two youth groups would continue.

A report from Tel Aviv quoted Mr Mankahlana as saying Ancyl would not support a visit by Mr Nelson Mandela to Israel at the invitation of the Israeli Government, but would not rule out a visit at the invitation of Palestinian communities in Israel.

He also criticised Israel's refusal to speak to the Palestinian Liberation Organisation and cited alleged human rights violations against Israel.



By JOE SLOVO

**Y**OU could wish for nothing more reassuring than the words used by Russell Crystal, supreme of the SA branch of the hysterically anti-communist IFF, to introduce his client's report on ANC detention centres. "Advocate Douglas," he said, "has applied strict legal criteria in pursuit of the truth, and has maintained a consistently high standard throughout — the result of which is indisputable".

Indeed, that is the least one would have expected from a senior counsel who has been at it for 30 years. I last wore a barrister's gown when Mr Douglas was still at law school, and I have no doubt that, as in my case, the same rubrics of law and natural justice must have been drummed into his head.

Among these are: You never reach a conclusion without attempts to hear the other side. You judge on the evidence, not on preconceptions and prejudice. You base a finding on what witnesses have themselves witnessed, not hearsay.

If these be fundamental legal criteria in pursuit of truth then I cannot be blamed for concluding that whatever or whoever he was pursuing in his commission, it was certainly not the truth. For this claim I need not go outside his own report which demonstrably condemns itself as little more than a hatchet job against political enemies. You merely have to examine the evidence on which he bases his conclusion about me to cast a dark pall over the integrity of this IFF venture.

In the first place, since the SACP and its leaders are considered by Douglas and his client to be among the main culprits, why did he not see fit, at the very least, to give the party or those of its fingered leaders an opportunity to answer?

What is Douglas's conclusion about my complicity in crime as the No 2 culprit?

"I come to the conclusion that Joe Slovo, on the evidence (my emphasis) was responsible and accountable for the crimes committed by Mbokodo. He was the most powerful communist in the movement at the time. He was seen visiting the camps including Quatro. He saw for himself what was going on and clearly must have approved of it."

Now, Joe Slovo was, according to the report, one of the most prominent figures. No one could have overlooked his presence, or involvement and approval of the atrocities alleged. Did it not cross Douglas's legal mind that it was extremely odd that of over 100 witnesses he claims to have interviewed under oath, only a single one attests to my complicity and in his case, as I will show, his evidence would be laughed out of court? That witness said:

"Joe Slovo visited Quatro, to my knowledge, during 1984. He visited the prison at night so that inmates would not recognise him. I might add that we had always had the highest regard for Joe Slovo who was head of special operations. The fact that he could associate himself with the brutality of our imprisonment at Quatro came as a great shock to me. I was told by the warders of his visit and recall their boasting of his being in their company."

By what tortured reasoning can any person, even without legal training, use this bit of hearsay pantomime to ground Douglas's conclusion that Joe Slovo "saw for himself what was going on and clearly must have approved of it"? But what



Joe Slovo . . . laws of natural justice must apply.

is more disturbing is that Douglas for good measure, and without the benefit of a single strand of even hearsay evidence placed before him, concludes that Slovo was seen visiting the prison camps other than Quatro.

What then is left of Douglas's conclusion "in pursuit of truth"? It is that I was "the most powerful communist in the movement at the time". He places considerable reliance on a book he read and some chats with the author. The book is "Comrades against Apartheid" by Stephen Ellis and Sechaba.

Douglas regards Stephen Ellis as a most reliable and knowledgeable expert on our exile history. It is common cause that Ellis had little, if

any, personal knowledge of the evils he describes and relies largely on his co-author who remains anonymous. There is no single identifiable source quoted in the book that (as Douglas avers) the ANC's security arm was operated by the SACP.

Also, why the selective quotes from Ellis's book which Douglas studied "very carefully"? Was it a printer's error that the following quote from Ellis's book was omitted from the report?

In the chapter dealing with allegations about the prison camps, Ellis has this to say: "Joe Slovo, for example, although known to be a communist, remained popular with the rank and file of the ANC and

Umkhonto we Sizwe throughout these difficult times. No one questioned his commitment and no one doubted his personal integrity."

To cap it all, listen to this gem: "There is also evidence that a top level delegation headed by Oliver Tambo which included Joe Slovo, Joe Modise, Cassius Make and Ronnie Kasrils visited Cambodia, Laos and Vietnam in 1978. The idea, so I heard, to create Quatro came from none other than Pol Pot who, so it is claimed, murdered some three million of his fellow Cambodians."

The visit to Cambodia and Laos never took place. When we went to Vietnam (Kasrils was not there), it was in a state of war with Pol Pot. The dirty underwear of the commission is nowhere more visible than the way it throws in the smear about Pol Pot with words "so I heard". It is public knowledge that the ANC was the first to engage in an inquiry into whatever crimes may have been committed in its prison camps.

There is no precedent anywhere in the world for a liberation movement to so openly unclothe itself. Unfortunately not only Douglas but also some sectors of the media have complained that those responsible have not been identified, well knowing that a commission has been launched by the ANC to do this. In its first commission those mentioned had not had an opportunity to respond.

By what standard of fairness can the ANC be criticised for doing something which goes to the very root of our common law? The doctrine of *audi alteram partem*, to protect individual liberty by providing a fair hearing, was scandalously evaded by Douglas and the ANC's attempt to take the route of natural justice is, to boot, also rubbished by his commission. □



### **Aussie celebrations marred**

MELBOURNE — Australia Day celebrations yesterday were marred by an Aboriginal protest in one state and controversy over speeches in two others.

January 26 commemorates the arrival of the first whites in Australia, in 1788, to form a convict settlement.

At a ceremony in the Victorian town of Port-

land, an Aboriginal woman wrenched a flag from a naval rating.

In Brisbane, an Aboriginal activist upset whites by saying Australia Day was "the day the nightmare began".

In Sydney, Aborigines were angered by New South Wales Premier Bob Carr saying whites had brought civilisation.

— Star Foreign Service.



The report of the Douglas Commission into human rights abuses in ANC detention camps has caused a furore in political circles, especially insofar as it attaches blame for these abuses to prominent leaders. The publication of the report, sponsored by the International Freedom Foundation, led to claims and counter-claims.

Believing that the debate is of great importance for all South Africans, The Star invited Joe Slovo — one of the leaders named in the report — to set out his reasons for rejecting Advocate Bob Douglas's findings. Douglas was then invited to respond to Slovo's charges. The arguments appear here — giving readers an opportunity to make up their own minds.

# ANC camps: rivals square up



# THE STAR, WEDNESDAY 27 JANUARY 1993

## Rules apply to all

By BOB DOUGLAS

**M**R Slovo's emotionally charged attack on my integrity does him no credit. Rather he should have explained why the ANC built a prison camp like Quatro in which it beat and tortured young recruits to death.

He should also have explained why he is still committed to Marxist principles when all reasonable people know that the application of such principles brings about utter devastation.

Slovo was invited to deal with the allegations against him. On October 1 1992, I wrote to the National Executive Committee of the ANC (Slovo is a member) stating inter alia: "I am fully prepared to make details of all the allegations as well as the members of your organisation who stand accused available and to give you every opportunity you may require of dealing with them."

"If you contact me I shall make myself available at your convenience to meet at any venue which is suitable to you."

In the circumstances it is incomprehensible to me that Slovo can now claim that the *audi alteram partem* rule was not applied.

Slovo misses the point about his responsibility and accountability for the crimes of the ANC's security arm (Mbokodo) in exile. The following facts are indisputable:

- The ANC in exile had a security arm known as Mbokodo (the boulder which crushes).

- Mbokodo committed the most appalling crimes against Umkhonto we Sizwe cadres in exile (see the Amnesty Report and the ANC's own report).



Bob Douglas . . . no hint of apology has been shown.

- Mbokodo was established and controlled by the South African Communist Party.

- Slovo was Umkhonto we Sizwe chief of staff and a leading member of the SACP at the time.

In the light of the above, is Slovo really trying to say he did not know what Mbokodo was doing? What does Slovo say about President de Klerk's responsibility and accountability for the crimes of the South African security forces? He says De Klerk is to blame. All I have done is apply the same rule of collective responsibility to him.

Why does the ANC need another commission to identify those responsible for crimes? The ANC knows exactly who they are and dozens of them have already been identified in

the press (Weekly Mail). The ANC should boot the lot out and the sooner the better.

In vain one searches Slovo's statement for one hint of regret of what happened, for one hint of compassion for the shattered lives of the former inmates. It goes without saying that he hasn't bothered with my recommendation that they be compensated and evildoers punished.

I feel sorry for Joe Slovo. His life's work lies in ruins. Communism is dead. He just does not have the moral courage to say: "My God, we were wrong! I'm sorry."

- Douglas was invited to write a response to the same length as that of Slovo's article, but decided he could make his points in a shorter piece. □



## Killer disease warning

GENEVA — Up to 400 000 people could die from an epidemic of an Aids-like disease that has killed tens of thousands in Sudan, the UN health agency warned yesterday.

The World Health Organisation appealed for \$1 million (£3 million) to buy and transport drugs and materials to treat patients in the isolated area.

The UN Children's Fund said in Nairobi on Friday that the disease, carried by sand flies, had killed 60 000 in southern

Sudan, cut off by civil war from outside medical help.

Kala azar, or visceral leishmaniasis, is spread by parasite-infected sand flies living in acacia forests along flooded rivers. The disease destroys the body's immune system.

"If untreated, all patients with clinical symptoms will die," the agency said.

Clinical cases represented only the "tip of the iceberg", it said. The disease had already spread north and south.

— Sapa-Reuter.