

Mr D Mcleish 1 Komatie Rd Emmerentia Ext 1 JHB

9/3/92

Thank you for your letter dated 15/2/92.

We all have indeed placed our trust in the good guidance of our Lord to make this CODESA process succeed.

We can assure you that there is total commitment from all to making it work, as we are sure that with the support of people like yourselves we must definitely succeed.

Yours Faithfully

Murphy Morobe

(Head: CODESA Administration)

M.A. McLOUGI ILIN

Attorney, Notary & Conveyencer

Michael Arthur McLoughlin

Our Ref:

Your Ref:

M A McLOUGHLIN/W11 MAM-M66

15 Seymour Ave Parktown 2193 Johannesburg Telephone: (011) 726-8152/3 Fax: (011) 726-2923

Parkview 2122

Docex: DX66 Johanneaburg

30 March 1992

The Chairman Group 3 (Constitutional Affairs) CODESA TELEFAX -

Dear Sir,

re : CONSTITUTION AND BILL OF RIGHTS

Members of the public were requested and invited to make representations to CODESA over the deliberations for a new constitution and bill of rights. In accordance with the said invitation and in an effort to make a possible contribution to the debate over a truly democratic dispensation whereby the new constitution will truly be of the people, for the people and by the people and, in terms of which, the rulers are truly the servants of the people and not the reverse, I have the following points to make which I feel need to be addressed, namely:

1. CONTROL OF THE ARMED FORCES

has been suggested, that elements within either the SADF or the police are, with or without the connivance of their superiors, actively attempting to destabilize the negotiating process towards a just dispensation for all. Alternatively, that different factions amongst the blacks are jockeying for position and that a "third force" is assisting one or other element in this regard. These are not idle allegations and one has only to look at recent press reports with regard to TV producer, John Drury, of the BBC's "Assignment" and, the continued local perception of programme such a third force, to realise that certain people are definitely to trying destabilize the democratic, negotiating process. Whoever is responsible, and it could, into alia, be the elements in the security forces referred to, power needs to be controlled in a new South Africa. No Constitution, or sill of Rights, whether justiciable or not, will be of any force or effect, if the Armed Forces are controlled, effectively, by one man or, a small clique of Generals. shudders when a whole band of ex-Generals, publicly advocated a No vote to the deliberations at Groucho As Marx once said "Military intelligence is a contradiction in terms!"

I suggest that one way of insuring that a new government/....

PAGE 2

government is not overthrown by the military, would be to decentralise security on a regional basis, so that military council can take over the government by way a Coup d'etat unless such regional military power of has the support of the generals from all the other decentralised regions. This may lead to a more expensive military establishment but, will be well worth the cost if democracy is to be ensured. I have, to date, not heard any of the leaders of the various political parties at CODESA comment on control of the military in a new South Africa and, as Africa has a poor record of democracy and a good record for military takeovers, whatever constitution is in place, I feel this important issue needs to be addressed publicly as well as being debated at CODESA. After all, if the Armed Forces are to be the guardians of the constitution and the bill of rights who, in turn, is to control the Armed Forces? They should be subject to more stringent checks and balances than Parliament, to avoid any abuse of power.

2. "THE NATIONAL INTEREST"

This concept, which is used by governments world wide, including the great democracies, to cover up cover up embarrassing actions and misdemeanors on their part, to be subject to scrutiny within a true democracy. Accordingly, will provision be made in the constitution or the Bill of Rights, for all information under the government's control, to be subject to scrutiny by the courts, (in camera, if necessary), to ensure that "the national interest" is not subject to the perverted, subjective whim of the state or its I believe that it is necessary, that all officials: state information and documents be freely accessible to the people, unless the government or its officials, themselves, apply to a constitutional court for such information or documents to be held secret, in the national interest. The inconvenience, to the government and its officials, of having to take positive action, will be far less than the damage caused to democracy if "the national interest" is to be left to the discretion of some politician, who may have something to hide. The US Freedom of Information Act, is a precedent, which should be looked at by CODESA, as a starting point and could be adapted, in its scope to suit local conditions.

3 ADVISORY COMMITTEES

I understand that in Germany the Ministers of State/....

State are advised by Committees in their respective areas of responsibility. These committees are made up of the best brains in the country, whatever the political persuasion of the individuals on committees are. The Minister may reject the committees' advice on any particular matter, but does not do so lightly. This is just another check against the taking of arbitrary decisions by politicians.

4 THE AUDITOR GENERAL

Although the Auditor-General is only responsible to Parliament, his position would be greatly strenghtened and, as a civil servant, he would be free from political manipulation, if his report to parliament was given jointly, with a report from an independent team of auditors, made up of respected firms within the auditing profession. This would cost extra but, would be more than adequately compensated, by the provention of corruption within the Government and Civil Service. I was recently shocked to read that in one of the provinces, less than 50% of the municipalities had balanced their books for the year or submitted their balance sheets to the Province. Some, apparently, were more than one year in arrears. This should not be allowed. If a Municipality is more that 6 months in arrear, a team of auditors, should immediately be sent in and the management committee suspended until the results of the audit is known.

5 RESERVE BANK

As in the case of the Bundesbank, the Reserve Bank should be completely free from political manipulation and the constitution should incorporate provisions similar to those in the German Constitution on this point.

DEFICIT FINANCING AND MONEY SUPPLY

I believe that deficit financing is wrong in principle and, if resorted to, should be limited to a maximum of of 3% of the gross domestic product and then only for short periods when an economy is in a recession/depression. An Act similar to the Gramm Act in the United States, forcing the government to reduce the deficit, if this is not done voluntarily, should be included in the Legislative armoury. This type of Legislation would not be necessary, if deficit financing is covered by the Constitution/Bill of Rights. Similarly, money supply should be controlled, and put within limits, insofar as increases are concerned. In this regard, the money supply should be covered by the Gold and Foreign Exchange Reserves to a certain percentage, say, 25%. This discipline is necessary, to avoid inflation, which impoverishes the Nation, and is a fraud on its citizens.

EXCHANGE CONTROL

This is an infiguitous control prought in by the Finance Minister of the Nazi Regime in Germany in 1930's. It is undemocratic, and should be outlawed in a new Constitution. All arguments for retention of exchange should be seen for what they are - spurious! A citizen who has paid his taxes, should be allowed to invest his money, wherever he wishes, particularly, as the world is now becoming a global village. country's currency will initially depreciate but, if exchange control is banned in the Constitution, this would be short term and investment will pour into the country, when investors realise that their investments are safe, and may be repatriated, without any intervention by whatever government of the day is in Similarly, citizens of the country will not be inclined to remove their capital as they will be secure, in the knowledge that their money can be moved, without let or hindrance from the government. If we call ourselves a free enterprise economy, we must not only pay lip service to the concept, but show this clearly by protecting it within the Constitution/Bill of Rights.

6. THE CALLING OF REFERENDA

In any truly democratic country, where the will of the people is to be given expression to, the right to call referenda on various issues, local, regional or national, should be encouraged, provided, of course, any person or group, wishing to call a referendum, has sufficient support for the issue to be aired. None of the delegates at CODESA who truly believe in a full democracy, should object to the constitution and bill of rights encompassing this matter.

7. POSTULATER OF JUSTICE : AND RETRO ACTIVE LEGISLATION

Enclosed is an extract from Wille's Principles of South Africa Law, 8th edition, pages 14, 15 and 16 which clearly set out the qualities required by the rule of positive Law namely, that, all Laws should be:-

- (1) Reasonable
- (2) Impartial
- (3) Certain
- (4) Comprehensive
- (5) Publicly promulgated
- (6) In accordance with public opinion.

I believe these qualities should be the cornerstone of all legislation in the new South Africa and, in this regard, I particularly refer to the last two sentences of the paragraph headed "Promulgated", to wit, legislation which is made to apply to actions that were committed in the past, and which changes the law, is called retrospective or ex post facto legislation. It is, obviously, unfair and is almost universally condemned. Is the question of retroscrive legislation on the agenda at CODESA? If not, I suggest that it should be placed thereon and, hopefully, condemned, in line with a democratic constitution.

8. APPOINTMENT OF JUDGES

If the powers of the Executive, Legislative and the Judicial arms of Government are, hopefully, to have equal powers of veto against each other in a new constitution then the appointment of Judges is an important issue and should not be controlled, directly or indirectly, by the Executive and/or Legislative arms alone. At best, I believe that these other arms of government should be given a maximum of a 50% right to the appointment of judges and that the balance should rest with the legal profession as a whole or, possibly, it and other relevant constituencies. In the event of an impasse, the Appellate Division or the Constitutional Court should act as the final arbiter.

CARTELS AND MONOPOLIES

The proliferation of cartels and monopolies in the South African economy exist despite Legislation under Monopolies Act and the existence of the Competitions Board. These seem to be ineffective, essentially, against the continuance of these cartels and monopolies. They are essentially undemocratic, if not immoral, and have been allowed to develop by virtue of the historical, undemocratic nature of our society. argument that they need to exist to fund multi-million or multi-billion Rand contracts is not acceptable. If a need for such financial muscle is necessary, this can always be achieved by various big companies forming consortia to part-take in joint ventures, The cartels and monopolies should be broken up in an ordered manner over a period of, say, 10 years. Only in this way will free enterprise be seen to be working, in practice, as well as theory.

CONTROL BOARDS

These bloated bureaucracies have outlived any usefulness they may have had, which is doubtful. They should be disbanded as soon as possible to allow the market to regulate itself. They tend to act as another cost burden to the economy which is unnecessary. If the farmer wants, or needs a marketing arm and a mechanism for smoothing out fluctuations in price, he can formulate his own strategies through co-operatives and the like.

POLICE

A democratic society needs a dedicated, professional and impartial Police Force which is seen to be such by all its people, in order to be respected. To achieve this, high standards and high pay are necessary.

HEALTH, EDUCATION AND HOUSING

In principle, the Government should act merely as a facilitator and catalyst setting down the principles and standards to be met and applied in each of these It is not, or should not be, the function of Government to act as the bonus paterfamilias providing all the peoples need. The people need to be taught how to catch fish not merely be given thefish. one is merely given hand outs one never learns and a Nation should have enough pride in itself for each of its citizens to learn to stand on his or her own two Provided this principle is accepted, it may be necessary for the State to assist , in providing the initial impetus, for instance, by bearing the bulk of primary education. Parents should, however, be asked to contribute a reasonable amount out of their own pockets in accordance with their means. This would not relieve a citizen of his own self-respect and pride as well as his obligation for his own family. It builds character and can only improve the work and responsibility ethic in a Nation. To say that it is responsibility to provide housing, States education, health and social welfare for its people is nonsense. The state should merely stand as a back stop to help the really needy and those who cannot, under any circumstances, help themselves. As stated previously, a conditional period may be necessary before this principle of self-help can be fully implemented, because of historical imbalances, but the principle should still be accepted and implemented, in a phased manner.

I have the following additional comments to make on various portfolios.

HOUSING

This should be financed over a number of generations, and bonds granted at the finest rate of interest possible, excluding subsidies, and over a period of 50 years, through banks, building societies and insurance companies. This finance should be seen as some form of retribution to our fellow citizens, who have been legally deprived from entering the housing market for so many years. By the same token, these communities must bear their responsibility for payment of bond instalments, lights, water and other services.

EDUCATION

In a free enterprise society, the State should merely set the minimum standards and principles to meet overall objectives and leave it, thereafter, to private enterprise to provide, in whatevor form, the needs of various communities. This is well illustrated in Nobel Prize winning economist MILTON FRIEDMAN'S BOOK "FREE TO CHOOSE" where he suggests that a voucher system be implemented in American schools, in terms of which, each student is subsidised by the State up to a certain amount, depending on the level of education being These vouchers can be cashed in at any institution, which may charge, either more or less, than the amount of the voucher. The institution then obtains payment for the amount of the vouchers received by it from the State and the parent then pays the difference, if any. The better institutions will then sell education at a premium, and in accordance with their results and facilities, will receive more vouchers than a school which does not meet the standards required by the community. competitive base for an institution, can only be of benefit to the community as a whole. It will also give freedom of choice for different types of education as may be required by parents for their children. In a democracy, it should not be the prerogative of the State, to tell parents how their children should be educated other than by way of setting minimum than by way of setting minimum

AGRICULTURE

It must be accepted that a redistribution of land will have to occur, to correct the imbalances created by an apartheid society. The 1913 and 1936 Land Acts protected the interests of the white man alone and, obviously, these imbalances must be redressed. Some expropriation will be necessary, but farmers should be adequately compensated by the State. Such compensation should, however, take into account the tax breaks received by the farmer in terms of Schedule 1 of the Income Tax Act in setting the level of compensation to be paid. Thereafter, the farmer should be treated as any other businessmen whose success or failure depends on his own ability and ingenuity. Farmers have in the past been too protected by the State, at the expense of the other citizens of the country who do not receive the same tax breaks. As a result, farmore have been allowed to build up substantial capital assets which other citizens have not and, although, their income may be relatively small, the capital value of their assets have increased substantially through the years. Any farmer who has not set aside sufficient reserves from good years, to cover bad years, has only himself to blame in most cases, for the dire straits in which he may now find himself. The market place must be the final arbiter of who should be a farmer or who should

HEALTH

The emphasis here should be on preventative medicine and not curative medicine. The State should provide basic clinics throughout the country, together with the necessary education on preventative medicine, to change the whole culture of health care. Thought should be given to creating incentives for people to encourage them to lead healthy life styles. A National Health Scheme for curative medicine should be based on no claim bonuses being granted to those who do not utilise or abuse the system.

REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT

These tiers of Government should be obliged to run their levels of Government, incorporating the same principles, as outlined above for National Government within the framework of the Constitution/Bill of Rights.

LANGUAGE

I believe that the best way of ensuring National identity, cohesion and communication within a National through a National language. The only language which would seem to fit the bill, from a practical point of view, would be English. If all the people speak one language, they can identify with each other more easily. The United States of America is an example of peoples of diverse Nations coming together and being unified through the use of one language. This in no way means, that a particular ethnic or cultural group should not be proud of, and continue to speak, their own language, within their own communities, but it is impractical to expect the Nation as a whole to speak a number of languages.

Naturally, I would expect that in a democracy, a justiciable Bill of Rights would be a sine qua non, together with the division of powers as outlined above in national, regional and local politics. I would be pleased to hear that the above matters, if not specifically on the agenda for the debate within working group three, should be placed thereon. If, however, you do not feel that the discussion, would you kindly let me know. I would be happy to appear before your working group, if required, to expand on the themes outlined above.

I truly believe that a Constitution and a justiciable Bill of Rights, incorporating all the checks and balances set out above, would be something of which all South Africans

could be truly proud and, would insure that the politicians and servants of the state can truly say "I serve". Regrettably, human nature still seems to be guided by greed, fear and power, and as long as this is the case, the checks and balances, set out herein, will be necessary to insure evenhandedness down to the weakest member of society. If such a constitution can be agreed to at CODESA, I, for one, would be happy to accept my new destiny with pride and to serve under any President, no matter what to be held as soon as possible.

I do not think that it would be in the interest of the people, as a whole, for a transitional government to be installed before agreement, in principle, has been reached, on what kind of democracy every one is talking about.

I shall be glad if you would confirm that my letter will be brought to the attention of all the interested parties within working group three and look forward to hearing from you.

Yours faithfully

M A MOLOUGHLIN

encl:

The world in general, 11 and South Africa in particular, 12 are greatly indebted law of nature, chiefly through the conception thereof formed and applied by G Grotius, with profound common sense and extraordinary ability deduced fundamental rules of that law, and he applied them in composing his epoch-on work, De Jure Belli ec Pacis, thereby founding the system of public international which has influenced all nations, he also applied the rules in his Inleiding Hollandsche Rechtsgeleertheid which is the basis of our common law.

Today, as stated before, the ideal of natural law is perpetuated in South Afri 'the principles of natural justice', which find their chief application in the fie administrative law. 13 These principles, which are usually expressed in the form of Latin maxims, audi alteram partem ('hear the other side') and nemo judex in par causa ('no one may judge in his own cause'). 14 have been applied by the cours ensure that justice is done by inferior courts or by non-judicial tribunals, and licensing boards, church synods and club committees. 15 The principles dictates persons who are affected by administrative action should be afforded a fair unbiased hearing before the decision to act is taken. 16

Postulates of justice

Perhaps the main function of natural law in modern times, however, is to serve an ideal by which positive law should be tested. 17 On this basis it is possible identify certain qualities that a rule of positive law should possess or display if it avoid being labelled an unjust or bad law. These qualities, or postulates of justice are that the law should be (1) reasonable; (2) impartial; (3) certain; (4) comprehens (5) publicly promulgated; and (6) in accordance with public opinion.

(1) Reasonable

All the authorities are agreed that the first requisite of a rule of law is that it sho have a quality which is variously termed 'just', or 'reasonable', or 'equitable'. 19 Th terms are somewhat indefinite, but their meaning can be made plain. The wor denote some quality which enables the law to achieve its object (namely, that preserving the peace and well-being of the community) by regulating the conduct the inhabitants so that they will cause no disturbances but will eather perform acid beneficial to other persons; in simpler words, by ensuring that persons should harm but benefit others.

11 Sir Henry Maine Ancient Law (1917) 99; C.K. Allen Law in the Making 7 ed (1964) 383. 12 Wessels History 293.

law should be impartial; they should be the same for all persons; 30 by is in fact one of the main elements of reasonableness.21 There is There that all the inhabitants of this country enjoy equal civil rights under the The rules of law should consequently provide equality of treatment for irrespective of wealth, colour, race, religion or any other characteristic.23

terms or provisions of a law should be certain and definite; a rule of law." it should indicate with reasonable occurainty to the persons bound by it, th and is enjoined or prohibited so that they may regulate their conduct mingly.24 There should be no obscurity, ambiguity, or vagueness in the wording rale. If an enactment is obscurely or amb guously worded, the average person

Lamprehensive

The of law should deal fully with the particular topic it purports to regulate, effective provision for all necessary and also probable contingencies and transmissioners, and also for the increasing complexities of modern organized

5) Promulgated

readody can possibly be influenced in his actions or conduct by a rule of whose way existence he is unaware; it follows that if a rule of law is to achieve its object of transacing human conduct, all the persons affected by the rule should have notice of 2. Consequently rules of law must be known to the public, or 'promulgated', before Can come into force. 26 Legislation which is made to apply to actions that were contained in the past, and which changes the law, is called retrospective or ex post begislation. It is obviously unfair, and is almost universally condemned.

accordance with public opinion

should have the approval of the general public. If a law is so disliked by a portion of the community that they break it habitually, it undermines report for law in general. Notable examples of the wholesale breach of laws have marred in the case of contraventions on a large scale of statutes prohibiting people drinking intoxicating liquor; or from gambling; or from participating in certain

Anner v Johnson [1896] 2 QB 91; Minister of Posts & Telegraphs v Rasoel 1934 AD 167 at 173, 180; R v Carelie BG CPD 242 at 248, 252

There v Register of Deads 1905 TS 130 at 135. See also Zgili v McLead (1904) 21 SC 150 at 152. Siegas v The The (1895) 12 SC 256 at 271; R v Gamen 1911 AIV 269 at 270; Searles v Thelee 1935 TPD 290 at 291; De Beers

is a nonnious fact, of course, that this fundamental principle of equality is not observed in the numerous is a second of course, that this fundamental principle of equality is not observed in the numerous African statutes (now, happaly, in the process of being repealed) that discriminate on the grounds of race. R p Jopp 1949 (4) SA 11 (N) at 13. See, generally, Baxter Administrative Law 529ff. Cf Pani Assessed Co v Union Government 1934 AD 560 at 563

Voct 1.3.9, Ismail Amad v Pietersburg Municipality 1904 TS 321 at 323; R v Glack 1923 AD 149 at 151. Sec.

See, generally, Lawrence Baxter Administrative Low (1984) 536ff.

¹⁵ See e.g. Builders Lal v Union Government (Minister of Finance) 1528 AD 46 at 58; Barlin v Licensing Conf. the Cope 1924 AD 472 at 480; Martin v Durbon Turf Club 1942 AD 112 at 126; Jockey Club of South Africa Feldman 1942 AD 340; Debuer : South African Railways & Harbaurs 1920 AD 583; South African Defence and Find v Minister of Justice 1967 (1s SA 263 (As at 276; Johannesburg Local Road Transportation Board v David Man Transport (Pry) Led 1976 (1) SA 887 (A) at 906; Barnard v Jockey Club of South Africa 1984 (2) SA 35 (W) Administrator, Transpool v Trank 1989 (4) SA 731 (A).

Barrer Administrative Law 536.

¹⁷ Cf Paton Jurisprudence 112. 18 Hablo & Kalm Legal System 31ff.

General 2 1. Wass 1 2 6 Lights 9. Was 1 and 6 and 20

West 1.3.5; Salmond Jurisprudence 62; Habito & Kahn Legal System 32, 34.

games or activities on Sundays; or from entering urban areas without sp permission.

Equity

Equity is a collection of principles based, like natural law, on conceptions of it justice; but, differing from it, not on the principles supposed to be instincting known to all mankind, but on those formulated by a select few, the most experien and enlightened jurists of their day. In many states in past ages these jurists he realized that their national law was far from perfect; that to apply it strictly would many cases work injustice. There grew up, in consequence, in these countries practice of modifying the rigour of national law by the application of princip intended to give a fair, or what is called an 'equitable' result; and this collection principles was termed aequitas, or equity.28 Such collections became import portions of the law in Rome and in England; these systems will, owing to the influence on our law, be described briefly before treating of the position of Equity

Equity in Roman Law

In Roman law, aequitas consisted of a body of principles conceived and develop by the practors in order to counteract the harshness and subtlety of the existing law In omnibus quidemi maxime tamen in jure acquitas spectanda sit;30 in all matters especially in law, the principles of equity must be borne in mind. The chief princip of aequitas were the following:

(1) No one should be enriched to the prejudice or injury of another: Jure name aequum est neminem cum alterius detrimento et injuris fieri locupledorem.31

(2) No one can improve his position by means of his own wrong: Nemo exa delicto meliorem suam conditionem facere potest. 22 No one can, by reason of subtlety of the civil law, and contrary to the dietates of natural justice, derive a advantage from his own bad faith: Ne cui dolus suus per occasionem juris de contra naturalem aequitatem prosit.33 A variation of these maxims is that no one deny his own act: nemo contra suum factum venire.34

(3) The nature of a contract is determined by the intention of the parties and not their designation or description of it: Plus valet quod agitur quam quod simul concipitur.35 Similarly, in the interpretation of wills the intention of the testator is first consideration: in testamentis plenius voluntates testantium interpretantur.

Equity in English Law

in England, from the thirteenth century onward, there developed under the Leg Chancellors, a body of rules which modified portions of the older law of England The principles which mided the Court of Chancery were those of conscient other than no

on', and 'goo guardianship reseen cases (He course of t ulty, became at common law tions of the co fusion of the ted by Engliwitas, 41

tity in South A quity, as a syste outh Africa, 42 constructed the sense of being this result follocommendable c assimilated in. no one shall b whole of our lav one person to re former has, wit! mment. 46 It shot plication. 47 The maxims to t faith or wrongs

stracts; represent

sons benefiting v

sons in property

mims have also b

Austin Intisprudence 576-7; Maine Ancient Law 32; Allen Law in the Making 6 ed (1958) 385.
D 1, 1, 7, 1; Allen 392-9.

³¹ D 50.17.206; 12.6.14.

³² D 50.17.134.1. 35 D 44.4.1.1.

⁵⁴ D 44.4.1.2.

³⁶ C 4.22.1; Gaius 3.1.37.

³⁶ D 50.17.12.

Halsbury (Hailsham Allen 393-6. Ibid 382.

Halebury (Hailsham Austin Jurisprudence 6 Weinerlein v Goch But

³A 580 (A) at 606. Estate Thomas v Ken Micht (1905) 19 EDC 2 wimene (Alineites of E.s.

Voet 1.3.5. Umhleht's case (supra) Grotius 3,30.1, 2; J G EXVIII below.

Norije v Poel NO 1966 On the doctrine of no Michan (1892) 9 5C 289; (4) SA 1 (A); Kessoon ort & NJJ Olivier S. AD 323 at 330. Burgers v Fraser 1907 T