The Chahperson of SADC

The Commission of Enquiry into the Conduct and Results of the Lesotho General Elections held in May 1998, hereby presents itâ\200\231s report signed at Johannesburg, on this the 9th day of September 1998.

i¬\202aw?â\200\235

J stice Pius Langa/

~

Chairperson, South Aï¬\201ica

Adv. Mojanjcu Gumbi

Member, South Africa

응

MI. Theo Nkone

Member, South Aï¬\201ica

Ms. Tshidi Mokgabudi

Member, South Africa

 $\label{eq:linear_condition} \mbox{Ai¬} \mbox{1}\mbox{202}\mbox{1}\mbox{2}\mbox{1}\mbox{1}\mbox{2}\mb$

Mr. Edwin Letsididi

Member, Botswana

Mrs Barulaganye Machaeha

Member, Botswana

Mrs Alicia Ramaribjana

MI. TobaiWa Mudede

Member, Botswana

Member, Zimbabwe

MWQLKL

Mr. Simon Muchemenye/

NKWHenry Machin'

Member, Zimbabwe

,. A/

Member, Zimbabwe

provisions of the Constitution and any other Law.

-

0

-

0

to delimit the boundaries of constituencies in accordance with the provisions of the Constitution and any other Law.

to supervise and control the registration of electors.

to compile a general register of electors and constituency registers of electors and to maintain and keep them up to date.

,

to promote knowledge and sound democratic electoral processes.

In term of Section 66D(1) of the Constitution, Parliament is obliged to provide funds to enable the Commission to perform its functions effectively. The [EC is accountable to Parliament; in practice, the Minister of Law and Constitutional Affairs provides the link with the-legislature and pilots any legislation that pertains to the IEC and its functions and powers.

2.3 Preparation for Elections

The [EC assumed ofi¬\201ce in September 1997 and therefore had eight months to prepare for the general $\tilde{}$ elections. The constitutional amendments that established the IEC were accompanied by amendments to the Electoral Law itself. Their effect was to create new tasks and responsibilities for the IEC, such as voter registration, delimitation of constituencies and voter education. The voting age was lowered from 21 to 18 years thus increasing the number of people who were eligible to vote. The number of constituencies was also increased from 65 to 80.

2.4W

Section 11(1) of the National Assembly Elections Order 1992 provides that a person who is a citizen of Lesotho who has attained the age of 18 years shall, unless disqualii¬\201ed under section 57 of the Constitution to register as such, apply to be registered as an elector for the constituency where he:

a polling ofin\201cer, whose responsibilities included checking for the indelible ink markings to ensure that there were no duplications in voting;

a polling of "\201cer whose duty was to mark voters with ink;

a security ofi¬\201cer to keep peace and order;

an ofin-201cial witness who was a person appointed to identify those voters who did not possess the ofin-201cial identiin-201cation documents. These persons were usually chiefs of the respective areas.

0

0

0

2.6

or in $a\200\2310$ $a\200\2301$. $a\200\230$,

, 1A4â\200\234. â\200\230

â\200\2301

0

1â\200\230

The ofi¬\201cial close of polling was at 17h00 except that those voters who were already in the precinct were allowed to vote. We were informed that in some remote areas, polling was extended until the following day. In each polling station, the counting of ballots commenced immediately after the close of the polling. The usual formalities applied, namely, the inspection and the sealing of the ballot boxes at the beginning of the poll and their placement in full view of everybody during the voting; the opening of the ballot boxes and the sorting and counting of the ballot papers. The votes cast for each candidate at each polling station were to be recorded on form A45, which is completed by the presiding ofin\201cer. There is provision on the form for the signature of the presiding ofi¬\201cer and party agents. The procedure was that the respective votes cast for each candidate as reï¬\202ected on the form should be immediately announced as local results by the presiding oin\201icer and then transmitted to the returning of $\[\neg\]$ 201cer at constituency level. The returning of $\[\neg\]$ 201cer adds up the total number of votes cast for each candidate, completes form A47 which $rein\202ects$ the total votes for each candidate and announces the constituency-level results. The constituency results are then transmitted to the IEC headquarters from where the consolidated results would be announced.

2.7W

The National Assembly Order requires that once the votes are counted the

```
.. vwvr,
. 4....
Annexure A
Iii 1P
Abbreviation
M.F.P.
S.D.U.
B.N.P.
B.C.P.
L.C.D
N.P.P.
P.F.D.
K.B.P.
LLP/UDP
L.E.P.
C.D.P.
N.I.P.
Full-Name
Registration Date
DD/MM/YY
Marematlou Freedom Party
Sefate Democratic Union
Basotho National Party
Lekhotla La Mahatammoho
(Basutoland Congress Party)
Lesotho Congress for Democracy
National Progressive Party
Khoeetsa ea Sechaba
Kopanang Basotho Party
Lesotho Labour Party/United Democratic
Party Alliance
Lesotho Educational Party
Christian Democratic Party
National Independent Party
n
nn ni
09/01/98
13/01/98
15/01/98
21/01/98
02/02/98
06/02/98
19/02/98
06/03/98
01/04/98
06/04/98
06/04/98
06/04/98
Full-Name
Mokhantso Matanki
Moeletsi Samuel Mohlominyane
```

Linakane Tsekeli N.
861650 Flora Selloane
Mara Lepekola
Thelingoane Thabo Nyamane
Sethabathaba Tefelo V.
Ntoi John Molaka
Lethoba Solomon M.
Mokotla Makhiba C.
Makhetha Bernard Chere

d
i¬\202
i¬\201
g
i¬\202
J
l
B
i¬\202

i¬\202
?

B
P
?
E
I
p
i
h

E W

Α

D C L

р

u С

р 0 С

Ρ

E 1

р 0

m

p u

p e R

--â\200\234

A A A

F O T I D U A

M R O F 5 4 A

```
S
```

С

]
R
E
B
M
U
N
[
Y
â\200\230
C
H
E
U
W
T
S
N
O

3 5

1 0 3

8 6 9

, L â\200\230 1 9 5

6 1

1

Α

_ L

9 7

8 1 1

```
5
3
3
ï¬\201
ï¬\202
Â¥
1
3
4
5
1
1
7
3
6
6
1
5
3
7
2
7
3
0
4
7
2
ï¬\202
4
4
2
5
â\200\230
1
7
1
â\200\224
1
â\200\224
```

```
â\200\224
3
5
4
1
6
6
  1
â\200\230
â\200\231
â\200\235
0
1
1
```

```
( E N A H C A H C E M
}
m
m
1
0
1
2
5
1
1
5
5
-
    0
)
4
1
0
```

r

3

4 3 < \(\frac{2}{2} \) \(\frac{2}{2} \) \(\frac{4}{3} \) \(\frac{2}{2} \) \(\frac{2}{2} \) \(\frac{4}{3} \) \(\frac{2}{2} \) \(\fr

```
.
â\200\224
```

3 1

3 4

6 1

8 9

4 3

4 1 â\200\234

â\200\230

A

. .

Α

W

5 4

â\200\224 â\200\224

â\200\224

7

5

9 1

2 4

2 5

8

7

1

2

4

6 1

3 2

5 1

4 9

2

5 4

7

1

1

0 4

1 2

4

L

6

1 6

2 2

7 6

1 2

1 6

3 9

6 3

7 4

7 5

1 5

1

4

4 6

7 3

V

e 1

% 1 .

-5 7

m

. * 7 9 2

-1

4

5

> .31321 nâ\200\230

```
1
```

1

1

â\200\235 4

m 1

1 L W) p) m R

5 u

8 9

8 m s 1 1 4 (m g r m

7

Α

1

A O S , 1 u P - A B A H

```
5
```

-7 . 9 7 .

r â\200\230 2 2 6 7 Â¥

2 5

```
5 1
8 1
8 5
1
1 1
3
 5
 )
) 1
) 1
1 M
2
1
( o
u
o
s
o
n
o
m
~

>

)

8

(

)

C

S

J

A

i ¬ \ 202

j

g ¬ \ 202

g e

j

H
5
1
m
3
4
m
m
1
3
 1
1
1
```

```
5
M
£
K
A
L
1
A
 ( O S T A M - A B I L A
u
a
ï¬\202
u
q
 1 (
 m
o
s
o
H
P
M
  )
 °
1
1
!
E
O
E
 5
1
1
1
0
1
1
5
 5
5
1
0
.
1
```

```
M
E
F
9
9
1
2
9
9
1
5
3
E
0
E
U
Ρ
Α
M
s
1
1
S
u
m
S
u
n
s
0
u
)
m
m
6
0
3
m
m
L
1
ï¬\202
ï¬\201
ï¬\201
â\200\230
k
â\200\230
i
â\200\230
ï¬\202
)
а
u
n
m
m
m
0
K
```

) 1 3 (A E R A W 0 n m е u m m a L 5 1 (E N L I E H K Q 4 Z Q B N I E I H I Y E T V I V E 1) m m m u m (е n m m G N E T O t

```
-
I
1
â\200\230
I
L
0
5
0
1
1
1
1
1
0
1
m
m
O
0
5
U
A
K
E
Ρ
A
E
B
-
A
L
В
?
6
â\200\2241
D
E
W
m
u
m
u
m
)
0
4
1
)
3
4
£
E
```

H T O

2 4 1 E M E

О Н

i832:

s

u С

u

m

-0

) 8 : (A I S

A E R E

В

s r

а

5 : 1

а m

u

```
1
1
7
613
SB
â\200\23138
?
\frac{-}{4}
7
а
1
1
3
(
m
â\200\230
â\200\230
1
0
3
1
5
8
2
6
1
3
2
3
5
1
2
2
1
3
1
m
2
```

```
9
4
```

)

(

5

»

â\200\224

â\200\224

â\200\224

â\200\224 â\200\224

â\200\224

â\200\224

â\200\224

â\200\224

_ â\200\224

»

â\200\230

7

1 1

6

7 3

8

1 5

5

```
]
6
2
[
;
1
:
)
4
1
(
4
1
â\200\230
)
9
2
1
)
1
1
2
(
u
â\200\224
â\200\224
)
а
_
_
_
)
7
2
â\200\224
â\200\224
.
«
»
```

7

2 3

â\200\224

â\200\224 â\200\224

â\200\224

2

(

5 5

I

Ι

Ι

(

i 8

2

-

-

Α

â\200\230

<

. â\200\234

--

representatives of the political parties. Considering that it was the <code>i¬\201rst</code> time in the history of Lesotho that elections were run by an IEC, and that the time to prepare for elections was not adequate, it is clear that the IEC had to contend with considerable problems in establishing itself. There exists at present, a worrying lack of trust between the opposition parties and the Chairperson of the IEC.

6.5mm:

The regression analysis puts forward as problems what turn out to be uncontroversial facts: notably that in a $200\234$ past the post $200\235$ electoral system,

a party may get more votes that its competitors in a constituency, and thus win it, without achieving more than 50% of the vote in that constituency; and that in areas where the vote for a winning party is highest, the combined vote of its competitors will be lowest.

6.6 Proemement Qf Ballot Papers

The Commission was not presented with any evidence that extra ballot papers were procured in South Africa. This allegation was not pursued and nothing further needs be further said about it.

6.7 Trmspoi¬\202ing Qf Electoral Material

No legal requirement that members of the security forces who acted as escorts be seconded to the IEC. There was, therefore, no irregularity found in this regard;

6.8 Bemoyal of First Diregtor of Elections

The Commission was not in a position to institute an enquiry in respect of this matter. It is apparently being dealt with elsewhere.

6.9 Kolonyama and Mohokare Incidents

These incidents are still under investigation by the police. The Commission did not in 201nd any conclusive evidence of irregularities, falling within its terms

The IEC response was that the matter was an administrative issue which had no relationship whatsoever to the results of the election. They reported that the matter was currently under investigation and that political parties will be kept informed.

The Commission was not in a position to take this matter further. It was not clear that the issue had a direct bearing on the conduct of the elections.

5.9Elcctiim_rnate_rial_aband_oned_by_the_LEQ

The opposition parties alleged that they found documents relating to the elections abandoned on the banks of the Mohokare river in Qachaâ\200\231s Nek. Some of the documents appeared to have been burnt. The police were called and they recovered the documents together with some fragments of burnt material. The parties wanted to know the outcome of the IEC investigation into this matter. The Commission was given copies of the documents which were given to the police. They appeared to be short lists of names. An _ examination of the documents could not reveal their origin or signiī¬\201cance.

The IEC coni¬\201rmed that it was aware of this matter. The police investigation into the matter was proceeding. The IEC stated that it had instructed all its ofi¬\201cers to either shred or burn unwanted documents. It may be that some ofi¬\201cers did not follow this instruction to the letter.

A further related incident was that original completed registration forms were found on the banks of the Kolonyama river.

The IEC again coni¬\201rmed that it was aware of this incident. An IEC vehicle which was transporting registration documents had been hijacked. The police are continuing with the investigation of this matter. The IEC had recovered approximately 200 original voter registration application forms. The applicantsâ\200\231 details were captured, which means that they were not disenfranchised. The balance of the forms were duplicates. The IEC vehicle has still not been recovered.

5.10Th1

r1 inhi

nhIE n

h

vrnmn.

The opposition parties complained that the IECâ $\200\231s$ relationship with Government was too close for it to maintain its expected impartiality and It was said that this

independence from ini¬\202uence by the Government. impacted on their impartiality and independence. The IEC denied the

birth dates.

The IEC stated that political parties were kept fully informed of every aspect of the registration process and were invited to send their representatives to each registration centre to monitor the registration process. Besides the IEC ofi¬\201cials and the representatives of the political parties an $a\200\2340fi$ ¬\201cial W itnessa\200\235

was present at each registration centre. The function of the ofi¬\201cial witness was to identify applicants for registration who did not have documentary evidence of identity such as passports etc. The ofi¬\201cial witnesses were also supposed to satisfy themselves as to the age quali \ddot ¬\201cation of the applicant. In any event, according to the IEC, most of the population of Lesotho do not know their dates of birth.

The evidence at our disposal suggests that the voting register indeed

displays an unusual distribution of the day-and-month of birth.

It would take a lengthy investigation going beyond the documents, to establish the causes of this phenomenon. The phenomenon is not of material interest until it can be shown that it somehow enabled the casting of duplicate or $a\geq 0$ 0 230 ghost $200\geq 3$ 1 votes.

5.3 Persons not entitled IQ yote

The opposition parties alleged that persons who were not entitled to vote because they did not have proper identiï¬\201cation were allowed to vote contrary to section 75(1A) of the National Assembly Election Order. If this was a procedure followed generally, we are unable to state that it would have inï¬\202uenced the elections one way or another. We make no comment on its legality, but'there is nothing to indicate that it was not a bona i^{-} \201de error if To support their concern the parties had on 16 May 1998 such it was.

addressed a letter to the IEC about one voter who hadâ $200\230$ been awarded three This was according to the opposition, contrary to the law voter cards

because in terms of the law such person had to produce both a voter registration card and an identii \neg 201cation in the form of a passport or driverâ\200\231s license.

The IEC occupies a crucial position in a democracy and it is essential that it should enjoy the coni¬\201dence of the community, regardless of political persuasion. This coni¬\201dence appears to have been, rightly or wrongly, eroded. It is important that measures be taken to restore it. We would hope that the

14.

15.

were used to store ballot papers.

It was also observed that the $IEC\hat{a}\200\231s$ organisational problems and record keeping left a lot to be desired.

Among the 66 constituencies that were recounted it was observed that a number of constituencies had sealed white plastic bags and envelopes contained therein, thus conforming to the expected requirements.

The result of the recount is set out in Annexure C.

The Commission did not have sufi¬201cient time and resources to audit the marked votersâ200231 lists.

It is further noted that the marked lists were not found in sealed envelopes as was the case with some of the electoral material. This

. further put a question mark on the integrity of such marked votersâ\200\231 lists.

5.2 Manipulation of Birth Dates

The opposition parties employed the services of a <code>inl201rm</code> of forensic investigators, called OF&A (from South Africa) to do a detailed analysis of the entire votersallists. OF&A received the entire voters list but found the data for constituencies 11-15 could not be read on the disk.

They did a detailed analysis of the $\hat{a}\200\230$ day of birth $\hat{a}\200\231$ for all the constituen cies

Their i-201ndings a^200^230 show a^200^231 that there are a very high number of voters with the 01

January as their date of birth.

Their data and analysis showed that :

For all constituencies, on average, a far higher number of voters were born during the $i\neg\201rst$ half of the month than on the days after the 15th of the month. Thus their interpretation that the dates of birth were manipulated in one way or the other.

Only the month of September displays a constant variance from the average. Thus their opinion that this may be as a result of seasonal $inin\sqrt{202}$ uences.

The number of people who do not know the day and month of birth are too high (12.8%) compared to the national average (3.7% per 1996 national census).

Throughout the voters roll an unexplainable higher (on average double) number of voters were born on specii¬\201c days. Besides New-Yearâ\200\231s and

- 3.2.1 The Commission undertook a recount of the votes cast on August 29, 30 and 31 and on 1 September 1998. Access to the ballot papers and other electoral materials was facilitated in part by an amendment to the electoral law which was passed by the Lesotho Parliament while the Commission was conducting the enquiry. The counting exercise was preceded by a Visit to the IEC ofin\201ces by the Commission on 28 August to inspect the storage of the electoral materials that would be the subject of the audit.
- 3.2.2 On the <code>i¬\201rst</code> two days, 200 students from two South African universities, the University of the North (Qwaqwa) and the University of the Orange Free State, assisted the Commission in this process. By agreement among all the parties concerned, 100 members of the South African National Defence Force (SANDF) were then utilised to help on the last two days.

' 4. ALLEGATIONS OF IRREGULARITIES

On the i-201rst day of the plenary sittings, the representatives of the objecting opposition parties presented the enquiry with ten points which formed the basis of their allegations that the elections had been rigged. These are set out hereunder.

4.1 It was alleged that the results which were announced could not be reconciled with the number of people who presented themselves for voting. This was a reference to the fact that an electoral ofi¬\201cer draws a line across the name and particulars of each elector at the time of voting. The marked votersâ\200\231 lists should, therefore, provide coni¬\201rmation of the total number of voters who have voted at a given polling station. The suspicion was that some candidates, presumably the winning ones, received higher polls as a result of fraudulent addition of votes. No specii¬\201c accusation of fraud was directed at any particular person.

```
Annexure A.
Pglii¬\201gal Pai¬\202jgs
Abbreviation
Full-Name
Registration
Date
DD/MM/YY
M.F.P.
S.D.U.
B.N.P.
B.C.P.
L.C.D
N.P.P.
P.F.D.
K.B.P.
LLP/UDP
L.E.P.
C.D.P.
N.I.P.
Marematlou Freedom Party
Sefate Democratic Union
Basotho National Party
Lekhotla La Mahatammoho
(Basutoland Congress Party)
Lesotho Congress for Democracy
National Progressive Party
Khoeetsa ea Sechaba
Kopanang Basotho Party
Lesotho Labour Party/United
Democratic Party Alliance
Lesotho Educational Party
Chn'stian Democratic Party
National Independent Party
In
11
n
n i
09/01/98
13/01/98
15/01/98
21/01/98
02/02/98
06/02/98
19/02/98
06/03/98
01/04/98
06/04/98
06/04/98
06/04/98
cFull-Name
```

Mokhantso Matanki
Moeletsi Samuel Mohlominyane
Linakane Tsekeli N.
861650 Flora Selloane
Mara Lepekola
Thelingoane Thabo Nyamane
Sethabathaba Tefelo V.
Ntoi John Molaka
Lethoba Solomon M.
Mokotla Makhiba C.
Makhetha Bernard Chere

ballot papers should be put in sealed envelopes for each candidate. The marked voters $200\231$ lists also have to be sealed. The seals are required to be signed by the presiding of $201\cent{center}$ and party agents.

3. METHODOLOGY

The enquiry was organised in two stages which will be referred to as the <code>i¬\201rst</code> and second stage. Representatives of the political parties observed the entire process. An interim report was compiled and submitted to the Chairperson of SADC on 26 August 1998.

3.1

The i¬\201rst stage

3.1.1

The aggrieved parties were invited to submit written submissions, together with any supporting documents. This was necessary for the purpose of deï¬\201ning the ambit of the enquiry.

3.1.2

The Independent Electoral Commission (IEC) as well as any other party wishing to do so were invited to respond to the complaints tabled by way of a summarised written presentation.

3.1.3

Plenary sessions were held on the 15, 16, 17, 21 and 22 August 1998. At these sessions, political parties and the IEC were given the opportunity to expand orally on the written representations. Other participants put questions to the presenters. A large conference hall was used and this enabled interested parties and their supporters to attend in considerable numbers. The media was however excluded from these sessions.

3.1.4

Participants were allowed to use experts in their presentations as well as in questioning those who were presenting.

3.1.5

All documents presented to the enquiry were made available to other participants.

3.1.6

The Commission also inspected some IEC documents and facilities at the IEC of 1×10^{-2} colors.

-

originates or ordinarily resides or is in employment.

The National Assembly Elections Order introduced a new registration procedure which requires a person applying for registration to be issued with a voterâ\200\231s card which bears the applicantâ\200\231s photograph and signature. This made it necessary for the IEC to embark on a new voter-registration exercise which lasted for seven weeks commencing on 5 January 1998 in approximately 1200 registration centres. The provisional registers were published for public inspection to allow for amendments and corrections. Consistent with the intention that the process should be as open and transparent as possible, political parties were invited to participate. Chiefs and party agents oi¬\201en attended at registration centres to ensure that only those people who were qualii¬\201ed to vote were allowed to register. Final votersâ\200\231 lists were thereai¬\201er compiled to serve as base documents for the running of elections. Supplementary lists were subsequently prepared to accommodate those corrections and additions which had not been included in the i¬\201nal voters lists.

2.5 Voting procedures

Section 70 of the National Assembly Election Order 1992 provides for polling for general elections to be conducted in all constituencies on the day/days i¬\201xed for elections under section 48(1). Approximately 2300 polling stations were established throughout the Kingdom and a personnel complement of approximately 11500 was deployed for the purpose. Each polling station was ordinarily staffed by 6 ofi¬\201cers as follows:

n

a presiding of i^2 201cer, the person in overall control of the polling station and responsible for the smooth-running of the voting process;

a deputy presiding of $\[\neg\]$ 201cer, who would normally be assigned the duty of checking the voters list;

- 4.2 It was alleged that an inspection of the <code>i¬\201nal</code> voter $\hat{a}\200\231s$ list shows an unnatural pattern in the distribution of dates of birth. In their view, dates of birth were manipulated. This meant that <code>i¬\201ctitious</code> persons, referred to as $\hat{a}\200\230$ phantom voters $\hat{a}\200\231$, were placed on the voter $\hat{a}\200\231$ s lists in order to in crease the number of $\hat{a}\200\230$ people $\hat{a}\200\231$ who would vote for a particular party.
- 4.3 Persons who were not entitled to vote because they did not have proper identiï¬\201cation records were allowed to vote, contrary to Section 75 (1A) of the National Assembly Election Order. It was contended that the regulation made at the instance of the IEC to the effect that persons whose names did not appear on the voterâ\200\231s lists should be allowed to vote if they produced only a voter registration card was contrary to the law which requires both a voter registration card and some other form of identiï¬\201cation.
- 4.4 It was alleged that the [BC was very uncooperative in its dealings with the opposition parties. The parties were forced to approach the courts on matters which should have been resolved without resorting to litigation.
- 4.5 The opposition parties presented a statistical study which allegedly shows that the outcome of the elections could not be what it purports to be. Mr. Njenga conducted a standard regression test which purports to demonstrate that there is no correlation between the voting patterns and the election results.
- 4.6 It was alleged that extra ballot papers, from a different supplier, were obtained by the IEC for clandestine use. Of $\$ 201cial ballot papers were procured from Canada but the fraudulent additions were obtained from a South African $\$ $\$ 201rm. These could only have been for use by the soâ\200\224called phantom voters.
- 4.7 Military Intelligence structures were used to transport electoral materials from Maseru to the districts without those of $\[\]$ $\[\]$ of $\[\]$ having been seconded to the IEC, as required by law.
- 4.8 The $in\201$ rst Director of Elections was removed from his post allegedly because he refused to condone irregularities.
- 4.9 The parties wanted to know the results of an IEC investigation into two incidents where electoral material was found abandoned. One incident was on the banks of the Kolonyama $200\230$ river, the other near the Mohokare liver.

The Commission, during the second stage of the investigation, conducted a re-count of the votes cast in 66 constituencies. The other 14 constituenciesâ\200\231 ballot papers could not be accessed as a result of a High Court decision. The result of the re-count is set out in Annexure C. The material presented to the Commission by the IEC for recounting was not in good condition. Some of the concerns with the state of the material included the following:

1.

10.

11.

12.

13.

Generally, about 95% of all the white plastic bags submitted were opened, and an attempt to reseal them in some instances had been made. IEC staff were asked to explain; they stated that they were opened to access certain documents needed for auditing purposes. The IEC also explained that they had to open envelopes in order to search for A45's which were inadvertently sealed with ballot papers. Some envelopes with ballot paper cast and counterfoils had broken seals.

Some envelopes were sealed but had no signatures of either the Presiding Ofi¬ $\201$ cer or Party Agents. However, a number of envelopes were sealed and signed by either the Presiding Ofi¬ $\201$ cer alone or Presiding Ofi¬ $\201$ cer and Political Party-agents.

There were envelopes with seals which were broken and had been resealed.

Some envelopes were sealed with masking tape whereas others were merely closed without a seal.

In some cases there were ballot paper envelopes which contained ballot papers but were not closed. There was no indication of any attempt to close them, let alone seal them.

In some instances, the white plastic bags contained ballot papers only. There were also cases where the name of the constituency labelled on the white plastic bag did not correspond with the contents. In some cases there were ballot paper envelopes of different constituencies in one plastic bag.

In certain cases white plastic bags submitted contained election material used during election but did not contain any ballot papers, i.e. used or unused. This was a negligible occurrence.

It was observed that in some instances, ballot papers in some metal boxes were not sealed in envelopes at all whilst others were sealed in ofi¬201cial envelopes.

In other cases there were empty envelopes with particulars of polling stations written on them.

In some constituencies, green canvas bags, which could not be sealed

Christmas days, they noted that the following days had unexplainable $\hat{a}\200\231$ high number of birth days:

DAY OF MONTH

MONTH NUMBER

O2 O3

In their view the above $a\200\230$ inexplicable irregularities $a\200\231$ occur in an $a\200\230$ inexplicable $a\200\231$ specii $a\200\230$ pattern throughout the entire voters list.. It is the

oppositions $200\231$ submission that it is not possible at all that the above pattem could have occurred naturally. They therefore concluded that the voters $200\231$ lists that were compiled for the 1998 elections are not a legitimate and accurate document

-

The opposition parties allegation, therefore, is that $nona^200^24existent$

people were added on to the voters lists and assigned $\mbox{i}\mbox{$\neg$}\mbox{$\backslash$} 201\mbox{ctitious}$

contention that there was an unduly close relationship with Government. It was explained that the IEC, being a statutory body derives its funding from funds voted for it by Parliament.

As such, the Minister of Law and

Constitutional Affairs has to present their budgetary requirements to Parliament as the IEC has no other form of representation in Parliament though it reports direct to Parliament.

The Chairman declared that this

relationship did not compromise their independence and impartiality.

Another complaint was that the IEC employed the services of a lawyer who was previously employed by Government in other matters thus bringing into question their independence and impartiality. The IEC responded by saying that it saw no coni¬\202ict of interests as it believed that it was entitled to the best legal representation. However the Commission denied being represented in Court by the same lawyer who represented the Government in the current 1998 election petitions.

6. FINDINGS

Considering the electoral process set out above, a person or persons who wanted to commit fraud would have had to do all or some of the following:

_

0

register non-existent persons on the voters lists, distributed over all or most of the 80 constituencies and 2 300 polling stations;

,

keep a record of the number of $a\200\234$ phantom voters $a\200\235$ that would have been allocated to each polling station to ensure that sufi¬\201cient voting material is supplied to cater for the additional voters;

ensure that on voting day there are people, who at the very least must look 18 years or older, to appear and vote at the polling stations, alternatively, <code>i¬201nd</code> a way to put sheets of marked extra ballot papers into the ballot boxes at different polling stations;

ensure that all these people are somehow not marked with the indelible ink used, or i-201nd the necessary chemicals to remove the ink, a process we were informed is very difi-201cult;

We proceed to deal with specii¬\201c i¬\201ndings.

6.1 Reg.Qngiliation of results

The evidence and counter evidence of the opposition auditors and IEC auditors does not provide conclusive proof that the announced results and the actual results are correct or rigged.

Both the IEC and the opposition party auditors conim\201rm that they cannot give an opinion on the results until they are in a position to get more information.

There are discrepancies between the total on the A45â\200\231s and the announced results, which are captured in the A47â\200\231s. These totals should in the normal course correspond. The Commission found the explanation given by the IEC in respect of the discrepancy to be implausible.

It is improbable that

returning of $\$ $\$ 201cers would all make additions errors. The [EC also failed to explain why the Commission was not given all the A45 forms.

6.2 Manipulated Birth Dates

It was not possible to establish the reasons why the voter \hat{a} 200\231s lists display an unusual distribution of the day-and-month of birth.

6.3WW2

Presiding ofi¬\201cers were informed, both in their manuals and by special circular dated 20 May 1998, that persons whose names do not appear on the voters lists could only be allowed to vote if they produced both their voter registration cards and suitable identii¬\201cation. We found no proof of irregularities in this regard.

If Regulation 10 had the effect of permitting people who did not have suï¬\201icient identiï¬\201cation to register as voters, there is no evidence that its effect would have favoured any party.

6.4 IEC Intransigenge

It appears that at times there were some difi¬\201culties between the IEC staff and

>

All supplementary votersâ\200\231 lists were not certiï¬\201ed as required by SS6(1)(d) of the National Assembly Election Order No 10 of 1992. A number of sheets containing names of persons entered in pen and marked as having voted, showed up on the voters lists of several polling stations audited.

- 26 Form A45 \hat{a} 200\231s seem to have been written by one person though signed by different persons. Some of these documents were not signed and some did not have an [EC stamp.
- 2 Form A45 \hat{a} \200\231s were completed for a polling station in one constituency, re \ddot{a} \202ecting the same results but on different dates.

In their response, the auditors engaged by the IEC stated that they had themselves been unable to conduct a proper audit because they could not obtain a complete set of authorised electoral lists for the majority of constituencies.

The opposition parties presented a report that suggests that in constituency 36 (ABIA) they were supplied with 16 marked votersâ\200\231 lists of which 8 were completely unmarked. This is in contrast with the IEC auditors who were given 15 marked votersâ\200\231 lists with one missing. It is the oppositionsâ\200\231 allegation that the IEC ofi¬\201cials could have marked the unmarked voters lists before giving them to Deloitte & Touche, in a fraudulent attempt to reconcile the numbers. The [EC rejected this allegation.

The IEC provided the Commission with all the A45's in their possession. The Commission added up the numbers on A45's and compared them with numbers re $\[res] \]$ and compared them with numbers re $\[res] \]$ were different $\[res] \]$ to A47 forms. (See Annexure B) The results of the Commission matched those of the IEC in respect of 39 constituencies.

On noting these differences the team approached the IEC with their interim i-201gures and asked whether the IEC could explain the differences. The [EC explained that the discrepancies may be the result of wrong addition, or the fact that, despite being told otherwise, not all A45's were given to the Commission.

[EC auditors had also found inconsistencies in respect of Constituency 67.

- 4.10 Concern was expressed about the apparent close relationship between \hat{a} 200\231 the Government and the IEC, including the fact, as alleged, that they shared the services of the same law \bar{a} 201rm. The concern was that the relationship impacts on the impartiality and independence of the IEC.
- 4.11. The following additional allegations surfaced during the plenary sessions. Some arose as a result of a presentation made to the Commission by the LCD.
- 4. 11. 1 Some voters lists were not signed as required by the law and could therefore not be considered valid.
- 4.11.2 Some A45 and A47 forms were not signed by the appropriate of \arrowvert vhich, it was argued, renders them invalid.
- 4.11.3 In the Qaqatu constituency, 26 out of the 36 A45 forms emanating from the different polling stations, seem to have been completed in one handwriting. The procedure is for the forms to be completed by each presiding of \arrowvert 201cer at each polling station.
- 4.11.4 Double Registration. The attention of the [EC had been drawn to cases of double registration in at least six (6) constituencies. There was no response from the [BC or any indication whether or not investigations had been instituted and what disciplinary action, if any, had been taken.
- 4.11.5 Indelible ink.
- Allegations that some people could have voted more than once were i-2011rther heightened by the fact that in some cases wrong ink was used.
- 4.11.6 Participation of party agents. The Electoral law allows for participation of party agents throughout the process. This includes taking part in meetings to discuss the affairs of the IEC, registration of voters, the voting process itself and its i-201nalisation. There were however, serious complaints that party agents had been marginalised by the [EC and its staff who refused to co-operate with them.
- 4.11.7 Stolen Cameras. The opposition alleged that 6 cameras were stolen from the IEC and there were strong suspicions that they may have been used to make duplicate registration cards to enable the so-called phantom voters to enter the lists. The IEC conin201rmed that 2 and not 6 cameras were

- 7 .4 There are small discrepancies between the results of the recount and those announced by the EEC. There is not much signi $\ddot{\ddot{}}$ 201cance in the difference in numbers themselves. The appearance of tempering with the ballot boxes and temper bags and the mis $\ddot{\ddot{}}$ 201ling of the electoral matter, however detract from what would ordinarily have been a decisive exercise.
- 7.5 We are of the view that the manner in which the records have been kept does nothing to engender coni¬\201dence in the ability of the IEC, who admittedly had an extremely difi¬\201cult task with limited time and resources.

The problems faced by the IEC need to be put in context. In the IECâ\200\231s own response to numerous complaints and criticisms, they enumerated the following problems they had to contend with: First, they were the very <code>i¬\201rst</code> [EC that was ever instituted in Lesotho, they therefore did not get guidance from any predecessor. They were also given a very short time to prepare for the election. As part of their establishment, new responsibilities were also assigned to them , for example:-

> > >

>

They had to start a new registration system of voters they had to do delimitation of borders which increased the number of constituencies from 65 to 80 they had to cater for additional number of voters due to the lowering of the voting age from 21 to 18 they had to do voter education for both the electoral ofi¬\201cers and the electorate themselves they had to depend on temporarily employed ofi¬\201cers due to the magnitude of the exercise they had logistical constraints such as computer breakdowns, lack of space , poor facilities at polling stations and others

7.6 It is to be noted that the combined opposition votes is approximately 39 percent to the LCDâ\200\231s approximately 61 percent whereas the state of the parties in Parliament is 79 to 1. That, of course is a consequence of a $a\200\234i\201rs$

past the postâ $200\235$ electoral system. The position has not been helpedby the proliferation of opposition parties and independent candidates. It is possible, although this was not expressed, that there could be an underlying sense of grievance that 39 percent of the voting population are without their own representation in Parliament.

7.7 In considering the way forward, we feel it would be appropriate to

7. GENERAL REMARKS

7.1 There are two categories of complaints. The i¬\201rst relates to factual issues which may be proved by appropriate evidence of the behaviour and conduct of ofi¬\201cials of the IEC both during preparations for the elections and during the conduct of the elections themselves. The second is concerned with documentary evidence such as ballot books, ballot papers, votersâ\200\231 lists, control forms such as the A45's, A46's and A47 and so on. The plenary hearings went some way towards ventilating some of the issues in relation to both categories. It became clear, however, that a comprehensive audit of the elections was not possible with the resources at our disposal in the fourteen daysâ\200\231 period initially i¬\201xed in the terms of reference. Arising out of the recommendations in the interim report, the mandate of the IG was extended to enable the 1G to do a re-count of the votes. Arrangements were made for 200 students from two Universities in South Aï¬\201ica to assist in the counting, in the hope that the process would be completed in two days. The time estimate was over-optimistic. In the event, further arrangements had to be made and 100 members of the SANDF had to be brought to complete the recount after a further two days. The counting process therefore took a matter of 4 days. The Commission had expressed the desirability of â\200\234sufi¬\201cient time and resources and complete access to all the ballot boxes.â\200\235 Elsewhere it had been stated that the estimated time for the process could be one month. In the end, the IG neither had the time nor sufi¬\201cient resources to complete the process in two days. The position was however further complicated by the fact that the electoral material in respect of 14 constituencies could not be accessed as there were petitions pending before the High Court in Lesotho. It was made clear in a judgment of the Court, delivered on 4/9/1998 that an amendment to the electoral law which had made it possible for the 1G to examine some of the documents did not extend to the electoral matter in respect of which petitions were $a \geq 00 \leq 34$ currently $a \geq 00 \leq 35$ pending, in spite of an attem pt by the petitioners to withdraw the relevant petitions. The 1G has therefore not been able to take into account the electoral matter emanating from those 14

the petitioners to withdraw the relevant petitions. The 1G has therefore not been able to take into account the electoral matter emanating from those 14 constituencies in respect of which the Court was approached, presumably because the petitioners thought they contained the most demonstrable irregularities.

7.2 With regard to the <code>i¬\201rst</code> category, statements made during plenary by the opposition group were largely denied by the <code>IEC</code> of <code>i¬\201cials</code>. It was hoped that access to electoral documents might lend some support to the allegations or refute them. It did neither. As detailed elsewhere, much of the electoral

political leadership will do everything necessary to ensure the development ' of an e $i_201a^200^23i$ cient electoral institution which will be one of the guarantees of the integrity of the electoral process.

5.4 IEC Intransigence

IT was alleged that party agents were denied access to registration forms as well as Vital documents at polling stations by presiding of \arrowvert \arrowvert 201cers. Even where the IEC chairman had given them authority of \arrowvert \arrowvert on the ground re \arrowvert \arrow

The [EC chairman responded that although reasonable access was allowed, it had been necessary to employ reasonable measures to ensure the security of electoral matter. He denied that oi¬\201icers were very intransigent as stated by opposition parties. It was pointed out that at times the IEC had problems of computer breakdowns and were therefore unable to supply the required information on the spot.

On the allegation that people were expelled from the ofi¬201ces where they were examining documents, the [ECâ200231s attitude was that there were times when space was needed to enable them to work and retrieve information required by the Court.

5.5 lhe Multiple Regression Test.

The specii¬\201cation of the regression model is only partly dei¬\201ned as only some of the variates are properly dei¬\201ned. The dependent variable and the covariates are not mentioned.

is difi \neg \201cult, therefore to assess the appropriateness of the model which should have been the foundation on which the allegations of irregularity are built.

Ιt

The Commission found the patterns in the data and the correlations among variables which are said to be unusual are in fact to be expected.

5.6 Procurement of Ballot Papers,

Proper and thorough training be given to election personnel. It is also necessary that contesting candidates and their agents fully understand and appreciate the processes of conducting elections.

8.5 Logistics

It is important that a comprehensive inventory is prepared and equipment be acquired and distn'buted in good time for the Election Day. Shortages of stationery and equipment should be avoided as it has an adverse effect on the successful conduct of any election.

8.6Post Election Management of Election Material

It is essential that voters lists, ballot papers cast, ballot paper counterfoils and unused ballot paper books; all the attendant completed electoral fonns be fully accounted for, properly labelled and sealed in secure containers such as ballot boxes. These must then be stored at a secure central point where they can only be accessed as provided for by the law.

8.7 The kingdom of Lesotho may wish to examine the wisdom of using one or other electoral system.

9

CONCLUSION

When the Commission arrived in Lesotho to commence its work, there was palpable political tension in the country. Leaders of the respective political parties and of government have, to their credit however, succeeded to contain the situation of unrest and the enquiry was able to proceed with its work. We have been impressed by the level of cooperation and commitment to the process displayed by all the parties and we believe this augurs well for the future.

The Commission is grateful for the logistical assistance it received from the High Commissioner of South Africa to the Kingdom of Lesotho.

The Commission is also indebted to the volunteer students, as well as members of SANDF, for their invaluable assistance during the recount of votes.

```
Egysmgngmmi¬\201av
AAAAlAAA
Α
Total
Α
Α
Α
RECOUANTAAAA J89 NQ'LAAA AAAAUQIIAA A4
Α
TOTAALAA
5818
8239
5799
7761 H
. A8722 ,7
A A8188 A A; A8178
TAOATAAL _
8871
. 8148A. 8J48
L, 8101
TOWA-
8871 A
8148.
8101
5.819A .8899
7627
878277
9097
A9591_
A A 8178 A
7898
.7405 ,
7418A
8281
AAA§8A88A A
A8418, A
8108
.8878
i 881%
A8988AAA
8899 AAAAAA88A8AA
7758.
7718
```

7758A

8988

8849 A_A89_18__

A1512â\200\234.

```
?522 A
A7515
1.9989
9874
AAA899§A A
8134 A
8189A
8237
8438
8438 AA
8455
5023
5549
5540 A
.AAA7488AAAWAA7A488A
739.4
AAZAL°5_A
A 8715A _.7A988_A_
A 8788A
. 8880
AAAA7A§92AAA
.A A7902
;AA5.78_8
A 8788A
Α
7848
7846
A A 718.8 _ AAAA7188AAA
AAA7888___
. A7849. 7 .7105
A A8448 A
8888A .
_A
Α
WW AAWWAAA
AAAA
Α
Α
AA
Α
Α
Α
Α
Α
Α
AAA
MEQHAPHANEQ)
{\tt HOLOAI-Om}
VMQETE___(A3)
099(1)
```

```
EOIHA-BUTHEU)
[AAUBA-MATSOU)
74!?â\200\2349899â\200\2309 (,7 )AW
T.naae-Ri¬\202mom
MAHOBONGm AA
EELaA-Tgosum) A
MATALANSENGUU
MQHQPQEAI-gml AA
ABEQI§Â§L18LAAAAAA
T8!!!!$94!â\200\230A§(_14)AAA.. .A
MAPUTSOEUHAAAA
UKHETLANEUAG)
PEKA (1.7)
740841-8744"?! 18)..
â\200\230NQKWQUQLAAA
'8ELé-A8AEAEAAA18JJA
Α
AΑ
MAHUI§6188)A. ___
KHAFUN9(23A)AA
AΑ
Α
TEAYAA-TEYANENWâ\200\230)
PULAN5128)
789855880 1?»
889011954 (37) _
AΑ
?EBEAAQIBLAAA
IMOUMPOSO (=70)
QUALING (53)
LITHOTENG(34)
THABA 30310 (57)
MACHACHE (38)
ROTHE (45)
MATSIENG (44) r
MALETSUNYANE (45)
THABA PHECHELA (47)
KOLO (45)
THABA 75050 (49)
MAUEPETSANE (50)
IMATELILE (51)
THABANAMORENA (52)
UKHOELE (63)
QALABANE (54)
IMAFETENG (55)
TAUNG (55)
QUALASI (57)
MOHALESHOEK (55)
MEKALING (59)
QAQATU(60)
MPHARANE (51)
KETANE (52)
HLOAHLOENG (55)
TELE (54)
MOYENI (55)
SEBAPALA (66)
QHOAU(68)
QACHA'S NEK (55)
LEBAKENG ( 70 )
TSOEUKE (71)
MANTSONYANE (72)
THABA - MOEA (75)
THABA TSEKA (74)
SEMENA (75)
MASHAI (75)
MAUNGOANENG (77)
SENQU (75)
UNIDENTIFIED
TOTAL
55 or TOTAL VOTE
```

```
A 7915,
59.1.8
8348
7495 A
7389AA
7888
8986
5827
7724
7145
6649
9026
6245
6600
7258
6270
6350
6004
8136
8956
6673
8245
6776
6786
7966
7387
7576
6364
7830
7328
6460
4400
7022
7484
9123
6691
8207
9063
6956
8392
8834
8216
7257
5789
801
. 7789 A
8912» â\200\230_
_ 57427
7575′
7239
7056
â\200\2348891"
r 6317
7141_
7235
6335
6058 W
6174
8111
8890â\200\230â\200\235 _V
6654 V
82,27
6788
6547
7866 7
7532
7816 7
6448
7341
```

```
7303
5780
4410
7012
8312
9205
6572
8249
8720
6605
8380
_9867
8397
8254
5747
. 487632 . 1489200
438170
100
100
100
7888
7780
8912
5742
7717 _
7312
7066
9091
6317
7143
. 7235
6335
6058
6174
8111
8890
6659
8226
6784
6547
7866
7532
7816
7006
7341
7144
5780
4410
7012
7738 _
9195
7009
8249
9212
6605
8380
```

REPORT OF THECOMMISSION OF

ENQUIRY INTO THE CONDUCT AND RESULTS

OF THE LESOTHO GENERAL ELECTION

HELD IN MAY 1998

1 . INTRODUCTION

The Kingdom of Lesotho held its second general election on 23 May 1998, pursuant to a proclamation by the King made in terms of section 48(2) of the National Assembly Election Order 1992.

79 of the 80 constituencies were contested in May 1998 by 13 political parties and 11 independent candidates (see Annexure A). The election in the 80th constituency was conducted on 1 August 1998, having been defened from May because of the death of one of the candidates.

The state of the parties in the National Assembly as a result of the elections is as follows:

- > Lesotho Congress for Democracy (LCD) 79 constituencies;
- > Basotho National Party (EN?) 1 constituency.

i

Soon aï¬\201er the May elections, allegations were made that the conduct of the elections was fraught with serious irregularities which, in some cases, amounted to fraud. Speciï¬\201c complaints ranged from objections regarding:

>

the registration process and the compilation of the votersâ\200\231 lists;

alleged inegularities during voting; and the handling of electoral materials.

Apart from a number of petitions which have been lodged with the court, protests, demonstrations and a situation of relative unrest ensued. The Government of the Republic of South Africa was requested to assist in in\201nding a solution to the political impasse presenting itself in the country.

On 10 August 1998 the Deputy President of the Republic of South Aï¬\201ica met with representatives of the LCD and of three opposition parties, the Basotho National Party (BNP), the Basotho Congress Party (BCP) and the Marematlou Freedom Party (MFP). That meeting agreed on the appointment of a group of experts, comprising representatives from three countn'es of the Southern Aï¬\201ican Development Community (SADC), namely Botswana, South Africa and Zimbabwe, to investigate the allegations made. A ten-»member investigating group (IG) was constituted, four being from South Africa and three each from Botswana and Zimbabwe.

An observer from the Organisation of A $\$ 1-\201ican Unity and two from the Commonwealth have been in attendance at the enquiry.

The $IG\hat{a}\200\231S$ terms of reference were:

 $\hat{a}\200\2341$.To inquire into all matters relating to the alleged inegularities in respect of the 1998 national elections in Lesotho, including, but not restricted to

alleged fraudulent acts in the compilation of the voters roll

alleged irregularities in the demarcation process

alleged irregularities in the counting of votes

any irregularities in the reconciliation of votes cast with the voters roll

It was alleged that the IEC procured additional ballot papers from a company in South Africa. Their contention was that these were going to be used for phantom voters.

The IEC response was that they knew nothing about the rumour and that they categorically deny it. They challenged those who made the allegations to submit proof of such to the IG.

In the ensuing discussion the opposition parties were unable to substantiate the rumour and eventually decided not to pursue the allegation.

The limited investigation carried out by the Commission was not conclusive with regard to this issue.

5.7 Tragsportation of eleotoral material,

The enquiry was informed that members of the security forces had to be formally seconded to the IEC before they could perform any election tasks. It was alleged that, contrary to this understanding, members of the Military Intelligence were used to transport election material without such ofi¬\201cial seconding.

The IEC responded by stating that all electoral material was carried in IEC vehicles driven by IEC staff. Members of the security forces were asked to escort the vehicles. The [EC denied that there was a legal requirement that these escorts be seconded to the IEC.

5.8 Remoyal of the i-\201rst Director of Elections,

The opposition parties asked the [EC the circumstances under which the <code>i¬\201rst</code> Director of Elections was removed from his post. While initially it appeared as if only clari<code>i¬\201cation</code> was sought, the opposition parties later made a strong allegation that the Director was removed because he refused to condone irregularities and further that he was removed to pave way for one of<code>i¬\201cer</code> who is related to somebody important in the government. They complained further that the suspension was too long as it was almost six months since his suspension. They offered to bring the Director before the Commission so that he could testify to these events.

19â\200\231

of reference, in this matter.

6.10 Relationship Between the i¬\201oyemment and the IEQ

The EC has in the past used a law <code>i¬\201rm</code> that was also used by the LCD. We found nothing irregular in this respect. The IEC also has to relate to parliament through a Cabinet member. The Minister responsible for the IEC would, therefore, need to interact with the IEC on a regular basis.

- 6.11 i¬\201eneral ggomplaints
- 6.11.1 The panel noted that it was irregular for ofi¬\201cial documents like the supplementary list not to be signed by the Director of Elections. With regard to the additional names of people who were added by hand the Commission found that it could not be any irregularity because section 71(2) allows people whose names do not appear on the list but can produce evidence of proof of registration and identity should be allowed to vote.
- 6.11.2 The Commission also noted that there were some A45 $\hat{a}\200\231s$ and A47 $\hat{a}\200\231s$ which were not signed. This was attributed to human error. The Commission voiced their concern as such errors could bring to question the legality of the results at such stations. This was however not considered to be an irregularity that could \hat{a} -\201ect the outcome of the election.
- 6.11.3 The issue of one hand-wn'ting on all the A45â\200\231s from Qaqatu was viewed with concern. We have requested an explanation from the IEC; at the time of preparation of this report, none had been forthcoming. This is a matter which warrants further investigation.
- 6.11.4 The Commission noted these recorded in paragraph 4.11.8 accusations with concern but was satisi \neg \201ed by the action which was taken by the IEC, which ai \neg \201er consultation with the parties, put a stop to the problem.
- 6.11.5 The allegation contained in 4.11.9 was made after the formal hearings had been completed. It was agreed that the opposition representatives could inspect the relevant documents together with of $\[\] \] \]$ to establish the identity and number of the relevant lists.

matter supplied to us by the IEC was in a chaotic state. The major <code>inl201ndings</code>, with regard to the state in which we found the material, are listed in paragraph 5.1. The state of the material is such that no reliable conclusions can be drawn from it. We View the fact that seals of containers which were supposed to be intact had been broken, and packages left open, in a particularly serious light. This includes containers with material such as ballot papers, used ballot books and counterfoils; containers which, as the law stood when the enquiry commenced, needed a court order for anyone to have access to. There were other problems: there was the fact that in some cases material from one polling station was found to be mixed with that from another, that the tamper proof bags did not consistently contain material from one polling station, or all the material from a particular polling station. These and other inconsistencies detracted seriously from the integn'ty of the material we had to audit, as a reliable pointer to the fairness of the election. We are however unable to

state positively that the manner in which the documentation was kept and exhibited to us points only to fraudulent conduct on the part of anyone. More specii¬\201cally, we are unable to draw the conclusion from the documentation either that the elections were rigged, or $a\200\230$ that i¬\201aud is excluded. We can only state that in our view, the integrity of the

documents has been compromised by reason of the IEC \hat{a} 200 \hat{a} 31S failure, for whatever reason, to comply with the relevant laws and regulations.

7.3 Since the reliability of the documentation is open to doubt, it is our view that the original completed forms A45 were probably the most reliable guide as to the number of votes cast for each candidate. In the nature of things, they would be the most contemporaneous record of the voting and the counting at some 2,300 polling stations, in the presence of party agents and observers, This fact is of course tempered by the circumstance that the A45's themselves are not beyond criticism. We have recorded these defects elsewhere, including the fact that we could not be certain that we had obtained all the relevant A45's because ofthe poor state of record-keeping. Before the actual re-count took place the result of our limited comparison of the A45 totals with the information on the A47's revealed a large number of discrepancies. In 34 constituencies totals from the polling stations (A45's) were less by more than a thousand votes, than the constituencyâ\200\224level i¬\201gures (A47's). The IEC answer to this disturbing trend is that errors would have been made in the calculations, the implication being that there was no deliberate ini¬\202ation of numbers at constituency level. The IEC makes the point also that in some cases we had not been supplied with all the A45 forms which we had requested.

stolen, one of which had been recovered. There was nothing special about the cameras; any Polaroid camera could be used to perpetrate the fraud alleged.

- 4.11.8 The opposition parties alleged that the IEC may have tampered with voter $200\231$ s lists after the elections. We were informed that the auditors for the opposition parties were handed what purported to be used voter $200\231$ s lists for constituency number 36. On perusing the list they found that of the lists in respect of 8 polling stations in that constituency had not been marked off, indicating that there had been no voters at those polling stations. Subsequently, the same voter $200\231$ s lists were handed over by of $200\201$ cials of the IEC to their own auditors. According to the record of the latter auditors, only one and not eight of the voter $200\231$ s lists had no cancellations. This suggested that the voter $200\231$ s lists had been manipulated $200\201$ er they had been seen by the auditors of the opposition parties and before they were handed over to the IEC auditors.
- 4.11.9 The LCD alleged that the BNP had been collecting voter registration cards from people, and noting the registration number in a register, thereby interfering with their right to vote for a candidate of their choice. The BNP alleged, in turn, that the LCD was doing the same and that they paid people to vote for them

5. DISCUSSION OF THE ALLEGATIONS

The overall allegation was that there was widespread fraud during the 1998 elections. The opposition parties were however not able to put their <code>i-\201nger</code> conclusively, on exactly how and at what point the fraud could have taken place. There was speculation , however based on the discrepancies which were discovered by the auditors who carried out limited inspection for the respective parties.

We proceed to discuss the specii¬\201c allegations made.

5.1 Th O1-: R l
People Who Presented Themselyes for Voting

o B R n i1

. .

'h hN 0â\200\230 f

The opposition parties presented the Commission with a report prepared by their auditors in respect of 31 constituencies. That report, according to them, shows that the total number of people who voted in each constituency, as rei¬\202ected by markings on the voters list, is far less than the sum total of announced results for each party in the same constituency.

The auditor for the opposition parties, checked the announced results on behalf of the opposition parties. He could not complete his assignment because the IEC failed to afford him access to all documentation which he required to carry it out. He compared the used voters lists with the results announced in the 31 constituencies that he was able to audit. He recorded his in\201ndings as follows.

0

U

-

The voting lists for certain polling stations were missing. The IEC informed them that these voters lists booklets were inadvertently sealed in the envelopes containing the ballot papers, which can only be accessed through a court order.

There were large differences between the announced results and the number of people who presented themselves for voting as indicated in the marked voters $200\231$ lists for the 31 constituencies.

He could not gain access to the ballot account forms (A46).

any acts of vandalism in respect of electoral materials

- 2. To make recommendations to SADC, through its Chairperson, on possible solutions to the impasse; within fourteen days of the initiation of the inquily. $a \times 200 \times 235$
- 2. THE ELECTION PROCESS IN LESOTHO
- 2.1 The elethraI system,

The law governing elections in Lesotho is the National Assembly Election Order 1992. Lesotho has adopted a multi-party democratic system of government with national elections being run every <code>i¬\201ve</code> years. The <code>i¬\201rst</code> elections under this arrangement were in 1993. Elections are run on. a <code>i¬\201rst</code> past the post constituency system.

2.2 lb: Independent Elegtgxal QQmmissiQn.

Section 66(1) of the Lesotho Constitution as amended in 1997 provides for the establishment of an Independent Electoral Commission. Section 66C provides for the independence of the IEC and states that it shall not, in the performance of its functions, be subject to the direction or control of any person or authority. The powers, duties and functions of the [EC are set out in section 66A and include:

to ensure that elections to the National Assembly and Local Authorities are held regularly and that every election or referendum held is free and fair.

to organise, conduct and supervise in an impartial and independent manner elections of the National Assembly and referenda under the

INDEX

ITEM

PAGE

- 1 . Introduction
- o The Election process in Lesotho

t

- 3. Methodology
- 4. Allegations oflrregularities
- 5. Discussion of the Allegations
- 6. Findings
- 7. General Remarks
- 8. Recommendations

ANNEXURES

- A $\hat{a}\200\224$ List of political parties and independent candidates B Comparison of A45 and A47 forms C Recount of votes by Commission .

24

mention the following: it has been suggested that a new general election . should be held on the basis that the irregularities cast doubt on the fairness of the 1998 elections. We are unable to state that the invalidity of the elections has been conclusively established. We point out, however, that some of the apparent irregularities and discrepancies are sufi¬\201ciently serious concerns. We cannot however postulate that the result does not rei¬\202ect the will of the Lesotho electorate. We merely point out that the means for checking this has been compromised and crated much room for doubt.

7 .8 We point out that on our calculations, based on information in the A45 fonns, winning margins about 8 constituencies were less than thousand. The BNP seems, for instance, on the same basis, to have won two rather than one only constituency. A table indicating the closeness of the results and particulars of the constituencies apparently won by the BNP is annexed marked B. We hasten to add that this relates to a constituency the ballot papers of which we did not have access to. We were therefore not in possession of material to enable us to check.

8 RECOMMENDATIONS

The Commission makes the following recommendations.

8.1 The IEC occupies a crucial position in a democracy and it is essential that it should enjoy the con $\[\] \] 201$ dence of the community, regardless of political persuasion. This con $\[\] \] \] 201$ dence appears to have been, rightly or wrongly, eroded. It is important that measures be taken to restore it. We would hope that the political leadership will do everything necessary to ensure the development of an efi-\201cient electoral institution which will be one of the guarantees of the integrity of the electoral process.

8.2 Financial Resources

It is important the institution which is charged with the running of elections have access to sufi¬\201cient resources.

8.3The Law

It is imperative that the IEC with its $oin\202icers$ must stn'ctly adhere to the laws governing the conduct of elections.

8.4 Training

Proper and thorough training be given to election personnel. It is also necessary that contesting candidates and their agents fully understand and appreciate the processes of conducting elections.

8.5 Logistics

It is important that a comprehensive inventory is prepared and equipment be acquired and distn'buted in good time for the Election Day. Shortages of stationery and equipment should be avoided as it has an adverse effect on the successful conduct of any election.

8.6Post Election Management of Election Material

It is essential that voters lists, ballot papers cast, ballot paper counterfoils and unused ballot paper books; all the attendant completed electoral fonns be fully accounted for, properly labelled and sealed in secure containers such as ballot boxes. These must then be stored at a secure central point where they can only be accessed as provided for by the law.

8.7 The kingdom of Lesotho may wish to examine the wisdom of using one or other electoral system.

9

CONCLUSION

When the Commission arrived in Lesotho to commence its work, there was palpable political tension in the country. Leaders of the respective political parties and of government have, to their credit however, succeeded to contain the situation of unrest and the enquiry was able to proceed with its work. We have been impressed by the level of cooperation and commitment to the process displayed by all the parties and we believe this augurs well for the future.

The Commission is grateful for the logistical assistance it received from the High Commissioner of South Africa to the Kingdom of Lesotho.

The Commission is also indebted to the volunteer students, as well as members of SANDF, for their invaluable assistance during the recount of votes.

- 7 .4 There are small discrepancies between the results of the recount and those announced by the EEC. There is not much signii¬\201cance in the difference in numbers themselves. The appearance of tempering with the ballot boxes and temper bags and the misi¬\201ling of the electoral matter, however detract from what would ordinarily have been a decisive exercise.
- 7.5 We are of the view that the manner in which the records have been kept does nothing to engender coni¬\201dence in the ability of the IEC, who admittedly had an extremely difi¬\201cult task with limited time and resources.

The problems faced by the IEC need to be put in context. In the IECâ\200\231s own response to numerous complaints and criticisms, they enumerated the following problems they had to contend with: First, they were the very i¬\201rst [EC that was ever instituted in Lesotho, they therefore did not get guidance from any predecessor. They were also given a very short time to prepare for the election. As part of their establishment, new responsibilities were also assigned to them , for example:

> > >

>

They had to start a new registration system of voters they had to do delimitation of borders which increased the number of constituencies from 65 to 80 they had to cater for additional number of voters due to the lowering of the voting age from 21 to 18 they had to do voter education for both the electoral ofi¬\201cers and the electorate themselves they had to depend on temporarily employed ofi¬\201cers due to the magnitude of the exercise they had logistical constraints such as computer breakdowns, lack of space , poor facilities at polling stations and others

7.6 It is to be noted that the combined opposition votes is approximately 39 percent to the LCDâ\200\231s approximately 61 percent whereas the state of the parties in Parliament is 79 to 1. That, of course is a consequence of a $a\200\234\$ -\201rs +

past the postâ $200\235$ electoral system. The position has not been helpedby the proliferation of opposition parties and independent candidates. It is possible, although this was not expressed, that there could be an underlying sense of grievance that 39 percent of the voting population are without their own representation in Parliament.

7.7 In considering the way forward, we feel it would be appropriate to

political leadership will do everything necessary to ensure the development ' of an e $i_201a^200^23i$ cient electoral institution which will be one of the guarantees of the integrity of the electoral process.

5.4 IEC Intransigence

IT was alleged that party agents were denied access to registration forms as well as Vital documents at polling stations by presiding of \arrowvert \arrowvert 201cers. Even where the IEC chairman had given them authority of \arrowvert \arrowvert on the ground re \arrowvert \arrow

The [EC chairman responded that although reasonable access was allowed, it had been necessary to employ reasonable measures to ensure the security of electoral matter. He denied that oi¬\201icers were very intransigent as stated by opposition parties. It was pointed out that at times the IEC had problems of computer breakdowns and were therefore unable to supply the required information on the spot.

On the allegation that people were expelled from the ofi¬201ces where they were examining documents, the [ECâ200231s attitude was that there were times when space was needed to enable them to work and retrieve information required by the Court.

5.5 lhe Multiple Regression Test.

The specii¬\201cation of the regression model is only partly dei¬\201ned as only some of the variates are properly dei¬\201ned. The dependent variable and the covariates are not mentioned.

is difi¬\201cult, therefore to assess the appropriateness of the model which should have been the foundation on which the allegations of irregularity are built.

Ιt

The Commission found the patterns in the data and the correlations among variables which are said to be unusual are in fact to be expected.

5.6 Procurement of Ballot Papers,

7. GENERAL REMARKS

7.1 There are two categories of complaints. The i¬\201rst relates to factual issues which may be proved by appropriate evidence of the behaviour and conduct of ofi¬\201cials of the IEC both during preparations for the elections and during the conduct of the elections themselves. The second is concerned with documentary evidence such as ballot books, ballot papers, votersâ\200\231 lists, control forms such as the A45's, A46's and A47 and so on. The plenary hearings went some way towards ventilating some of the issues in relation to both categories. It became clear, however, that a comprehensive audit of the elections was not possible with the resources at our disposal in the fourteen daysâ\200\231 period initially i¬\201xed in the terms of reference. Arising out of the recommendations in the interim report, the mandate of the IG was extended to enable the 1G to do a re-count of the votes. Arrangements were made for 200 students from two Universities in South Aï¬\201ica to assist in the counting, in the hope that the process would be completed in two days. The time estimate was over-optimistic. In the event, further arrangements had to be made and 100 members of the SANDF had to be brought to complete the recount after a further two days. The counting process therefore took a matter of 4 days. The Commission had expressed the desirability of â\200\234sufï¬\201cient time and resources and complete access to all the ballot boxes.â\200\235 Elsewhere it had been stated that the estimated time for the process could be one month. In the end, the IG neither had the time nor sufi¬\201cient resources to complete the process in two days. The position was however further complicated by the fact that the electoral material in respect of 14 constituencies could not be accessed as there were petitions pending before the High Court in Lesotho. It was made clear in a judgment of the Court, delivered on 4/9/1998 that an amendment to the electoral law which had made it possible for the 1G to examine some of the documents did not extend to the electoral matter in respect of which petitions were $a \geq 00 \leq 34$ currently $a \geq 00 \leq 35$ pending, in spite of an attem pt by the petitioners to withdraw the relevant petitions. The 1G has therefore not been able to take into account the electoral matter emanating from those 14

the petitioners to withdraw the relevant petitions. The 1G has therefore not been able to take into account the electoral matter emanating from those 14 constituencies in respect of which the Court was approached, presumably because the petitioners thought they contained the most demonstrable irregularities.

7.2 With regard to the <code>i¬\201rst</code> category, statements made during plenary by the opposition group were largely denied by the <code>IEC</code> of <code>i¬\201cials</code>. It was hoped that access to electoral documents might lend some support to the allegations or refute them. It did neither. As detailed elsewhere, much of the electoral

- 4.10 Concern was expressed about the apparent close relationship between \hat{a} 200\231 the Government and the IEC, including the fact, as alleged, that they shared the services of the same law \bar{a} 201rm. The concern was that the relationship impacts on the impartiality and independence of the IEC.
- 4.11. The following additional allegations surfaced during the plenary sessions. Some arose as a result of a presentation made to the Commission by the LCD.
- 4. 11. 1 Some voters lists were not signed as required by the law and could therefore not be considered valid.
- 4.11.2 Some A45 and A47 forms were not signed by the appropriate of \arrowvert vhich, it was argued, renders them invalid.
- 4.11.3 In the Qaqatu constituency, 26 out of the 36 A45 forms emanating from the different polling stations, seem to have been completed in one handwriting. The procedure is for the forms to be completed by each presiding of \arrowvert 201cer at each polling station.
- 4.11.4 Double Registration. The attention of the [EC had been drawn to cases of double registration in at least six (6) constituencies. There was no response from the [BC or any indication whether or not investigations had been instituted and what disciplinary action, if any, had been taken.
- 4.11.5 Indelible ink.
- Allegations that some people could have voted more than once were i-2011rther heightened by the fact that in some cases wrong ink was used.
- 4.11.6 Participation of party agents. The Electoral law allows for participation of party agents throughout the process. This includes taking part in meetings to discuss the affairs of the IEC, registration of voters, the voting process itself and its i-201nalisation. There were however, serious complaints that party agents had been marginalised by the [EC and its staff who refused to co-operate with them.
- 4.11.7 Stolen Cameras. The opposition alleged that 6 cameras were stolen from the IEC and there were strong suspicions that they may have been used to make duplicate registration cards to enable the so-called phantom voters to enter the lists. The IEC conin201rmed that 2 and not 6 cameras were

>

All supplementary votersâ\200\231 lists were not certiï¬\201ed as required by SS6(1)(d) of the National Assembly Election Order No 10 of 1992. A number of sheets containing names of persons entered in pen and marked as having voted, showed up on the voters lists of several polling stations audited.

- 26 Form A45 \hat{a} 200\231s seem to have been written by one person though signed by different persons. Some of these documents were not signed and some did not have an [EC stamp.
- 2 Form A45 \hat{a} \200\231s were completed for a polling station in one constituency, re \ddot{a} \202ecting the same results but on different dates.

In their response, the auditors engaged by the IEC stated that they had themselves been unable to conduct a proper audit because they could not obtain a complete set of authorised electoral lists for the majority of constituencies.

The opposition parties presented a report that suggests that in constituency 36 (ABIA) they were supplied with 16 marked votersâ\200\231 lists of which 8 were completely unmarked. This is in contrast with the IEC auditors who were given 15 marked votersâ\200\231 lists with one missing. It is the oppositionsâ\200\231 allegation that the IEC ofi¬\201cials could have marked the unmarked voters lists before giving them to Deloitte & Touche, in a fraudulent attempt to reconcile the numbers. The [EC rejected this allegation.

The IEC provided the Commission with all the A45's in their possession. The Commission added up the numbers on A45's and compared them with numbers re $\[res] \]$ and compared them with numbers re $\[res] \]$ were different $\[res] \]$ to A47 forms. (See Annexure B) The results of the Commission matched those of the IEC in respect of 39 constituencies.

On noting these differences the team approached the IEC with their interim i-201gures and asked whether the IEC could explain the differences. The [EC explained that the discrepancies may be the result of wrong addition, or the fact that, despite being told otherwise, not all A45's were given to the Commission.

[EC auditors had also found inconsistencies in respect of Constituency 67.

mention the following: it has been suggested that a new general election . should be held on the basis that the irregularities cast doubt on the fairness of the 1998 elections. We are unable to state that the invalidity of the elections has been conclusively established. We point out, however, that some of the apparent irregularities and discrepancies are sufi¬\201ciently serious concerns. We cannot however postulate that the result does not rei¬\202ect the will of the Lesotho electorate. We merely point out that the means for checking this has been compromised and crated much room for doubt.

7 .8 We point out that on our calculations, based on information in the A45 fonns, winning margins about 8 constituencies were less than thousand. The BNP seems, for instance, on the same basis, to have won two rather than one only constituency. A table indicating the closeness of the results and particulars of the constituencies apparently won by the BNP is annexed marked B. We hasten to add that this relates to a constituency the ballot papers of which we did not have access to. We were therefore not in possession of material to enable us to check.

8 RECOMMENDATIONS

The Commission makes the following recommendations.

8.1 The IEC occupies a crucial position in a democracy and it is essential that it should enjoy the con $\[\] \] 201$ dence of the community, regardless of political persuasion. This con $\[\] \] \] 201$ dence appears to have been, rightly or wrongly, eroded. It is important that measures be taken to restore it. We would hope that the political leadership will do everything necessary to ensure the development of an efi-\201cient electoral institution which will be one of the guarantees of the integrity of the electoral process.

8.2 Financial Resources

It is important the institution which is charged with the running of elections have access to sufi¬\201cient resources.

8.3The Law

It is imperative that the IEC with its $oin\202icers$ must stn'ctly adhere to the laws governing the conduct of elections.

8.4 Training

INDEX

ITEM

PAGE

- 1 . Introduction
- o The Election process in Lesotho

t

- 3. Methodology
- 4. Allegations oflrregularities
- 5. Discussion of the Allegations
- 6. Findings
- 7. General Remarks
- 8. Recommendations

ANNEXURES

- A $\hat{a}\200\224$ List of political parties and independent candidates B Comparison of A45 and A47 forms C Recount of votes by Commission .

24

any acts of vandalism in respect of electoral materials

- 2. To make recommendations to SADC, through its Chairperson, on possible solutions to the impasse; within fourteen days of the initiation of the inquily. $a \times 200 \times 235$
- 2. THE ELECTION PROCESS IN LESOTHO
- 2.1 The elethraI system,

The law governing elections in Lesotho is the National Assembly Election Order 1992. Lesotho has adopted a multi-party democratic system of government with national elections being run every <code>i¬\201ve</code> years. The <code>i¬\201rst</code> elections under this arrangement were in 1993. Elections are run on. a <code>i¬\201rst</code> past the post constituency system.

2.2 lb: Independent Elegtgxal QQmmissiQn.

Section 66(1) of the Lesotho Constitution as amended in 1997 provides for the establishment of an Independent Electoral Commission. Section 66C provides for the independence of the IEC and states that it shall not, in the performance of its functions, be subject to the direction or control of any person or authority. The powers, duties and functions of the [EC are set out in section 66A and include:

to ensure that elections to the National Assembly and Local Authorities are held regularly and that every election or referendum held is free and fair.

to organise, conduct and supervise in an impartial and independent manner elections of the National Assembly and referenda under the

5. DISCUSSION OF THE ALLEGATIONS

The overall allegation was that there was widespread fraud during the 1998 elections. The opposition parties were however not able to put their <code>i-\201</code>nger conclusively, on exactly how and at what point the fraud could have taken place. There was speculation , however based on the discrepancies which were discovered by the auditors who carried out limited inspection for the respective parties.

We proceed to discuss the specii¬\201c allegations made.

5.1 Th 01-: R l
People Who Presented Themselyes for Voting

o B R n i1

. .

'h hN 0â\200\230 f

The opposition parties presented the Commission with a report prepared by their auditors in respect of 31 constituencies. That report, according to them, shows that the total number of people who voted in each constituency, as rei¬\202ected by markings on the voters list, is far less than the sum total of announced results for each party in the same constituency.

The auditor for the opposition parties, checked the announced results on behalf of the opposition parties. He could not complete his assignment because the IEC failed to afford him access to all documentation which he required to carry it out. He compared the used voters lists with the results announced in the 31 constituencies that he was able to audit. He recorded his $i \rightarrow 201$ ndings as follows.

0

U

The voting lists for certain polling stations were missing. The IEC informed them that these voters lists booklets were inadvertently sealed in the envelopes containing the ballot papers, which can only be accessed through a court order.

There were large differences between the announced results and the number of people who presented themselves for voting as indicated in the marked voters $200\231$ lists for the 31 constituencies.

He could not gain access to the ballot account forms (A46).

stolen, one of which had been recovered. There was nothing special about the cameras; any Polaroid camera could be used to perpetrate the fraud alleged.

- 4.11.8 The opposition parties alleged that the IEC may have tampered with voter $200\231$ s lists after the elections. We were informed that the auditors for the opposition parties were handed what purported to be used voter $200\231$ s lists for constituency number 36. On perusing the list they found that of the lists in respect of 8 polling stations in that constituency had not been marked off, indicating that there had been no voters at those polling stations. Subsequently, the same voter $200\231$ s lists were handed over by of $200\201$ cials of the IEC to their own auditors. According to the record of the latter auditors, only one and not eight of the voter $200\231$ s lists had no cancellations. This suggested that the voter $200\231$ s lists had been manipulated $200\201$ er they had been seen by the auditors of the opposition parties and before they were handed over to the IEC auditors.
- 4.11.9 The LCD alleged that the BNP had been collecting voter registration cards from people, and noting the registration number in a register, thereby interfering with their right to vote for a candidate of their choice. The BNP alleged, in turn, that the LCD was doing the same and that they paid people to vote for them

of reference, in this matter.

6.10 Relationship Between the i¬\201oyemment and the IEQ

The EC has in the past used a law <code>i¬\201rm</code> that was also used by the LCD. We found nothing irregular in this respect. The IEC also has to relate to parliament through a Cabinet member. The Minister responsible for the IEC would, therefore, need to interact with the IEC on a regular basis.

- 6.11 i¬\201eneral ggomplaints
- 6.11.1 The panel noted that it was irregular for ofi¬\201cial documents like the supplementary list not to be signed by the Director of Elections. With regard to the additional names of people who were added by hand the Commission found that it could not be any irregularity because section 71(2) allows people whose names do not appear on the list but can produce evidence of proof of registration and identity should be allowed to vote.
- 6.11.2 The Commission also noted that there were some A45 $\hat{a}\200\231s$ and A47 $\hat{a}\200\231s$ which were not signed. This was attributed to human error. The Commission voiced their concern as such errors could bring to question the legality of the results at such stations. This was however not considered to be an irregularity that could \hat{a} -\201ect the outcome of the election.
- 6.11.3 The issue of one hand-wn'ting on all the A45â\200\231s from Qaqatu was viewed with concern. We have requested an explanation from the IEC; at the time of preparation of this report, none had been forthcoming. This is a matter which warrants further investigation.
- 6.11.4 The Commission noted these recorded in paragraph 4.11.8 accusations with concern but was satisi \neg \201ed by the action which was taken by the IEC, which ai \neg \201er consultation with the parties, put a stop to the problem.
- 6.11.5 The allegation contained in 4.11.9 was made after the formal hearings had been completed. It was agreed that the opposition representatives could inspect the relevant documents together with of $\[\] \] \]$ to establish the identity and number of the relevant lists.

It was alleged that the IEC procured additional ballot papers from a company in South Africa. Their contention was that these were going to be used for phantom voters.

The IEC response was that they knew nothing about the rumour and that they categorically deny it. They challenged those who made the allegations to submit proof of such to the IG.

In the ensuing discussion the opposition parties were unable to substantiate the rumour and eventually decided not to pursue the allegation.

The limited investigation carried out by the Commission was not conclusive with regard to this issue.

5.7 Tragsportation of eleotoral material,

The enquiry was informed that members of the security forces had to be formally seconded to the IEC before they could perform any election tasks. It was alleged that, contrary to this understanding, members of the Military Intelligence were used to transport election material without such ofi¬\201cial seconding.

The IEC responded by stating that all electoral material was carried in IEC vehicles driven by IEC staff. Members of the security forces were asked to escort the vehicles. The [EC denied that there was a legal requirement that these escorts be seconded to the IEC.

5.8 Remoyal of the i-\201rst Director of Elections,

The opposition parties asked the [EC the circumstances under which the <code>i¬\201rst</code> Director of Elections was removed from his post. While initially it appeared as if only clari<code>i¬\201cation</code> was sought, the opposition parties later made a strong allegation that the Director was removed because he refused to condone irregularities and further that he was removed to pave way for one of<code>i¬\201cer</code> who is related to somebody important in the government. They complained further that the suspension was too long as it was almost six months since his suspension. They offered to bring the Director before the Commission so that he could testify to these events.

19â\200\231

matter supplied to us by the IEC was in a chaotic state. The major in\201ndings, with regard to the state in which we found the material, are listed in paragraph 5.1. The state of the material is such that no reliable conclusions can be drawn from it. We View the fact that seals of containers which were supposed to be intact had been broken, and packages left open, in a particularly serious light. This includes containers with material such as ballot papers, used ballot books and counterfoils; containers which, as the law stood when the enquiry commenced, needed a court order for anyone to have access to. There were other problems: there was the fact that in some cases material from one polling station was found to be mixed with that from another, that the tamper proof bags did not consistently contain material from one polling station, or all the material from a particular polling station. These and other inconsistencies detracted seriously from the integn'ty of the material we had to audit, as a reliable pointer to the fairness of the election. We are however unable to

state positively that the manner in which the documentation was kept and exhibited to us points only to fraudulent conduct on the part of anyone. More specii¬\201cally, we are unable to draw the conclusion from the documentation either that the elections were rigged, or $a\200\230$ that i¬\201aud is excluded. We can only state that in our view, the integrity of the

documents has been compromised by reason of the IEC \hat{a} 200 \hat{a} 31S failure, for whatever reason, to comply with the relevant laws and regulations.

7.3 Since the reliability of the documentation is open to doubt, it is our view that the original completed forms A45 were probably the most reliable guide as to the number of votes cast for each candidate. In the nature of things, they would be the most contemporaneous record of the voting and the counting at some 2,300 polling stations, in the presence of party agents and observers, This fact is of course tempered by the circumstance that the A45's themselves are not beyond criticism. We have recorded these defects elsewhere, including the fact that we could not be certain that we had obtained all the relevant A45's because ofthe poor state of record-keeping. Before the actual re-count took place the result of our limited comparison of the A45 totals with the information on the A47's revealed a large number of discrepancies. In 34 constituencies totals from the polling stations (A45's) were less by more than a thousand votes, than the constituencyâ\200\224level i¬\201gures (A47's). The IEC answer to this disturbing trend is that errors would have been made in the calculations, the implication being that there was no deliberate ini¬\202ation of numbers at constituency level. The IEC makes the point also that in some cases we had not been supplied with all the A45 forms which we had requested.

birth dates.

The IEC stated that political parties were kept fully informed of every aspect of the registration process and were invited to send their representatives to each registration centre to monitor the registration process. Besides the IEC ofi¬\201cials and the representatives of the political parties an $a\200\2340fi$ ¬\201cial W itnessa\200\235

was present at each registration centre. The function of the ofi¬\201cial witness was to identify applicants for registration who did not have documentary evidence of identity such as passports etc. The ofi¬\201cial witnesses were also supposed to satisfy themselves as to the age quali \ddot ¬\201cation of the applicant. In any event, according to the IEC, most of the population of Lesotho do not know their dates of birth.

The evidence at our disposal suggests that the voting register indeed

displays an unusual distribution of the day-and-month of birth.

It would take a lengthy investigation going beyond the documents, to establish the causes of this phenomenon. The phenomenon is not of material interest until it can be shown that it somehow enabled the casting of duplicate or $a\geq 0$ 0 230 ghost $200\geq 3$ 1 votes.

5.3 Persons not entitled IQ yote

The opposition parties alleged that persons who were not entitled to vote because they did not have proper identiï¬\201cation were allowed to vote contrary to section 75(1A) of the National Assembly Election Order. If this was a procedure followed generally, we are unable to state that it would have inï¬\202uenced the elections one way or another. We make no comment on its legality, but'there is nothing to indicate that it was not a bona i^{-} \201de error if To support their concern the parties had on 16 May 1998 such it was.

addressed a letter to the IEC about one voter who hadâ $200\230$ been awarded three This was according to the opposition, contrary to the law voter cards

because in terms of the law such person had to produce both a voter registration card and an identii \neg 201cation in the form of a passport or driverâ\200\231s license.

The IEC occupies a crucial position in a democracy and it is essential that it should enjoy the coni¬\201dence of the community, regardless of political persuasion. This coni¬\201dence appears to have been, rightly or wrongly, eroded. It is important that measures be taken to restore it. We would hope that the

- 3.2.1 The Commission undertook a recount of the votes cast on August 29, 30 and 31 and on 1 September 1998. Access to the ballot papers and other electoral materials was facilitated in part by an amendment to the electoral law which was passed by the Lesotho Parliament while the Commission was conducting the enquiry. The counting exercise was preceded by a Visit to the IEC ofin\201ces by the Commission on 28 August to inspect the storage of the electoral materials that would be the subject of the audit.
- 3.2.2 On the <code>i¬\201rst</code> two days, 200 students from two South African universities, the University of the North (Qwaqwa) and the University of the Orange Free State, assisted the Commission in this process. By agreement among all the parties concerned, 100 members of the South African National Defence Force (SANDF) were then utilised to help on the last two days.

' 4. ALLEGATIONS OF IRREGULARITIES

On the i-201rst day of the plenary sittings, the representatives of the objecting opposition parties presented the enquiry with ten points which formed the basis of their allegations that the elections had been rigged. These are set out hereunder.

4.1 It was alleged that the results which were announced could not be reconciled with the number of people who presented themselves for voting. This was a reference to the fact that an electoral ofi¬\201cer draws a line across the name and particulars of each elector at the time of voting. The marked votersâ\200\231 lists should, therefore, provide coni¬\201rmation of the total number of voters who have voted at a given polling station. The suspicion was that some candidates, presumably the winning ones, received higher polls as a result of fraudulent addition of votes. No specii¬\201c accusation of fraud was directed at any particular person.

14.

15.

were used to store ballot papers.

It was also observed that the $IEC\hat{a}\200\231s$ organisational problems and record keeping left a lot to be desired.

Among the 66 constituencies that were recounted it was observed that a number of constituencies had sealed white plastic bags and envelopes contained therein, thus conforming to the expected requirements.

The result of the recount is set out in Annexure C.

The Commission did not have sufi¬201cient time and resources to audit the marked votersâ200231 lists.

It is further noted that the marked lists were not found in sealed envelopes as was the case with some of the electoral material. This

. further put a question mark on the integrity of such marked votersâ\200\231 lists.

5.2 Manipulation of Birth Dates

The opposition parties employed the services of a <code>inl201rm</code> of forensic investigators, called OF&A (from South Africa) to do a detailed analysis of the entire votersallists. OF&A received the entire voters list but found the data for constituencies 11-15 could not be read on the disk.

They did a detailed analysis of the $\hat{a}\200\230$ day of birth $\hat{a}\200\231$ for all the constituen cies

Their i-201ndings a^200^230 show a^200^231 that there are a very high number of voters with the 01

January as their date of birth.

Their data and analysis showed that :

For all constituencies, on average, a far higher number of voters were born during the $i\neg\201rst$ half of the month than on the days after the 15th of the month. Thus their interpretation that the dates of birth were manipulated in one way or the other.

Only the month of September displays a constant variance from the average. Thus their opinion that this may be as a result of seasonal $inin\sqrt{202}$ uences.

The number of people who do not know the day and month of birth are too high (12.8%) compared to the national average (3.7% per 1996 national census).

Throughout the voters roll an unexplainable higher (on average double) number of voters were born on specii¬\201c days. Besides New-Yearâ\200\231s and

The IEC response was that the matter was an administrative issue which had no relationship whatsoever to the results of the election. They reported that the matter was currently under investigation and that political parties will be kept informed.

The Commission was not in a position to take this matter further. It was not clear that the issue had a direct bearing on the conduct of the elections.

5.9Elcctiim_rnate_rial_aband_oned_by_the_LEQ

The opposition parties alleged that they found documents relating to the elections abandoned on the banks of the Mohokare river in Qachaâ\200\231s Nek. Some of the documents appeared to have been burnt. The police were called and they recovered the documents together with some fragments of burnt material. The parties wanted to know the outcome of the IEC investigation into this matter. The Commission was given copies of the documents which were given to the police. They appeared to be short lists of names. An _ examination of the documents could not reveal their origin or signiī¬\201cance.

The IEC coni¬\201rmed that it was aware of this matter. The police investigation into the matter was proceeding. The IEC stated that it had instructed all its ofi¬\201cers to either shred or burn unwanted documents. It may be that some ofi¬\201cers did not follow this instruction to the letter.

A further related incident was that original completed registration forms were found on the banks of the Kolonyama river.

The IEC again coni¬\201rmed that it was aware of this incident. An IEC vehicle which was transporting registration documents had been hijacked. The police are continuing with the investigation of this matter. The IEC had recovered approximately 200 original voter registration application forms. The applicantsâ\200\231 details were captured, which means that they were not disenfranchised. The balance of the forms were duplicates. The IEC vehicle has still not been recovered.

5.10Th1

r1 inhi

nhIE n

h

vrnmn.

The opposition parties complained that the IECâ $\200\231s$ relationship with Government was too close for it to maintain its expected impartiality and It was said that this

independence from ini¬\202uence by the Government. impacted on their impartiality and independence. The IEC denied the

representatives of the political parties. Considering that it was the <code>i¬\201rst</code> time in the history of Lesotho that elections were run by an IEC, and that the time to prepare for elections was not adequate, it is clear that the IEC had to contend with considerable problems in establishing itself. There exists at present, a worrying lack of trust between the opposition parties and the Chairperson of the IEC.

6.5mm:

The regression analysis puts forward as problems what turn out to be uncontroversial facts: notably that in a $200\234$ past the post $200\235$ electoral system,

a party may get more votes that its competitors in a constituency, and thus win it, without achieving more than 50% of the vote in that constituency; and that in areas where the vote for a winning party is highest, the combined vote of its competitors will be lowest.

6.6 Proemement Qf Ballot Papers

The Commission was not presented with any evidence that extra ballot papers were procured in South Africa. This allegation was not pursued and nothing further needs be further said about it.

6.7 Trmspoi¬\202ing Qf Electoral Material

No legal requirement that members of the security forces who acted as escorts be seconded to the IEC. There was, therefore, no irregularity found in this regard;

6.8 Bemoyal of First Diregtor of Elections

The Commission was not in a position to institute an enquiry in respect of this matter. It is apparently being dealt with elsewhere.

6.9 Kolonyama and Mohokare Incidents

These incidents are still under investigation by the police. The Commission did not in 201nd any conclusive evidence of irregularities, falling within its terms

22 2222 2

2 _ AUDITOF A45 FORMS

-

_

.,.

.2.

24

30

_39

__2

22_

cop 2222

H" â\200\231

7 91:15

IE: mutt

â\200\2341111:13-263

_152 2255

sou 2 ___

```
222ch 2
3356
301322 2Lco2 2
22222
16
12
2222
2222
59
3%.
29
1199 um. 11:}:
MECHACHANE 11)
22
\frac{-222}{2}
222
NIP wpep \{011211.45 \text{ i} \neg \ 202 \text{ a} \ 200 \ 2349617
35721232 _Pi¬\202)
79
â\200\2343
32
2___
2___ 966 2_
9126292 Proâ\200\224 REF; upmop
116
29122
145
94
36
60
40
156
732
66
76
79
_ 22.9.22. 34111,.52m2.._3zgz.-4u1.b_32z2
```

```
6371 6L 3 ~,,1643 , â\200\23099? H3356
3727
6146 32
5244
212522
6161
4432
562120_2 2525 2
```

```
2
726222722
5563
29301 22 21929 22 22
1227_
5355
51322 22762
24343222 2
cousmueucvmumaemz
(1)2622 112112132 2123212957272 19191.9
1531'.
6146
6101
5609
7627
9097
6176
739252
62612
261052
2_242 426 6936
2225122 22727218
601072
76:13 I
991142
621:;
84.1%
2221326 2 27_§_:%
654$2
7432
7105
70115
9799-1
29922
_2_2_ _61962
7646
7163
7336
6701
7760
11085
9193
6912
6742
7660
3577
7575
7239
2 6160
4914
_2 24529
31 \text{mm}
1401151613}
041.014)
BUIHA-BUTI-EtS)
MALIBAMMsogs)
mpnosonc171_
11149432611475016122
11131196014619.
9&4-75092914021
111MLAK£N611H
MOHOBOLLOHZ)
111.076.5113)
7611104116114)
2 M21209!â\200\234
QKHEILANEUBI
PEK_A(11L
```

```
Kommmnua)
mosausmue 119)
3101103161201
93929253422121)
27449975412212
611952923601231
IEVA-levmsucmp
6ULANE125)
mummaumy
9513011601171 1271
BEREA (26)
woman
1607131605013012
STADLUMAREAD"
mm (32)
017741.619133)
anm (34)
LI'IHABANEMG (351
461731361
71145146051u1371
31461145116136)
1114949015041â\200\235)
W (40)
_99492′
WHO 1411
9367;
65615142)
70256 _
1107116443)
6691 â\200\230
4167513101441
I47
52
2 29
462 2
66
211
475
170202
3116
1991
21627
1595
1566
1306
1230
1961
19224
29652222
2316
2664
2954
1309
1452
11592
1364
1367
```

```
20
39
24
242 22
2421222
250
24
```

22 2 2 _22_ 22

2 376

265

264

763

2_2

2 22

57

2_ 2

166

54 42

```
229
614
231
2
22222
22
61
342522 2
21249
46
61
222
22_
â\200\235,â\200\230_2._2._5,_r..,--6-_1=2.:2,
145
94
36
66
40
156
722
222
22222 1,,
442
292
59
36
292
2 7492 2212129
55
322
2222 21272121
29562
127027
3065
1937
1627
1595
1393
1306
1230
```

```
2 612725
27405
6263
6619
6936
7756
6340
2762222 65 222____
```

```
6130
6436
7622
2554022
```

```
mi¬\201ugg 740
_2 994
301
992
270
612
220
256
425122 224647
2592252
446
5565
613
4946
2222 1121242 212145
66
5135
411
1924
2752
3735
1645
2965
42042 65 2
1164
2316
421242222
2..422 2124652
3295
2 2955 2 121%
61
3936
165
324262 22___
4520
965
22
269262
3674
1097
452422245692â\200\235); _22 2
27444 2295 2 222
7442
5523
1041
4569
161
5653
201
5134
170
2222 21212122
4356
976
4550223222 24292
1646
43 2222 2
```

```
4550
5116222224232 2222
9222 251
5618
26 2 2222222 2,22
3742
44
5909
27
3651
3636
2157
5035
4939
4696
2645
3600
4769
520212 _
5996
1309
1452
1159
1362
1430
2122269
2195222224222__292972_
1551
1191
1643
2370
1716
2968
3136
1966
1263
2677
943
1645
1346
2332
7163
7336
6706
7760
§9 11115
7632 9199
8212;
5742
2 7569
3577
222 7717
_222 7312
6161
4914
6611
9367
7066
9091
41_ 2764252 22___
652
351
52
31
222
2342 23412222
76
```

_222222

2222 222

22 292 21222 2

61

2 22222

32 2

22 2

_

_22

36 â\200\230

_22

2 222222

_

Annexure A Iii 1P Abbreviation M.F.P. S.D.U. B.N.P. B.C.P. L.C.D N.P.P. P.F.D. K.B.P. LLP/UDP L.E.P. C.D.P. N.I.P. Full-Name Registration Date DD/MM/YY Marematlou Freedom Party Sefate Democratic Union Basotho National Party Lekhotla La Mahatammoho (Basutoland Congress Party) Lesotho Congress for Democracy National Progressive Party Khoeetsa ea Sechaba Kopanang Basotho Party Lesotho Labour Party/United Democratic Party Alliance Lesotho Educational Party Christian Democratic Party National Independent Party n nn ni 09/01/98 13/01/98 15/01/98 21/01/98 02/02/98 06/02/98 19/02/98

06/03/98 01/04/98

06/04/98 06/04/98 06/04/98

Full-Name

Mokhantso Matanki

Mara Lepekola

Ntoi John Molaka

Linakane Tsekeli N. 861650 Flora Selloane

Moeletsi Samuel Mohlominyane

Thelingoane Thabo Nyamane Sethabathaba Tefelo V.

Lethoba Solomon M. Mokotla Makhiba C. Makhetha Bernard Chere provisions of the Constitution and any other Law.

-

0

-

0

to delimit the boundaries of constituencies in accordance with the provisions of the Constitution and any other Law.

to supervise and control the registration of electors.

to compile a general register of electors and constituency registers of electors and to maintain and keep them up to date.

,

to promote knowledge and sound democratic electoral processes.

In term of Section 66D(1) of the Constitution, Parliament is obliged to provide funds to enable the Commission to perform its functions effectively. The [EC is accountable to Parliament; in practice, the Minister of Law and Constitutional Affairs provides the link with the-legislature and pilots any legislation that pertains to the IEC and its functions and powers.

2.3 Preparation for Elections

The [EC assumed ofi¬\201ce in September 1997 and therefore had eight months to prepare for the general $\tilde{}$ elections. The constitutional amendments that established the IEC were accompanied by amendments to the Electoral Law itself. Their effect was to create new tasks and responsibilities for the IEC, such as voter registration, delimitation of constituencies and voter education. The voting age was lowered from 21 to 18 years thus increasing the number of people who were eligible to vote. The number of constituencies was also increased from 65 to 80.

2.4W

Section 11(1) of the National Assembly Elections Order 1992 provides that a person who is a citizen of Lesotho who has attained the age of 18 years shall, unless disqualii¬\201ed under section 57 of the Constitution to register as such, apply to be registered as an elector for the constituency where he:

The Chahperson of SADC

The Commission of Enquiry into the Conduct and Results of the Lesotho General Elections held in May 1998, hereby presents itâ\200\231s report signed at Johannesburg, on this the 9th day of September 1998.

i¬\202aw?â\200\235

J stice Pius Langa/

~

Chairperson, South Aï¬\201ica

Adv. Mojanjcu Gumbi

Member, South Africa

응

MI. Theo Nkone

Member, South Aï¬\201ica

Ms. Tshidi Mokgabudi

Member, South Africa

 $\label{eq:linear_continuity} \mbox{Ai¬} \mbox{1}\mbox{202}\mbox{1}\mbox{2}\mbox{1}\mbox{1}\mbox{2}\m$

Mr. Edwin Letsididi

Member, Botswana

Mrs Barulaganye Machaeha

Member, Botswana

Mrs Alicia Ramaribjana

MI. TobaiWa Mudede

Member, Botswana

Member, Zimbabwe

MWQLKL

Mr. Simon Muchemenye/

NKWHenry Machin'

Member, Zimbabwe

,. A/

Member, Zimbabwe

a polling ofin\201cer, whose responsibilities included checking for the indelible ink markings to ensure that there were no duplications in voting;

a polling of "\201cer whose duty was to mark voters with ink;

a security ofi¬\201cer to keep peace and order;

an ofin-201cial witness who was a person appointed to identify those voters who did not possess the ofin-201cial identiin-201cation documents. These persons were usually chiefs of the respective areas.

0

0

0

2.6

or in $a\200\2310$ $a\200\2301$. $a\200\230$,

, 1A4â\200\234. â\200\230

â\200\2301

0

1â\200\230

The ofi¬\201cial close of polling was at 17h00 except that those voters who were already in the precinct were allowed to vote. We were informed that in some remote areas, polling was extended until the following day. In each polling station, the counting of ballots commenced immediately after the close of the polling. The usual formalities applied, namely, the inspection and the sealing of the ballot boxes at the beginning of the poll and their placement in full view of everybody during the voting; the opening of the ballot boxes and the sorting and counting of the ballot papers. The votes cast for each candidate at each polling station were to be recorded on form A45, which is completed by the presiding ofin\201cer. There is provision on the form for the signature of the presiding ofi¬\201cer and party agents. The procedure was that the respective votes cast for each candidate as reï¬\202ected on the form should be immediately announced as local results by the presiding oin\201icer and then transmitted to the returning of $\[\neg\]$ 201cer at constituency level. The returning of $\[\neg\]$ 201cer adds up the total number of votes cast for each candidate, completes form A47 which $rein\202ects$ the total votes for each candidate and announces the constituency-level results. The constituency results are then transmitted to the IEC headquarters from where the consolidated results would be announced.

2.7W

The National Assembly Order requires that once the votes are counted the

We proceed to deal with specii¬\201c i¬\201ndings.

6.1 Reg.Qngiliation of results

The evidence and counter evidence of the opposition auditors and IEC auditors does not provide conclusive proof that the announced results and the actual results are correct or rigged.

Both the IEC and the opposition party auditors conim\201rm that they cannot give an opinion on the results until they are in a position to get more information.

There are discrepancies between the total on the A45â\200\231s and the announced results, which are captured in the A47â\200\231s. These totals should in the normal course correspond. The Commission found the explanation given by the IEC in respect of the discrepancy to be implausible.

It is improbable that

returning of $\$ $\$ 201cers would all make additions errors. The [EC also failed to explain why the Commission was not given all the A45 forms.

6.2 Manipulated Birth Dates

It was not possible to establish the reasons why the voter \hat{a} 200\231s lists display an unusual distribution of the day-and-month of birth.

6.3WW2

Presiding ofi¬\201cers were informed, both in their manuals and by special circular dated 20 May 1998, that persons whose names do not appear on the voters lists could only be allowed to vote if they produced both their voter registration cards and suitable identii¬\201cation. We found no proof of irregularities in this regard.

If Regulation 10 had the effect of permitting people who did not have suï¬\201icient identiï¬\201cation to register as voters, there is no evidence that its effect would have favoured any party.

6.4 IEC Intransigenge

It appears that at times there were some difi¬\201culties between the IEC staff and

contention that there was an unduly close relationship with Government. It was explained that the IEC, being a statutory body derives its funding from funds voted for it by Parliament.

As such, the Minister of Law and

Constitutional Affairs has to present their budgetary requirements to Parliament as the IEC has no other form of representation in Parliament though it reports direct to Parliament.

The Chairman declared that this

relationship did not compromise their independence and impartiality.

Another complaint was that the IEC employed the services of a lawyer who was previously employed by Government in other matters thus bringing into question their independence and impartiality. The IEC responded by saying that it saw no coni¬\202ict of interests as it believed that it was entitled to the best legal representation. However the Commission denied being represented in Court by the same lawyer who represented the Government in the current 1998 election petitions.

6. FINDINGS

Considering the electoral process set out above, a person or persons who wanted to commit fraud would have had to do all or some of the following:

_

0

register non-existent persons on the voters lists, distributed over all or most of the 80 constituencies and 2 300 polling stations;

,

keep a record of the number of $a\200\234$ phantom voters $a\200\235$ that would have been allocated to each polling station to ensure that sufi¬\201cient voting material is supplied to cater for the additional voters;

ensure that on voting day there are people, who at the very least must look 18 years or older, to appear and vote at the polling stations, alternatively, <code>i¬\201nd</code> a way to put sheets of marked extra ballot papers into the ballot boxes at different polling stations;

ensure that all these people are somehow not marked with the indelible ink used, or i-201nd the necessary chemicals to remove the ink, a process we were informed is very difi-201cult;

The Commission, during the second stage of the investigation, conducted a re-count of the votes cast in 66 constituencies. The other 14 constituenciesâ\200\231 ballot papers could not be accessed as a result of a High Court decision. The result of the re-count is set out in Annexure C. The material presented to the Commission by the IEC for recounting was not in good condition. Some of the concerns with the state of the material included the following:

1.

10.

11.

12.

13.

Generally, about 95% of all the white plastic bags submitted were opened, and an attempt to reseal them in some instances had been made. IEC staff were asked to explain; they stated that they were opened to access certain documents needed for auditing purposes. The IEC also explained that they had to open envelopes in order to search for A45's which were inadvertently sealed with ballot papers. Some envelopes with ballot paper cast and counterfoils had broken seals.

Some envelopes were sealed but had no signatures of either the Presiding Ofi¬ $\201$ cer or Party Agents. However, a number of envelopes were sealed and signed by either the Presiding Ofi¬ $\201$ cer alone or Presiding Ofi¬ $\201$ cer and Political Party-agents.

There were envelopes with seals which were broken and had been resealed.

Some envelopes were sealed with masking tape whereas others were merely closed without a seal.

In some cases there were ballot paper envelopes which contained ballot papers but were not closed. There was no indication of any attempt to close them, let alone seal them.

In some instances, the white plastic bags contained ballot papers only. There were also cases where the name of the constituency labelled on the white plastic bag did not correspond with the contents. In some cases there were ballot paper envelopes of different constituencies in one plastic bag.

In certain cases white plastic bags submitted contained election material used during election but did not contain any ballot papers, i.e. used or unused. This was a negligible occurrence.

It was observed that in some instances, ballot papers in some metal boxes were not sealed in envelopes at all whilst others were sealed in ofi¬201cial envelopes.

In other cases there were empty envelopes with particulars of polling stations written on them.

In some constituencies, green canvas bags, which could not be sealed

- 4.2 It was alleged that an inspection of the <code>i¬\201nal</code> voter $\hat{a}\200\231s$ list shows an unnatural pattern in the distribution of dates of birth. In their view, dates of birth were manipulated. This meant that <code>i¬\201ctitious</code> persons, referred to as $\hat{a}\200\230$ phantom voters $\hat{a}\200\231$, were placed on the voter $\hat{a}\200\231$ s lists in order to in crease the number of $\hat{a}\200\230$ people $\hat{a}\200\231$ who would vote for a particular party.
- 4.3 Persons who were not entitled to vote because they did not have proper identiï¬\201cation records were allowed to vote, contrary to Section 75 (1A) of the National Assembly Election Order. It was contended that the regulation made at the instance of the IEC to the effect that persons whose names did not appear on the voterâ\200\231s lists should be allowed to vote if they produced only a voter registration card was contrary to the law which requires both a voter registration card and some other form of identiï¬\201cation.
- 4.4 It was alleged that the [BC was very uncooperative in its dealings with the opposition parties. The parties were forced to approach the courts on matters which should have been resolved without resorting to litigation.
- 4.5 The opposition parties presented a statistical study which allegedly shows that the outcome of the elections could not be what it purports to be. Mr. Njenga conducted a standard regression test which purports to demonstrate that there is no correlation between the voting patterns and the election results.
- 4.6 It was alleged that extra ballot papers, from a different supplier, were obtained by the IEC for clandestine use. Of $\$ 201cial ballot papers were procured from Canada but the fraudulent additions were obtained from a South African $\$ $\$ 201rm. These could only have been for use by the soâ\200\224called phantom voters.
- 4.7 Military Intelligence structures were used to transport electoral materials from Maseru to the districts without those of $\[\]$ $\[\]$ of $\[\]$ having been seconded to the IEC, as required by law.
- 4.8 The $in\201$ rst Director of Elections was removed from his post allegedly because he refused to condone irregularities.
- 4.9 The parties wanted to know the results of an IEC investigation into two incidents where electoral material was found abandoned. One incident was on the banks of the Kolonyama $200\230$ river, the other near the Mohokare liver.

Christmas days, they noted that the following days had unexplainable \hat{a} 200\231 high number of birth days:

DAY OF MONTH

MONTH NUMBER

In their view the above $a\200\230$ inexplicable irregularities $a\200\231$ occur in an $a\200\230$ inexplicable $a\200\231$ specii $a\200$ pattern throughout the entire voters list.. It is the

oppositions $\hat{a}\200\231$ submission that it is not possible at all that the above pattem could have occurred naturally. They therefore concluded that the voters $\hat{a}\200\231$ lists that were compiled for the 1998 elections are not a legitimate and accurate document

The opposition parties allegation, therefore, is that nonâ\200\224existent people were added on to the voters lists and assigned $i_7\201$ ctitious

ballot papers should be put in sealed envelopes for each candidate. The marked voters $200\231$ lists also have to be sealed. The seals are required to be signed by the presiding of $201\cent{center}$ and party agents.

3. METHODOLOGY

The enquiry was organised in two stages which will be referred to as the <code>i¬\201rst</code> and second stage. Representatives of the political parties observed the entire process. An interim report was compiled and submitted to the Chairperson of SADC on 26 August 1998.

3.1

The i¬\201rst stage

3.1.1

The aggrieved parties were invited to submit written submissions, together with any supporting documents. This was necessary for the purpose of deï¬\201ning the ambit of the enquiry.

3.1.2

The Independent Electoral Commission (IEC) as well as any other party wishing to do so were invited to respond to the complaints tabled by way of a summarised written presentation.

3.1.3

Plenary sessions were held on the 15, 16, 17, 21 and 22 August 1998. At these sessions, political parties and the IEC were given the opportunity to expand orally on the written representations. Other participants put questions to the presenters. A large conference hall was used and this enabled interested parties and their supporters to attend in considerable numbers. The media was however excluded from these sessions.

3.1.4

Participants were allowed to use experts in their presentations as well as in questioning those who were presenting.

3.1.5

All documents presented to the enquiry were made available to other participants.

3.1.6

The Commission also inspected some IEC documents and facilities at the IEC of 1×10^{-2} lces.

-

originates or ordinarily resides or is in employment.

The National Assembly Elections Order introduced a new registration procedure which requires a person applying for registration to be issued with a voterâ\200\231s card which bears the applicantâ\200\231s photograph and signature. This made it necessary for the IEC to embark on a new voter-registration exercise which lasted for seven weeks commencing on 5 January 1998 in approximately 1200 registration centres. The provisional registers were published for public inspection to allow for amendments and corrections. Consistent with the intention that the process should be as open and transparent as possible, political parties were invited to participate. Chiefs and party agents oi¬\201en attended at registration centres to ensure that only those people who were qualii¬\201ed to vote were allowed to register. Final votersâ\200\231 lists were thereai¬\201er compiled to serve as base documents for the running of elections. Supplementary lists were subsequently prepared to accommodate those corrections and additions which had not been included in the i¬\201nal voters lists.

2.5 Voting procedures

Section 70 of the National Assembly Election Order 1992 provides for polling for general elections to be conducted in all constituencies on the day/days i¬\201xed for elections under section 48(1). Approximately 2300 polling stations were established throughout the Kingdom and a personnel complement of approximately 11500 was deployed for the purpose. Each polling station was ordinarily staffed by 6 ofi¬\201cers as follows:

n

a presiding of i^2 201cer, the person in overall control of the polling station and responsible for the smooth-running of the voting process;

a deputy presiding of $\[\neg\]$ 201cer, who would normally be assigned the duty of checking the voters list;

```
Annexure A.
Pglii¬\201gal Pai¬\202jgs
Abbreviation
Full-Name
Registration
Date
DD/MM/YY
M.F.P.
S.D.U.
B.N.P.
B.C.P.
L.C.D
N.P.P.
P.F.D.
K.B.P.
LLP/UDP
L.E.P.
C.D.P.
N.I.P.
Marematlou Freedom Party
Sefate Democratic Union
Basotho National Party
Lekhotla La Mahatammoho
(Basutoland Congress Party)
Lesotho Congress for Democracy
National Progressive Party
Khoeetsa ea Sechaba
Kopanang Basotho Party
Lesotho Labour Party/United
Democratic Party Alliance
Lesotho Educational Party
Chn'stian Democratic Party
National Independent Party
In
11
n
n i
09/01/98
13/01/98
15/01/98
21/01/98
02/02/98
06/02/98
19/02/98
06/03/98
01/04/98
06/04/98
06/04/98
06/04/98
cFull-Name
```

Mokhantso Matanki
Moeletsi Samuel Mohlominyane
Linakane Tsekeli N.
861650 Flora Selloane
Mara Lepekola
Thelingoane Thabo Nyamane
Sethabathaba Tefelo V.
Ntoi John Molaka
Lethoba Solomon M.
Mokotla Makhiba C.
Makhetha Bernard Chere

 $W_$

J

8°,

, ,

_

.

-,,- ..

. -

_.-

_

7:1

7

_

2

23 55

.67-

′

-_ 50

-

 $\frac{-}{2}$,

4

202

. ,

```
â\200\2340511
79131?
34
97.
.301
- _
2
m -99
â\200\230
00 1
_. , 3.9..
-_
7
vecp 1"â\200\234..ch
, 4227
_ 1371
_
__51
W37 1. _
PFD 4 Kg: 595100 51.7517
. -
2...,
W ,
```

55 _ 05

5005 _> 00

```
113
114
7143
â\200\2357235
â\200\2345335W
5150053 -73
Â≫_ 70 _
._1_â\200\230J,,_,.._
20
00 ,
49-
07 W
40
90
0159 â\200\2359011
79
00
\frac{-}{113}
114
22
, \dots, -.-1.9..11. w._{72}..., 1... : ..._6^{\hat{a}\200\230}
, .15, ,1657 2,62,, 29:1,}
525
050
000
000
577
902
941
302
701
2 â\200\234143
. 003_
4231 5
CDP 7015-111000]}91005
0005
бm
7141â\200\230
7235
0335
0050
0174
0111
0101? .259. KBP upvuoé Al_éPâ\200\230ji-QEL 101p 2010139 76741.15
34 1 W \_ W ,
41000
2:.
,_,-
704
1270
1200
1709
```

```
1520
2717
2005
904
3925
1353
51500
2144
1147
1500
2077
1022
W1050
1222
129
2505
4014
_ W â\200\2352200
â\200\234201.9
_-§155 -1
_4192
â\200\2353200- -
4077
4300
5005
$233
4771
5104
4201
3052
,__5_027
490
5017
901
3700
400
770
4000
240 _ __3702
MAKHALENQMSI 7
0051901405140 -,
71190901450145144147)
K°L°(49L,,,_,
71490010021103)
MALIEPETSANEQOJM _.-.
01915140151)
nmammonsmgså\200\230zv)
W___ 0091.
UKHOELE (53)
0054*
9091041110154)
0222_
01355151110155)
0710â\200\235,
10115110150)
054m
3.115131517015157)
,2111'1151
010119155519014150) _
_ 703:
mmuegsa) _
```

```
701
ammqeo)
5443
01911411414510"
734%31
1151011115102)
731%
553021295110 (03)
5700
1.25.18),,-,-,,,
4410
MOVENIMJW .
7012
3504911114550) ,,.,
 _-, 00205;
01701000001107)
.. 031;
gnonum)
920$
24011401151450)
0572
1.5111111011110170)
0249
75001.01: (71)
0720
14411190017005 172)
11005
[110109-10054173)
0300.,
[110009795104 (74)
911073
[5501511111 175)
1114511111170)
0397
Mummsm (77)
0204â\200\234
57473.5
55011311170)
7099;
1401010110140179)
00011701100)
0101*
302â\200\230 1040 0540 595331
19m.
1005707» van:
11103;E
```

```
W233
74
4115
171
4130 L
509
5043
340
5001
574
4520
135.1,, 5_ 1132
5052
01s
1007
4025
932 .
2479
3951
2202
302
4290
300
3501
379
2010
, «0300
204 __ 5425
2475
1400
"2421
3410
2744
1945_
920
2077
2400
2400
2235
â\200\2351010
1911
145731 - \hat{A} < 932 \hat{a} \\ 200 \\ 224 \hat{a} \\ 200 \\ 2305 \hat{a} \\ 200 \\ 2247 \\ 303939
0090
2440
1.159} 509 770311:
L130:â\200\224 LCD 7
4227
3°72
5001
5150
4192
9005223290
577
4077
9024309
941
00 W203 1751371
454,
704., 7523
1270 1050
1200 .330
1709
1520
2717
```

```
557955524
2005
111
_, §Â§4W__3_02_W5220_ 7
00»
47?.1,
701
49 -23., 21925
5104
143
00
1350
4201
1500___ 003
40
1271
2144
3092
90
4945â\200\230 5027
1147
1500
4003
770
W [ 1072
4073
247
1097
4175
233
1 1222
74W4103
129
17155451155
2505
3029
503
3090
3300
302
2105
574
5001
2010
4173
1110
1201
5052
015
1007
4320
910
2440
302
3951
2002
4290
300
3501
.0200
2010
379
5515
2475 -254
1710
2034
3004
2744
1945
```

```
000
2077
2400
2400
2235
1710
1911
70122 00W
157 5
0953
150 _...
7730
9195
121
. 7009
0249
9212
0005
0300
9907
0307
7394
5700
7099
0201
102
90
140
210
325
01744
0111
0090
0050
0220
0704
, 0547
374 7000
7032
7010
7000
1
7341
52014 5 7144
W_ 5700
2927
0149;
315 1033 0000 597270 7527 2921 145039 02723 302050 2750 2504 170
12
00
_1_00_
140 ,,
121 .1,â\200\235
102
00
149
```

210 325 _ 7011 1.20

0.43 003 000 002 005 010 1.10

I

W 5 , 5 - - ··

32 W1 72 30

__-, i¬\202y
-,
__
95
092 005 0.27

___- W

W 25 1â\200\230»

174 , 302 000 0.00

2700 2000 0.40 0.45

10.45 0095 0.40

__ -0 41

115W 003

44410 12

у _' L'34

799

234

1W

T...,

04

 $\frac{-}{2}$,

ï¬\202 1

150

113.}

•-•

377

170 41

W

2.2.

04

32

234

3

2

rrrrrr

011

WWWWWWW

1W

1.15

24.41

101

04

J_WW

4175_ 2

32 72 45

371

1

7

alleged inegularities during voting; and the handling of electoral materials.

Apart from a number of petitions which have been lodged with the court, protests, demonstrations and a situation of relative unrest ensued. The Government of the Republic of South Africa was requested to assist in in\201nding a solution to the political impasse presenting itself in the country.

On 10 August 1998 the Deputy President of the Republic of South Aï¬\201ica met with representatives of the LCD and of three opposition parties, the Basotho National Party (BNP), the Basotho Congress Party (BCP) and the Marematlou Freedom Party (MFP). That meeting agreed on the appointment of a group of experts, comprising representatives from three countn'es of the Southern Aï¬\201ican Development Community (SADC), namely Botswana, South Africa and Zimbabwe, to investigate the allegations made. A ten-»member investigating group (IG) was constituted, four being from South Africa and three each from Botswana and Zimbabwe.

An observer from the Organisation of A $\$ 1-\201ican Unity and two from the Commonwealth have been in attendance at the enquiry.

The $IG\hat{a}\200\231S$ terms of reference were:

 $\hat{a}\200\2341$.To inquire into all matters relating to the alleged inegularities in respect of the 1998 national elections in Lesotho, including, but not restricted to

alleged fraudulent acts in the compilation of the voters roll

alleged irregularities in the demarcation process

alleged irregularities in the counting of votes

any irregularities in the reconciliation of votes cast with the voters roll

REPORT OF THECOMMISSION OF

ENQUIRY INTO THE CONDUCT AND RESULTS

OF THE LESOTHO GENERAL ELECTION

HELD IN MAY 1998

1 . INTRODUCTION

The Kingdom of Lesotho held its second general election on 23 May 1998, pursuant to a proclamation by the King made in terms of section 48(2) of the National Assembly Election Order 1992.

79 of the 80 constituencies were contested in May 1998 by 13 political parties and 11 independent candidates (see Annexure A). The election in the 80th constituency was conducted on 1 August 1998, having been defened from May because of the death of one of the candidates.

The state of the parties in the National Assembly as a result of the elections is as follows:

- > Lesotho Congress for Democracy (LCD) 79 constituencies;
- > Basotho National Party (EN?) 1 constituency.

i

Soon aï¬\201er the May elections, allegations were made that the conduct of the elections was fraught with serious irregularities which, in some cases, amounted to fraud. Speciï¬\201c complaints ranged from objections regarding:

>

the registration process and the compilation of the votersâ\200\231 lists;

```
8888M§NEYLNQMEERF 7,
777771777.
. 7
Total
7
Â¥
7
,7
7
7
77
.7
7â\200\231
·
I
·
I
7
7
7
7
7
7
7
7
77 ,7
7
7
7
775.67
19757777
; 7 7571577 77
```

WW WWW

```
7758. 7 7
7 77781785 7_ 7;
T707748,
758178
741877
784717877
RE-COQNT7777 J88 NQ'LW 7763718177777 W
(I
8239
7
5799
77517 7;
7 W 77
77
9097
77 7, 871778 7
77898
8281
810677.
7 77579733777
70.74!-
IOIAL 7
.8871 7
887717
8148
. 81478777. 81748
8101
I
7 8101
880787.
5.8187777
78.27 _7 7773772777__77
w9_:§(3I1II_
7. 8722 7,
778717778
7405 ,
77.788887 7
i 788178,
77,8878
757300 7 77-7799337777
77178
7
78868
7
77515
28?? 7
718888 78874.
```

```
8237
7 78455
5°23
739.4
, 77849, L 71785
7
7
7
Ι
7
7
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
```

```
MEQHAWANED)
HOLOLOR)
749757515)
018-797(75) W 7
88IHA-BUTHEN)
[AAUBA-MATSOU)
MBHOSQNG (7? LW
THABE-PHAEOH)
MAHOBONGm 77
85887778058118) 7
58877885881611!)
98.719789882711217-
7BEQI§Â§_1_382W-777
T3!!!§9&!â\200\230WE_7(717477)777777
MAPUTSOE(18!777777
UKHETLANE (176)
PEKA (1.7)
MOSALEMANE! 1787),.
885889u81777777
19§Le-__B.E7I:A77(z71)77
7
77
MAHMT786138177
KHAFUN8(28)77 77
TEYAâ\200\224TEYANENGM
PULANEm)
IEPEAEPPU m) 7
889%!854 (3.72
8EB§MÂ¥8LW7 7-
'MOWPO80180)
QIUIALINQ (55)
LITHOTENG(34)
```

```
THABA 30310 (57)
MACHACHE (38)
ROTHE (45)
MATSIENG (44) 7
MALETSUNYANE (45)
THABA PHECHELA (47)
KOLO (45)
THABA 75050 (49)
MAUEPETSANE (50)
IMATELILE (51)
THABANAMORENA (62)
UKHOELE(63)
QALABANE (54)
IMAFETENG (55)
TAUNG (55)
QUALASI (57)
MOHALESHOEK (58)
MEKALING (55)
QAQATU(60)
MPHARANE (51)
KETANE (52)
HLOAHLOENG (55)
TELE (54)
MOYENI (55)
SEBAPALA(66)
QHOAU(68)
QACHA'S NEK (55)
LEBAKENG ( 70 )
TSOEUKE (71)
MANTSONYANE (72)
THABIA - MOEA (75)
THABA TSEKA (74)
SEMENA (75)
MASHAI (75)
MAUNGOANENG (77)
SENQU (75)
UNIDENTIFIED
TOTAL
55 or TOTAL VOTE
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
Ι
. 487632 . 489200
7 57477475 77
88887 .
7 7239
7056
8891
8178877,
8436 ,7
5549
. 888°
.7 7.7982
;775.788
7
7846
. 8848 77788.18W
_ 7?§?Z_-__
77888877, 7
```

```
87134 7
8438
57540 7
;7_774827777W_.7482_
777L017,
_ .T79§Â§_7_
7 79788777,
7 781,57
7777788877777
59.18
7 878877,
8346
715476
74857 7777 717678 ___,777_718877__
7777778788___
73697
7788777,
7868
8912 .7
8986
5827
_ 5742
7724
7145
6649
9026
6245
6600
7258
6270
6350
6004
8136
8956
6673
8245
6776
6786
7966
7387
7576
6364
7830
7328
6460
4400
7022
7484
9123
6691
8207
9063
6956
8392
8834
8216
7257
5789
801
77888
778°
8912
5742
7717 _
7312
7066
9091
6317
Ι
7143
```

```
I 17235
6335
6058
Ι
Ι
6174
8111
8890
Ι
6659
Ι
8226
I
Ι
6784
6547
I
7866
I
7532
I
7816
I
7006
7341
7144
I
5780
4410
Ι
Ι
7012
7738 _
I
9195
7009
8249
9212
6605
8380
9967
8307
7394
5766
7 §317III
7141_ I
7235
6335
6058 7
6174
8111
8899
6654 7
8227
6788
6547
I 7866
7532
7816 7
6448
7341
7303
5780
4410
7012
```

488170

Ι

.

I

I

I I

.

100

100

100

I

Ι

I

·

I I

I I

_