

MNR  
MRC

## ESSENTIAL HEALTH RESEARCH GROUP

Francie van Zijl Drive, Parow, Cape • ☎ (021) <sup>9380911</sup>~~022 0211~~ • Fax (021) <sup>9380377</sup>~~022 1036~~  
☐ 19070 Tygerberg 7505, South Africa  
Private Bag X385 Pretoria 0001 • ☎ (012) 324-1680 • Fax (012) 324-1695

THE COMMISSION ON  
REGIONSREF: 1/11/ **14** / **10**.

DATE: .....  
DATUM: .....  
PAGE: .....  
BLADSY: .....  
OF: .....  
VAN: .....

FOR ATTENTION:  
VIR AANDAG: ..... *Dr. Renosi Mokoale* .....

COMPANY:  
MAATSKAPPY: .....

FAX NO: .....  
FAKS NO: ..... *011-397 2211* .....

FROM: .....  
VAN: ..... *Dr. Olive Shier* .....

MESSAGE:  
BOODSKAP:

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
---------------	---------	------------------	---------------------------	--------	---------

● Olive Shisana, Medical Research Council

AFRICAN NATIONAL CONGRESS (Liberation Movement)	none	Economically sound and socially functional; Balanced urban/rural devel; Compactness; Popular acceptance; Integrative and nonracial basis; Regions should not instrumentalize ethnicity at the cost of the whole	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Uses economic development region as a starting point;</li> <li>• The regions are:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A Western Cape,</li> <li>B Northwest (NC &amp; WTVI)</li> <li>C Orange Free State</li> <li>D East.Cape/Border/Kel/Transkei</li> <li>E Natal</li> <li>F Eastern Transvaal</li> <li>G Northern Transvaal</li> <li>H PWV</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Issues needing clarification:               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Should Border-Kel be joined with Eastern Cape? Arguments: Border-Kel is not economically viable; others say but it is economically functional in terms of development planning.</li> <li>2. Should Northern Cape and Western Transvaal be one or two separate regions? Arguments: a. both regions are small (under 2 million people); b. the two regions are functionally interlinked.</li> <li>3. Should East Griqualand-Umzimkulu (EGU) fall under Border-Kel or under Natal? Arguments: a. EGU has greater economic linkages with Natal than Transkei.</li> <li>4. Pretoria should be part of PWV.</li> </ol> </li> <li>• Constituent assembly should finalize future regions</li> <li>• Process Issues of Concern</li> </ul>	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Gives excellent reasons for using the development regions as a starting point, but cautions that the division of Transkei into a north and south is fairly arbitrary and that the precise demarcation of boundaries has not been researched, and affected communities have not been consulted. (Hence these may only be used for elections, not for permanent demarcation).</li> <li>• If ANC region of Border-Kel is accepted, then issue no. 1 can be resolved by referendum in the area.</li> <li>• If ANC Northwest region is accepted, a referendum may be advisable</li> <li>• If ANC region of Natal is accepted with EGU included, a referendum would be advisable.</li> </ul> <p>Concerns Relating to Process</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Education of the public about the delimitation of regions.</li> </ol>
---	------	--	---	---	---



ANC, CONTINUED			<p>They did not make an input.</p> <p>iii. Separation of powers and functions from boundaries is a problem</p> <p>iv. Delimitation is a political process and this creates a charged atmosphere and undue pressure must be resolved by commission</p> <p>iv. Time period of 6 wks is too short to allow for democratic input</p>		<p>i. Should be done by an independent body prior to finalization of regional boundaries.</p> <p>ii. The time period of six weeks is indeed short and will not lead to a thorough and considered recommendation, hence the suggestion of temporary boundaries for election should be entertained. In this case developed regions could be used.</p>



<b>DRAKENSBURG RSC</b>	<b>37</b>	<p><b>Economic viability.</b></p> <p><b>Ability to develop underdeveloped areas.</b></p> <p><b>Administrative capacity.</b></p> <p><b>Existing infrastructure.</b></p>	<p>They wish to remain as a unit - Drakensburg RSC which includes magisterial districts of Venterstad, Steynsburg Albert (Burgersdorp), Allwal North, Lady Grey, Wodehouse (Dordrecht), Indwe, Barkly East, Elliot and Maclear.</p> <p>Drakensburg RSC is adamant not to be part of Border-Kel but be part of OFS.</p> <p>Portion of Transkei (Herschel / Sterkspruit) should be part of Drakensburg RSC.</p> <p>Few regions are necessary because they are affordable.</p> <p>RSC has good health infrastructure, tied largely in Bloemfontein. OFS University and Technikon provide secondary education.</p>	<b>Minimal</b>	<p>Group indicates that it represents all ethnic groups, rural and urban areas and civic groups.</p> <p>They attached plenty of letters to support the desire to be incorporated in OFS.</p>
<b>UPPER ORANGE REGIONAL DEV. SOCIETY</b>	<b>38</b>		<p>Want RDA 11 to be included in OFS because 80% of all trade is with Bloemfontein. Travel to Port Elizabeth, East London, Umtata are on the other side of the mountain.</p> <p>Snow during Winter makes travelling difficult.</p> <p>Nearest Airport is in Bloemfontein. Many students go to Bloemfontein University / Technikon.</p> <p>Referrals for health services are to Bloemfontein.</p>		<p>It seems logical that boundaries of OFS should extend to include RDA11 (Lady Grey, Allwal North, Burgersdorp, Venterstad, Steynsburg, Herschel/Sterkspruit and Jameston).</p> <p>Similar to Document No 37.</p>

MIDLAND CHAMBER OF INDUSTRIES	41		<p>Vehemently opposed to incorporation of Transkei, Border and Ciskei into Eastern Cape to form one region.</p> <p>Proposed regions should be bordered by Fish River in the East, Gouritz in the West and include Prince Albert, Beaufort West, Victoria West, Colesburg.</p>	<p>A referendum including <u>all</u> people, would determine the answer to this controversial issue of Eastern Cape.</p>
-------------------------------------	----	--	---	--

REGIONAL DEV. ADVISORY COMMITTEE	42	<p>Nine development regions as a starting point.</p> <p>Economic viability.</p> <p>Development potential.</p> <p>Existing administrative institutional cohesion.</p> <p>Local Government and for.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Eastern Transvaal as is, including the whole of the Kruger National Park, should form one region.</li> <li>2. The districts of Mhala and Mapulaneng should be included in Eastern Transvaal.</li> <li>3. That the Delmas District in region H be included in the Eastern Transvaal.</li> <li>4. That Piet Retief and Pongola District be included in Eastern Transvaal.</li> <li>5. Area is economically viable, it contributes 10% of national GGP; recorded the highest growth rate (5.5%) of all regions due to manufacturing, has the lowest unemployment rate.</li> <li>6. Has excellent development potential; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Driskopples Dam with capital investment of R488 million;</li> <li>Columbus Stainless Steel project has capital investment of R3.5 billion;</li> <li>Sugar Mill near Komatipoort has a capital investment of R480 million;</li> <li>Building of Inhaca Dam with capital investment of R250 million.</li> </ul> </li> </ol>		<p>This proposal for Eastern TVL region conflicts with ANC, NP regions because it incorporates the Kruger National Park, currently part of Northern Transvaal.</p>
--	----	---	---	--	--



<b>NATAL AGRICUL. UNION</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>Economic.</b>	<p>Very much opposed to incorporation of the Land between the Umtamvuna and Umzimkulu Rivers into Transkei.</p> <p>Numerous letters attached from various farmers, businesses, Boards and Associations in that area who are in agreement with the Natal Agricultural Union.</p>		
<b>GRAHAMSTOWN RATE PAYERS ASSOCIATION</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>1. Existing infrastructure</b>	<p>1. The status quo of the Eastern Cape Region should be maintained, any division of authority in the region will bring untold hardship to a place already plagued with poverty and high unemployment</p> <p>2. The infrastructure for an administrative capital exists and hence Grahamstown should be a new capital of the Eastern Cape Region and not Port Elizabeth</p>		The desire for the ratepayers association of Grahamstown to have the Eastern Cape region be kept as is, is in conflict with the ANC proposal on Eastern Cape/Border-Kai/Transkei and with the Border-Kai Development Forum.
<b>CAPE TOWN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE (Business)</b>	<b>57</b>	<p>Cost-effectiveness and rationalization of administration</p> <p>Historical, demographic cultural and other factors should play a less important role than the above</p>	Western Cape should include the whole of Development Region A, but extend it to include contiguous areas that have natural links with the region (i.e. natural boundary of Orange River, including half of economic region 17 and economic region 16 and 15)		The demand for Western Cape to include the whole of Development Region A is in conflict with National Party Plan B and ANC Plan, but in agreement with National Party.

UNDERBERG FARMERS' ASSOCIATION	58		The Jnderberg/Himeville/ Potele/Loteni farming regions should remain where they are now in the Province of Natal since they are the main water catchment for Natal.		No conflict with ANC and NP proposals
CHIEF GR HLWELE	59				Concerned with land appropriated by the British colonists; he would like that, since Ciskei will be part of South Africa again, the Amabulu Tribe should be reunited under a single paramount chief and be given a place in the Stutterheim district.
KHWEZINALEDI CIVIC ASSOC.	67		In agreement to being included under the Blomfontein area.		
ECUMENICAL FORUM ON HUMAN RIGHTS	69		Are opposed to the name "SATSWA" as it is ethnically based and there is another ethnic group in the region, ie. Afrikaners.  The Forum views the SATSWA proposal as one of greed as they want to take over Van Meize Triangle, Iron, Platinum, Diamond, Gold and other large areas to extend Bophuthatswana.  Suggest that reasonable options from other structures be considered not the above.		



<b>EAST GRIQLAND JOINT SERVICES BOARD</b>	<b>70</b>	<p>Is a fully autonomous body constituted in terms of Act No 84 of 1990.</p> <p>Covers the Mt Currie (East Griqualand) District of Natal.</p> <p>Is totally economically viable with an annual infrastructural development expenditure budget of R2 million.</p> <p>Is fully integrated with the Assoc. of Joint Services Boards of Natal and KwaZulu.</p>	Any changes in it's regional status would be extremely detrimental from the point of view of the terms of reference which the Commission is directed to take into consideration, in terms of the Resolution by the Planning Committee to the Negotiating Council Meeting.		
<b>MR N P MACDONALD</b>	<b>74</b>	Little connection between the people of St Francis Bay / Humansdorp and the Transkei citizens.	St Francis Bay should be combined with either the Western Cape region or with the Southern Cape region.		
<b>STORMSRIVER RATE PAYER'S ASSOCIATION</b>	<b>75</b>	<p>Economic activities of the area are tourism and forestry.</p> <p>The proposed area is part of the Garden Route and has far more in common with the geographically are to the west that it has with the area administered by the Algoa Regional Services Council under whose jurisdiction it presently falls.</p>	<p>Propose that the boundary of the Outeniqua Regional Services incorporate the area west of the Storms River and south of the Tsitsikamma Mountains into the area administered by the Outeniqua Regional Services Council.</p> <p>The Rate Payer's Association believe it would be both practical and sensible to incorporate the area into the regional presently administered by the Outeniqua Regional Services Council.</p>		



CARLTON-VILLE (CHIEF EXECUTIVE)	77		The Town Council of Carletonville is not interested in any form of Regional Government.		
S ZUNGEN (Individual)	80		There should be four regions eg Cape, TVL, OFS and Natal only. They should be fully controlled by National Government.		
E D DLAMINI (Individual)	82		Regional State preferable to Unitary State.  A Regional State would be able to exercise individual cultures and traditions as it will be very close to the people.  Pass laws will be easily adhered to.		
SACOB (Business)	87	Economic, Languages ethnicity should take secondary role to economic criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* If more power is to be given to regions then fewer regions should be drawn</li> <li>* Minimize the need to create new govt infrastructure</li> <li>* Create viable economic units that can raise revenue to provide expected services</li> </ul>	6- 50	Important issue is the need for communication links and no separate barriers among regions for trade links
KIVSA (Commission into intergovernmental relations instt.)	88	Economic functionality & fiscal capacity; administrative costs and institutional and manpower capabilities; acceptability of new regions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Don't separate highly integrated economic areas to prevent spill-over of services</li> <li>* Don't use historical data since the future may be different</li> <li>* Intra-regional disparity is crucial</li> <li>* Public comment on the final regions is crucial</li> </ul>	6-8	There is a need to show disparities in magisterial districts within each region.

UNITED FEDERAL PARTY (POLITICAL PARTY)	99	Race-ethnic	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Need for a Boerestaat named Boerentia - an area including Eastern Transvaal, starting from Johannesburg, Midrand, excluding Pretoria. Southern Boundary is N3 to Harrismith, eastwards Kwazulu border. 3/4 of Kruger National Park is included.</li> <li>2. Boerentia should be granted immediate secession (within 3 weeks) to a 70% confederal and 30% federal situation.</li> <li>3. If Boerentia is not granted "Bastion", must be if represents 1/5 - 1/4 of Boerentia.</li> <li>4. Will ask R2 billion from Government to buy land from Mozambique and extend Kruger National Park.</li> </ol>	<p>This proposal conflicts with ANC regions, NP regions, Regional Dev. Advisory Committee of Eastern TVL.</p> <p>They promise one person, one vote, but rominees for Regional and Central Government will be whites only.</p> <p>To enter Boerentia, travellers must have identity document, letter of AIDE.</p> <p>Bush telegraph talk of collecting specimens for cholera and contaminate (water) reservoirs in Black Townships.</p> <p>This proposal is a perfect recipe for Civil War.</p>
--	----	-------------	--	--



BORDER-KEI DEVELOPMENT FORUM	159	Existing administrative capacity in the region, in particular Umtata.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Border-Kei should be an economic whole If Eastern Cape and Border are joined, then the region's centre should move to Border-Kei area (East London/King-Williams Town/Bishe)</li> <li>2. Consultation is absolutely essential before precise boundaries are drawn as people will be affected by the decisions.</li> <li>3. Some Northeastern Cape representatives wish to be included in OFS and not in Border-Kei region.</li> <li>4. East Griqualand should be incorporated into Border-Kei</li> <li>5. Port Elizabeth potentially may not want to play a secondary role to any centre.</li> <li>6. The Border-Kei area is poor and the government should find ways to distribute funds to this needy area.</li> </ol>		<p>A potential conflict exists if the Eastern Cape and Border-Kei regions are incorporated, given that Grahamstown rate-payers and Border-Kei Development Forum's demand for being the regional centre.</p> <p>The demand for inclusion of East Griqualand in Border-Kei region is in conflict with ANC's proposal of inclusion of East Griqualand in Natal. A referendum might be one way to resolve the crisis.</p> <p>The Committee is heterogeneous, including the union, business, civics, local government and Ciskei and hence their comments carry weight.</p>



SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
MNU. MUSA KHUMALO (Individual)	30/2	none	support regional government it will facilitate peace		
MNU. BONGINKOSI ZUNGU (Individual)	30	none	support regional government autonomy because it will lead to peaceful existence		
SS SEBITLOANE (Individual)	31	Historical expropriation of land (1913 Land Act)	The 1913 Land Act deprived Kgosi Moroka of land in Orange Free State (eastern side of the mountain the boundary was Leewerwer, near Westminster).		The issue should be referred to those dealing with Land issues.
SM MHOTHA (Individual)	32		Regions should be drawn in consultation with people or structures existing in the regions to prevent drawing of unpopular boundaries.		Although an individual, the concerns are real. The question is given the time frame available, is it feasible to consult all structures in all regions where there is discord?
JM MOROLONG (Individual)	33		It is good to have regions		

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
DR. HB NARAIN (Individual)	34	Ethnic	The regions should be as follows: I. Afrikaner II. Bophutatswana III. Coloured IV. Ciskei V. English VI. Gazankulu VII. Indian VIII. Kwazulu IX. Lebowa X. Transkei XI. Venda O. Azania/South Africa	12	The suggestion given is a repetition of bantustans, which will not promote peace.
DR. RC FOX (Individual)	43	Low degree of variation within each region  High Degree of variation between regions  when too many criteria are used, problems arise	1. Regional identities-sense of belonging will present a major challenge given the NP and ANC proposals for one Border-Kel region (Development Region D), which includes Transkei, Ciskei, Eastern Cape & Border, etc.  2. Problems are likely to occur in selection of administrative centres in every region.		1. A problem exists; when we examine the Border-Kel, Grahamstown and those in Eastern Cape wishing to join Orange Free State we see that the region has an <i>identity crisis</i> .  2. The vie for administrative center has already begun, between East London.....



SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
SATSWA INITIATIVE (Council)	105	Economic viability Administrative boundaries Physical considerations Natural Resources Population Distribution and density Area Commonality Affinity Economic Potential Economic parity within regions	<p>1. Economic viability is of prime importance in demarcating regions.</p> <p>2. The nine economic development regions are not appropriate, because they are too many, seven economic development regions would be appropriate.</p> <p>3. People ultimately should have a say in the determination of boundaries.</p> <p>4. The proposed regions are:</p> <p><u>Option 1:</u> Nylstroom on the Northern border, Potchestroom on the East, Prieska on the South.</p> <p><u>Option 2:</u> Nylstroom on the North border, New Castle on the East, Near Graff-Reinette on the South. Area includes all of Orange Free State). This area comprise 40% of South Africa. (Report says not official proposal for SATSWA).</p> <p><u>Option 3:</u> Nylstroom on the Northern Border, New Castle of Eastern Border, and Prieska on the Southern Border (Orange Free State is included). This is considered to be the basis for negotiation if 6 regions are decided on.</p>	6-7	<p>1. The SATSWA Report is said "Whilst diverse interest groups have contributed to the SATSWA initiative, the status report's contents do not represent the <i>official</i> viewpoint of any of the participants." (italics ours). It raises questions about ownership of this report.</p> <p>2. The report indicates that a final decision was not taken, but participants endorse the principles of demarcation being through negotiations with local residents.</p> <p>3. This report is merely for contribution to debates and thus not a basis for decision-making, as it is not official SATSWA policy.</p>



PRESENTED BY : OLIVE SHISANA, MEDICAL RESEARCH COUNCIL

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
GOVERNMENT OF SOUTH AFRICA	120	<p>All criteria should be weighed equally, they are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. historical boundaries (magisterial districts and provinces)</li> <li>2. administrative issues (infrastructure and services)</li> <li>3. need to rationalise existing structures.</li> <li>4. need to limit costs.</li> <li>5. minimize inconvenience.</li> <li>6. demography</li> <li>7. economic viability</li> <li>8. development potential.</li> <li>9. cultural and language realities.</li> </ol>	<p>a. The nine development regions should be used as a point of departure.</p> <p>b. The powers and functions of regions should not be separated from the exercise of demarcation.</p> <p>c. The demarcation process is not just a scientific process, but should include emotional feelings of residents.</p> <p>d. The regions drawn should be flexible over time, but no proliferation of regions.</p> <p>The proposal is as follows:</p> <p>Scenario A. 9 regions</p> <p>1. Region 1 (Western Cape, including Walvis Bay)</p> <p>1.1. geographically coherent region 1.2. has institutional infrastructure, including legislative capital</p> <p>2. Region 2 (Northern Cape combined with major part of Northern Cape)</p>	7-9	<p>The issues raised concur very much with ANC suggestions for process.</p> <p>1.</p> <p>2. The region is not economically viable; Has not infrastructure for govt; has very low GGP; loses access to services in Cape Town.</p>

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
			<p>3. Region 3 (includes area north of Kei, is served by CPA; has Port Elizabeth in the South)</p> <p>4. Region 4 (includes Transkei and Ciskei, and a corridor in between). It is served by Bisho, Umtata, King William's Town/East London.</p> <p>5. Region 5 (includes Bophutatswana and OFS, i.e. regions C and J)</p> <p>6. Region 6 (Kwazulu-Natal and Pongola in Eastern Tvl, and Umzimkulu)</p>		<p>3. Region 3 has no government infrastructure; the main economic centre, Port Elizabeth is located too far for those living near Kei.</p> <p>4. Region 4 is not an economically viable area when separated from Region 3.</p> <p>5. Region 5 presents major institutional capability problems, given the lack of an administrative place located centrally.</p> <p>6. Region 6 has necessary infrastructure (physical and institutional)</p>


SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
			7. Region 7 (Eastern Tvl)  8. Region 8 (Northern Tvl)  9. Region 9 (PWV)		7. Region 7 is economically viable and functional region.  8. Region is economically dependent; has government institutional capacity of 2 RSCs, Thohoyandou, Lebowa kgomo & Giyani; has Pietersburg/ Lebowa kgomo can accommodate a regional govt.  9. Region 9 is the heart beat of South Africa and can support poorer regions.



SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
			<p>Scenario B</p> <p>Region 1 (expanded to include Western and most of Northern Cape)</p> <p>Region 2 (includes Eastern Cape and Border-Kel)</p>		<p>Region 1 would be difficult for administrative and institutional capacity for those located in the Northern Cape.</p> <p>Is economically viable, has institutional and administrative capacity.</p>
CA PIENAAR	3	<p>It has been divided up into 9 regions</p> <p>The divisions of the regions has been based on the homogeneity in the linguistic, cultural and functional areas. Believe that this consideration would make a significant contribution towards accommodating those forces that threaten the unity of a state in the unitary system. All the regions would be able to provide for their own. Three regions would generate funds and two regions would be under-developed and would require funding.</p>			

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
CONSTITUTIONAL OPTIONS AND AN IMPLICATION FOR GOOD GOVERNMENT	4	This document considers the constitutional options and their implications for good government. The major concerns of this group is that in the interest of democratic and effective constitutional making processes two dangers can be identified: Exact powers and functions of the regions is too early, therefore pre-empting debate and participation. Details and principles that are so broad and vague that the interpretation can lead to conflict. Balance should be between these two dangers.		None	This is a good document where the 17, 10 and 16 regions are discussed and their pro's and cons put forward
SPOTLIGHT ON REGION F		This document considers region F of the 9 regions and	There is an even spread of languages in this region between English and Zulu and consideration would have to be taken in this region in the second language issue. Another reason for concern in region F and this also applies for G is the low level of urbanisation. It is felt that urbanisation should be encouraged but controlled. The health status of this region has also been highlighted with region F having a much lower level of hospitals, doctors, nurses than the average in South Africa. Region G shares similar problems		





SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
AG SCHLEMMER (TOWN CLERK PORT ALFRED)	6	Requires the Council to give consideration to a region with the Fish River as an eastern border and extending westwards as far as possible.			
THE MISSION FROM GRAHAMSTOWN COMMERCE AND IND	7	Grahamstown should be part of the Eastern Cape region not the border Kei region. Feels there is an infrastructure geared toward PE and that the Eastern Cape Division of Supreme Court is situated in Grahamstown.			
DELMAS CITY COUNCIL	8	Dumas currently in region H should be part of F. This is for economic and sense of identity with region F.			
OLDSTHOORN ATTORNEYS ASS.	9	Oldsthoorn should be a part of the Cape Western Province region because all their business court masters and deeds offices are in Cape Town not PE, Grahamstown			
KLEIN KAROO REGIONAL INDUST. COMM MARKETING	10				
RUBIN SEEFF	11	Proposal in support of the recommendations by SA local mission of some note is the idea of creating a separate province for the Afrikaner nation from regions A and B.			

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECCMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
JUDGES OF CAPE of GOOD HOPE	12	Submit that the present Cape of Good Hope should remain as a single unit. Major reason is sound infrastructure judiciary and administrative services in the area			
UMBULO TRIBE	13	The area covering the districts of ....., Komga part of KW'stown from the Indian Ocean to the Thomas River and between the Kei and Nahoon Rivers.			
VENTERSTAD MUN.	15	Venterstad should be linked to OFS not the PE region. They share agriculture, educational infrastructure of OFS. The Management of Coloured Management and the Town Council of Nzizwa and the Farmers Asso. to be linked with OFS.			
UNDERBERG	16	Underberg should be part of Development region E. This is for administrative and institutional capacity as proven effective.			



SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
DEMOCRATIC PARTY NELSPRUIT	17	That the whole of Kruger National Park should be in region F and not in region G and it makes sense that the entire region as a tourist industry remains in one area for planning. It was submitted that Pretoria not be included in region F and should remain part of the PWV. Pretoria would be a major financial drag on the economy of region F which is largely a rural population and crying out for development.			
NATIONAL PARTY CALVINIA	18	The area should be demarcated as North-west Cape. This should exclude the Cape Town Metropolitan area and further North. Major considerations are language: 80% is Afrikaans and majority of people are part of NG Church. Boundaries of this will include Kimberley and Herbert to the north-east. As far as Colesburg, as far south as Prins Albert, Leingsburg, Clanwilliam. The area to the north of Bophuthatswana which falls in region B is excluded.			

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
AVF (Political Party)	124	<p>1. The AVF would like to keep its options open when it comes to choosing an area for Afrikaners.</p> <p>2. They urge negotiators to be in no haste to find solutions.</p> <p>3. They are asking the state's assistance in conducting a referendum to consult the Afrikaners what they would like to have as an area.</p> <p>4. They prefer to discuss a confederation.</p> <p>5. They are prepared to negotiate for a boersstat.</p>	<p>1. Although the AVF has not named the borders of a Boersstat, they attached two maps.</p> <p>Map 1, titled "Border Negotiation Map: A Process" this map marks Region H that joins Bloemfontein and the greater part of Region D.</p> <p>Map 2, titled "A Border Negotiation Process to Minimize Conflict and Optimize Interaction". The map shows nearly a third of South Africa, incorporating Zeerust, Kimberly, Port Elizabeth, East London, Natal.</p> <p>The information presented does not reflect any criteria for demarcating/delimiting a region, but the desire for Afrikaners to have a region of their own.</p>		



25.

SUB DOC NAME	DOC NO	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	#REG	COMMENT
DR. DAVID E. MICHAEL	47	ethnic  economic viability should not be an important criteria	<p>The Afrikaner state (Volkstaat) should be created following three stages:</p> <p>1. negotiation (select area for volkstaat where Afrikaners need not be a majority, but be many; suggests Pretoria and Northern Cape).</p> <p>2. preparation (the selected area is declared affected area for future Volkstaat; the govt gives assistance for those willing to move out; a referendum could be held in the area to determine whether they proceed with consolidation of the Volkstaat).</p> <p>3. consolidation (elections are held in the area, power is transferred from central government and the area is administered as an independent state).</p>		proposal aims to fragment South Africa Advocates for cessation of Volkstaat
BURGERSDOPR MAYOR	48	minimizing inconvenience	<p>Wish to include in Orange Free State the following areas: Lady Grey, Jamestown, Aliwali North, Venterstad, Steynsburg &amp; Burgersdorp. They do not wish to be included in Eastern Cape/Border-Kei.</p>		Supported by Boere-Unie District, National Party District Inwonerskomitee of Burgersdorp



SUB DOC NAME	DOC NO	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	#REG	COMMENT
BASIL J VAN DER MERWE	49	Historical division of provinces	<p>He proposes:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Western Cape</li><li>2. Northern Cape</li><li>3. Eastern Cape</li><li>4. Border/Kei</li><li>5. Northern Transvaal</li><li>6. Eastern Transvaal</li><li>7. Western Transvaal</li><li>8. PWV</li><li>9. Natal</li><li>10. Orange Free State</li></ol> <p>Bantustans to be incorporated in these 10 regions.</p> <p>Warns against too much power to ethnic groups to permit secession.</p> <p>No private armies, no separate courts (that will create the need for extradition).</p> <p>Suggests to avoid the creation of Afrikaners state because it will involve uprooting people (same as Group Areas Act).</p>	10	To comment later

SUB DOC NAME	DOC NO	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	#REG	COMMENT
Signatures not legible	50		<p>1. Signatories to the letter would like to join Orange Free State and not be part of Transkei for the following reasons:</p> <p>-security, administration, conservation and economy.</p> <p>They advocate for patrolled border between their area and Transkei</p>		<p>The letter has not identified the District not to be included in Transkei.</p> <p>None of the criteria accepted by the commission serve as a basis for demarcation of regions.</p>



SUB DOC NAME	DOC NO	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	#REG	COMMENT
NELSPRUIT AFRIKANNSE SAKEKAMER	61	1. economic viability 2. cohesiveness 3. development potential 4. Uses the development regions as a start	1. Eastern Transvaal should be one region. 2. Pretoria and Northern Transvaal should not be part of Eastern Transvaal Region. 3. Eastern Transvaal is economically viable contributing 10% of GGP. 4. There is geographic cohesion in terms of administrative and management framework and there is consensus that the region can manage itself. 5. There is low unemployment rate, new labour intensive development projects. 6. The following issues need to be resolved. a. Should the whole of Kruger National Park be included or remain divided between Northern Tvl and Eastern Tvl? b. Should Delmas District be included in E. Tvl? c.	8-10	

SUB DOC NAME	DOC NO	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	#REG	COMMENT
			<p>be include in E. Tvl?</p> <p>c. Should Boschkosrand-area be included in E. Tvl?</p> <p>d. Should Mhala, Pongola, Mapulaneng, Motatema districts be included or exclude?</p> <p>The finer regional delimitation should be finalized only after all relevant political parties have agreed.</p>		<p>A visit by the Commission to this region to hear suggestions about areas that could possibly form part of Eastern Tvl would be useful.</p>



SUB DOC NAME	DOC NO	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	#REG	COMMENT
QUEENSTOWN MAYOR	52	<p>1. People who belong together should be kept in the same region</p> <p>2. Culture</p> <p>3. Economic functionality</p> <p>4. Development potential</p> <p>5. Demographics (include pop growth and density)</p>	<p>1. Queenstown should be capital of the Border Region, because:</p> <p>a. central location of Queenstown</p> <p>b. existence of infrastructure: electricity and water; professional services; hospitals; industrial and engineering works; viable commercial enterprises; government departments; provincial administration; educational institutions; army base.</p> <p>c. Queenstown is situated on the main railway line and road to Johannesburg-East London</p> <p>d. Queenstown serves as commercial center for 15 towns, which serve 566 600 people.</p> <p>2. Unemployment is app. 65%</p>		<p>Supported by City Council of Sinakho; Tarkastad municipality; CAthcart Municipality; Queenstown Chamber of Commerce; Municipality of Nomonde; Cape Province Women's Agricultural Association; Queenstown Technical College; Sterkstroom Municipality; Molteno Municipality; Hoerskool Hangklip Zola Towns Council, Venterstad Municipality</p>

32



SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
MNU. BONGINKOSI ZUNGU (Individual)	30	none	support regional government autonomy because it will lead to peaceful existence		
MNU. MUSA KHUMALO (Individual)	30/2	none	support regional government it will facilitate peace		
SS SEBITLOANE (Individual)	31	Historical expropriation of land (1913 Land Act)	The 1913 Land Act deprived Kgoel Moroka of land in Orange Free State (eastern side of the mountain the boundary was Leeworwer, near Westminster).		The issue should be referred to those dealing with Land issues.
SM MHOTHA (Individual)	32		Regions should be drawn in consultation with people or structures existing in the regions to prevent drawing of unpopular boundaries.		Although an individual, the concerns are real. The question is given the time frame available, is it feasible to consult all structures in all regions where there is discord?
JM MOROLONG (Individual)	33		It is good to have regions		

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
DR. HB NARAIN (Individual)	34	Ethnic	The regions should be as follows: I. Afrikaner II. Bophutatswana III. Coloured IV. Ciskei V. English VI. Gazankulu VII. Indian VIII. Kwazulu IX. Lebowa X. Transkei XI. Venda O. Azania/South Africa	12	The suggestion given is a repetition of bantustans, which will not promote peace.

Olive Shisana, Medical Research Council

34



SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
SATSWA INITIATIVE (Council)	105	Economic viability Administrative boundaries Physical considerations Natural Resources Population Distribution and density Area Commonality Affinity Economic Potential Economic parity within regions	<p>1. Economic viability is of prime importance in demarcating regions.</p> <p>2. The nine economic development regions are not appropriate, because they are too many, seven economic development regions would be appropriate.</p> <p>3. People ultimately should have a say in the determination of boundaries.</p> <p>4. The proposed regions are:</p> <p>Option 1: Nylstroom on the Northern border, Potchestroom on the East, Prieska on the South.</p> <p>Option 2: Nylstroom on the North boarder, New Castle on the East, Near Graff-Reinet on the South. Area includes all of Orange Free State). This area comprise 40% of South Africa. (Report says not official proposal for SATSWA).</p> <p>Option 3: Nylstroom on the Northern Boarder, New Castle of Eastern Boarder, and Prieska on the Southern Boarder (Orange Free State is included). This is considered to be the basis for negotiation if 6 regions are decided on.</p>	6-7	<p>1. The SATSWA Report is said "Whilst diverse interest groups have contributed to the SATSWA Initiative, the status report's contents do not represent the official viewpoint of any of the participants." (Italics ours). It raises questions about ownership of this report.</p> <p>2. The report indicates that a final decision was not taken, but participants endorses the principles of demarcation being through negotiations with local residents.</p> <p>3. This report is merely for contribution to debates and thus not a basis for decision-making, as it is not official SATSWA policy.</p>

SUB. DOC NAME	DOC NO.	CRUCIAL CRITERIA	IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS	# REG.	COMMENT
DR. RC FOX (Individual)	43	Low degree of variation within each region  High Degree of variation between regions  when too many criteria are used, problems arise	1. Regional identities-sense of belonging will present a major challenge given the NP and ANC proposals for one Border-Kai region (Development Region D), which includes Transkei, Ciskei, Eastern Cape & Border, etc.  2. Problems are likely to occur in selection of administrative centres in every region.  3. The Northern Transvaal, Northern Cape and Eastern Cape are poor regions because they lack major metropolitan areas, little capital and few economic resources. They would require government intervention. Hence the need for a strong central government.		1. A problem exists when we examine the Border-Kai, Grahamstown and those in Eastern Cape wishing to join Orange Free State we see that the region has an identity crisis.  2. The vie for administrative center has already begun, between East London and Grahamstown.
SOUTH AFRICAN GEOGRAPHICAL SOCIETY NEWSLETTER	43		Using ANC's regions and overlaying the language map, the following is observed:  - Western Cape: Afrikaans - Border-Kai: Xhosa - Natal: Zulu - Western Transvaal: Tswana - the rest have more than one language.		The implications of the ANC regions, which also applies to NP regions, is that a language policy would be needed for each region. In other words, which language will be accepted not to be taught because there are fewer people speaking the language?



Olive Shisana, Medical Research Council