

N

1% W1 9 23 ISM X5 1 :32 X :i

SOUTH AFRICA ECONOMIC

RESEARCH AND TRAINING

PROJECT

(I'SAERT)

2A POLICY WORKSHOP

NRESEARCH PRIORITIES FOR

SOCIO-ECONOMIC PLANNING

IN POST-APARTHEID SOUTH

AFRICA,1

10th - 13th DECEMBER 1986

WORKSHOP REPORT

March 1987

Paulus Potterstr. 20

1071 DA Amsterdam

The Netherlands

Tel. 020 # 646712

REPORT OF THE WORKSHOP ON
tREsEARCH PRIORITIES FOB SOCIO-ECONOMIC PLANNING IN
POST_APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA
Amsterdam, 10 - 13 December 1986

HkawOUcOHhOZ
abmrn om nozamzam
HZQOZm UHerHmCHHOZxTO mmHK
ermZZbHH n HZUcmHmer M%nmmeOHmm
ImbPHI bZU zmrmmbmm
Um mbOTZmZH TrbZZHZQ
ZOZmZ
mUCGbHHOZ
mZWroKZmZH
mZ HwoZZm2H bZU ?FDZZHZQ
meHQCbacmm
Pbmocw
erbF Hmncmm

Acknowledgements

The project would like to thank the following organisations for their generous support:

Bread for the World. Fed. Rep. of Germany

Commission of the European Communities

Development and Peace, Canada

Ministry of Foreign Affairs, The Netherlands

Novib, The Netherlands

SAREC, Sweden

Swiss Aid. Switzerland

Trocaire. Ireland

War on Want, Great Britain.

Report of the workshop on
"RESEARCH PRIORITIES FOR SOCIO-ECONOMIC PLANNING IN
_____. _____u
POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA"

Introduction

The South Africa Economic Research and Training Project (SAERT) held a workshop on "Research Priorities for Socio-Economic Planning in Post-Apartheid South Africa" from 10 - 13 December 1986. The workshop aimed at providing a forum for the discussion and identification of key research areas as a preliminary contribution towards the comprehensive research and training effort required in the transition to a democratic South Africa. There were over 60 participants comprising researchers and representatives of progressive organisations from within South Africa, European academics, and a delegation from the ANC and SACTU from Lusaka. The workshop comprised 12 sessions, each focussing on a key component of the South African socio/economic formation. with a total of 18 papers being presented. This report provides a brief summary of the papers, discussions. and research areas identified in each session. It cannot claim to be a complete record of all issues raised. but rather presents an overview of the workshop. It is intended in due course to publish a compilation of papers presented. and also to circulate a work programme extracted from the research priorities. This report then is one of several documents emerging from the workshop.

During the course of many workshop sessions it became clear that the discussions overlapped to some degree with other sessions, and that the interrelationships between the various components of the socio-economic structure were of

SAERTSeminar Report

considerable importance. The value therefore of an interdisciplinary approach in addressing issues of post-apartheid transformation was confirmed. A second theme in relation to research methodology, which was often expressed, was the need for the research process to be empowering, and for there to be meaningful participation by organisations of the oppressed in research programmes. Knowledge should be demystified and it was important for academics to work in conjunction with progressive organisations.

A third theme which emerged in many papers was the essential relationship of present strategies and action to a post-apartheid transformation. Research into policy formulation for a liberated South Africa, has also therefore to address issues of processes en route to liberation.

A fourth, and dominant theme underlying most of the discussion was that the key to restructuring any particular sector lay in the transformation of the political economy as a whole. While there might be a range of possible scenarios, and while there might be a trade-off between growth on the one hand and redistribution on the other, a common goal was shared of a substantial transformation of economy and society with the widely defined framework of the Freedom Charter as a starting point.

A further issue which recurred throughout the proceedings was that of the position of women. While there was a session earmarked specifically for dealing with gender debates, the issue was also incorporated into the other discussions and into the various lists of research priorities.

SAERTwSeminar Report

Apart from its contribution to debates on Specific topics therefore, the workshop was used to establish a broad framework for conducting post-apartheid research, both inside and outside South Africa. This will allow the organization of further workshops and research programmes on SPBCJfJC issues within this general context. While discussions held and contacts made were of a preliminary nature, it was felt that the basis had been laid for a co-ordinated attempt to tackle issues of post-apartheid transformation.

SAERTSeminar Report

SESSION 1 INCOME DISTRIBUTIONKPOVERTY

PRESENTATION: P. Wilson and M. Ramphela.

TITLE: Povertx in South Africa: the key findings of the Carnegie Inguirx and the strategies that should emerge from it

In a joint presentation the work of the Carnegie Inquiry into poverty was discussed, with Francis Wilson outlining the nature and results of the inquiry, and Mamphela Ramphela focusing on strategies emerging from it. The 1984 Carnegle Conference at the University of Cape Town had consisted over 300 papers on various aspects of poverty in Southern Africa. and there is presently ongoing research as part of the inquiry.

Wilson gave an overview of income distribution and of poverty in South Africa, pointing out that while there appears to have been a decrease since 1960 of the proportion of the population living below the poverty datum line, absolute numbers had increased. Indices such as the infant mortality rate and domestic water consumption indlcated the difference in living standards not only between white and black, but also between urban and rural areas. In citing statistics on poverty, however, Wilson warned against the use of single measures such as income to define poverty, and emphasized that the poor should be listened to carefully in conceptualising their own situation.

Mamphela Ramphela emphasized the need for the empower-ment of the poor in her analysis of strategies against poverty. Effective organisation is required and the research process itself should contribute to empowerment and to the demystification of knowledge. She noted the particularly

SAERTHSeminar Report

disadvantaged position of women and the plight of children under the present system. It was pointed out that short term strategies should be seen in their linkage to long term objectives.

Discussion

The discussion which followed started with a review of the problems of redistribution in the transition in Nicaragua, as a parallel for a future South African transition. It was agreed that comparative studies with other transitions would be a useful component of research, and that these studies would probably be best done outside the country. The issue of the relationship of research programmes and of academics to organisations representing the interests of the poor, was then raised. The point was made that political transformation was the starting point for tackling poverty and that research should be linked to Programme of the South African People's Organisation.

It was agreed that the interrelationships between the various facets and causes of poverty needed to be focussed on, and the relationship of debates on distribution to assumptions of production relations be borne in mind. In discussing priority areas for future research it was suggested that a clearer political framework would contribute to the debate on problems of transformation in a post-apartheid society. Irrespective of differences over political content and scenarios of transition, however, it was agreed that certain research priorities existed. These are listed below.

Research areas

1. The need to document and consolidate presently ongoing research relevant to a post-apartheid transformation;

SAERTtSeminar Report

2.

The examination of the Southern African economy as a regional entity and the South African economy within that;
The South African economy within the context of the world economy;

Research on experiences of transition in other countries;
Sources of income as well as expenditure in poor households;

Examination of processes of wealth accumulation;

The determination of an appropriate quality-of-life index.

The paper by Anthony Black examines some of the causes of the economic crisis in South Africa, with particular emphasis on the manufacturing sector. It argues that stagnation in manufacturing is due mainly to structural features emerging from South Africa's narrowly based industrialisation process. These include a demand constraint resulting from South Africa's skewed income distribution and its failure to establish itself as an exporter of manufactured products. Restructuring by capital and the application of neo-conservative economic policies have not only had very adverse implications for workers (and especially for employment) but are extremely unlikely to open up new avenues for accumulation. The states initiatives with regard to regional development are seen to be equally regressive and offer no solution to the problems of industrial stagnation and underdevelopment. The paper argues that inward industrialisation based on redistribution and the expansion of a broadly based mass market offers potential not only for more equitable economic development, but also for restoring growth and bringing about viable regional development.

Gerhard Wittich's paper focuses on the potential role of the Parastatals in post-apartheid South Africa. He argues that new political conditions could provide a suitable

SAERT Seminar Report

framework for a restructured and expanded role in economic development. Nationalisation Should not simply be seen as a quantitative issue (extending state control over further sectors of private industry) but as a qualitative issue. Thus there is a strong case for giving priority to reorganising the existing parastatals in line with progressive objectives before embarking on a strategy of further nationalisation. A reorganised parastatal sector would have a number of advantages, providing experience in managing large and complex units, generating a surplus for reinvestment by the state and 'transmitting' new state policies to the rest of the manufacturing sector. It was noted that parastatals such as Armscor had considerable technological expertise and that ways should be found of redirecting this to civilian uses.

Discussion

Responding to the first paper, A.G. Frank pointed to the openness of the South African economy, arguing that the South African economic crisis is a direct result of the world economic crisis with internal factors playing a very major role. He also argued that redistributive pressures would make a future South Africa less able to compete in the capitalist world market. A wide range of other issues were raised and there was much discussion on the difficulties of transition and the likelihood that this would take place in adverse circumstances of capital flight and of attempts to destabilise the new government. However, it was also argued that a political solution would have a number of immediate economic advantages, perhaps the most obvious being expanded access to African markets.

SAERTtSeminar Report

Research Areas

The suggested research areas reflected the concern with the question of the transformation of the existing order with an emphasis on the redistribution of wealth, income and economic power. The necessity of involving democratic organisations, particularly trade unions, in setting and implementing research agendas was also emphasized.

1. Comparative studies of other countries on issues of economic transformation were seen as useful;
2. The potential scope and impact of redistribution measures;
3. Ways in which the existing parastatals could be reorganised and the state sector as a whole enlarged;
4. Research into control of the production process and particularly into the scope for expanding workers' participation in decision-making;
5. The question of alternative industrial strategies with the focus on inward industrialisation. The expansion of internal demand, the development of a capital goods sector were included here but the potential for manufactured exports should also be investigated;
6. Progressive work is needed on financial and monetary policies. These areas have been largely dealt with by conservative economists but they will be crucial to managing the transition. Included here are fiscal policy and other aspects of macroeconomic management;
7. Issues of regional developments such as the lack of social and physical infrastructure in peripheral areas (e.g. bantustans) and the question of existing decentralised industry, were seen as important. It was recognised,

SAERT Seminar Report

however, that these would be dealt with in other sessions.

10

SAERTtSeminar Report

SESSION 3 HEALTH AND WELFARE

PRESENTATION: D. NUI

TITLE: The struggle for health: the struggle for democracy

PRESENTATION: H M.Coovadia

TITLE: New directions in health care: from apartheid to democracy

PRESENTATION C.C.Jinabhai

TITLE: The apartheid welfare system: from state security to social security

Three papers were presented by members of NAMDA (National Medical and Dental Association) in the health and welfare session. The first paper by Diliza Mji examines the nature and level of organisation among health workers, while those by Coovadia and Jinabhai deal with the present structure and future transformation of the health and welfare systems respectively. All three papers clearly locate the provision of health and welfare services within the present socio-political framework of national and class oppression. paying attention also to issues of gender and urban/rural divisions.

The first paper examines the history of organisation in the health sector, discussing the role of MASA (Medical Association of South Africa) which, it is argued, has failed to challenge apartheid-based health provision in its six decades of existence. NAMDA, on the other hand, has clearly focused on the socio-political issues of health and apartheid rather than looking after the interests of health professionals. The work done by NAMDA in relation to detainee, emergency services, and other services to

progressive organizations is described. There is also a discussion on broader interventions by NAMDA on the international health terrain and in relation to the new constitution. The paper points to the role of apartheid in causing widespread health problems and locates NAMDA as an integral part of the struggle for the democratisation of health services within the context of the broader liberation struggle. Organizational developments among the nursing sector, hospital workers, and paramedics are considered. The second paper gives a comprehensive description of the structure of the existing health service and goes on to address issues relating to a health care system in a future democratic South Africa. The extent and distribution of health resources and personnel are dealt with, illustrating the way in which these reflect the nature of a capitalist and racially oppressive state. Tables of data are provided on a range of aspects relating to health services. In dealing with the issue of transformation in a post-apartheid situation, the point is made that the intervening transition period may see the loss of some skilled personnel and other resources but that there should remain a substantial base from which a new health care system can be constructed. The development of a new system will not be instantaneous, however, and there will probably be the co-existence of privatised and socialised health services. It is argued, however, that health is a basic human right and should not be dependant on market forces. The paper therefore, examines possible moves towards socialised health care, including a network of clinics in townships and rural areas linked to community structures. A national health insurance service, controlling structures for health issues, as well as a range of other issues such as training and control over drugs and medical supplies are dealt with.

SAERTxSeminar Report

The paper on welfare follows a similar structure to that on health by describing the existing welfare system in South Africa and by identifying critical issues and a strategic approach to achieving a comprehensive social welfare system for all in a non-racial democratic South Africa. Current struggles in the welfare sector are placed within the context of the demands and struggles in the broader society. The paper points out that a new government committed to achieving security and comfort for all would have to spend an increased proportion of GNP on welfare. In 1984/5, the South African state had budgeted R 1,4 billion for social welfare, around half the defence budget. A number of approaches to achieving a comprehensive welfare system are examined.

Discussion

There were two prepared responses to the health and welfare papers followed by a general discussion. The first discussant pointed out that health statistics released by the South African state excluded certain bantustans and therefore understated the severity of health problems. The role of doctors as part and parcel of the apartheid state was mentioned as well as general issues such as the neglect of preventive medicine in training and urban bias. The second discussant argued that the availability of resources and personnel may be more of a problem than anticipated. Based on the Zimbabwe experience it was possible that only 30% of doctors would still be in South Africa five years after liberation. Problems of having a dual system of public and private health care were raised. While being seen as a transitory phase towards fully socialised health care, there was a tendency for private health care to become entrenched so that public health care is used by lower income groups with middle and upper income groups using private facilities.

SAERT Seminar Report

In the general discussion the issue of gender analysis into the debate was detail. It was suggested that this incorporatxnw a dealt with in some was central to how wnv looks at health services and that speCifiC areas of dvpixvat ion needed to be addressed. Related issues of SOClallSnllloh within health services were raised such as the equatiun 0! doctors with men and nurses with women. Attitudes patients whereby the medical services wer all-knowing would also cause problems town! (1:: e seen as for a genuine tr.nudnn mation. There was a range of diSCUSSJOH on othe) issues 0! transforming health and welfare SGYVJCvU in a post apartheid society as well as on immediate issues of supportinu the Victims of apartheid in the present.

Research areas

The three papers presented contain pilniity alvau bu research. These are grouped in the list beluw along with areas raised by the djSCUSSJOH.

1. Social policy reseath in tho hvalth and wvllarv sectors. This Will critically examine the idvnlngival functions of the eXJSting servlces, the avallahlo resources in the delivery systems, alternatives wnthxn these i.e. national health servlce, suclal serurily systems and economic con3lderations pertaining ln thw social servlce sectors. The sources and amount of lhw GNP that the political system will allocate, the redistribution of resources to corrert the rural/uxhnn imbalance, linkages with the economic system and with labour productivity and the exact form of the dual economy that may be allowed;
2. How can services/benefits in the health and wellarn sector be used for mobilisation in working class organisations (occupational health servlces), communlty based service groups (water, sanitation and health

centres), and professional associations (nurses, doctors, etc.);

3. How best can the needs of the "victims of apartheid" be met. Currently groups such as DESCOM, AFRA, Diakonia, Black Sash, SACC are involved in meeting some of these to survive during the transitional period e.g. Emergency Service Groups;

5. The role and function of multi-national drug and medical supply companies in South Africa. Exploratory research, which is practice oriented and lays the basis for an indigenous manufacturing capacity based on the WHO Essential Drugs List is urgently required;

6. Education and training of health and welfare workers must be evaluated and re-oriented to meet the peoples needs: researched;

9. Research which explores the position of women as receivers and as disposers of health and welfare, as well as their interrelation within the race/class axes and the way gender has a direct bearing on these;

10. Research into shifting the balance from privatised to socialised health care as an organisational rather than a technical or institutional question.

SAERTiSeminar Report

SESSION 4 DEVELOPMENT PLANNING

PRESENTATION: W. de Ruijter

TITLE: The development of a Blanning framework for a Post-apartheid South Africa

The paper explained and developed the concept of Social Accounting Matrix. The matrix is a numerical representation of the economic cycle, with emphasis on distributional aspects. It shows the link between production, consumption, accumulation and foreign accounts. It is particularly supportive to policy designs that are not only aimed at economic growth rates but to the "just" distribution of that growth.

The construction of SAM involves the combination of available data systems. Weaknesses of these systems can be identified by the programme, and sometimes corrected. Given the need for basic data, a SAM can only be constructed with the involvement of South Africans active in the planning for post-apartheid South Africa.

The matrix is a way of representing income and expenditure flows, which become the basis to shape future policies. A SAM can support different kinds of economic planning though the programme itself cannot be considered as a plan. In fact, it involves the creation of a sound data base that can be used by politicians and planners. For example, in the transition period in South Africa, a re-distribution of incomes might involve greater subsidies to sections of the population through local government. The matrix informs the government, whether this is possible.

Discussion

The discussion was controversial. On the one hand it was argued that the construction of a SAM is a time and

SAERTxSeminar Report

labour consuming process and less important than the actual contents of planning.

Others strongly came out in support for the construction of a reliable database as a vital instrument for designing future policies in various fields since such databases either don't exist or carry the biases of the apartheid system. However, a SAM only can describe a present situation and therefore, can never be a blueprint for economic structures in post-apartheid South Africa.

Another issue was that a SAM is not a neutral instrument and its development therefore, should be handled with caution. The participation of South Africans in the construction of a SAM is essential for that reason. Others mentioned that the joint construction of a SAM might provide an excellent opportunity for training South Africans.

Research areas

Owing to very strong views held, especially those against SAM, no consensus emerged from the discussion concerning research priorities.

Opponents of SAM for example, felt that research effort should focus on such issues as the working of the gold market; whilst on the other hand, supporters of SAM argued that research should not focus on abstract academic issues. like international trade theories: but rather on issues that effect people. The gold market therefore, should only be of interest insofar as it affects people i.e. the distribution of gold earnings and the social effects of the mining labour system (e.g. migrants).

TITLE: The role of women in the media in
post-apartheid in South Africa

This paper analyses the structure of the media in South Africa and the role of black women in the media. It argues that the radio and television broadcasting services quite clearly serve the interests of the apartheid state, while the press also tends to serve dominant interests. It is pointed out that black women are virtually absent from employment in the media and tend to perform minor and stereotyped occupations. The presenter, Ms Machele, suggested that there was a need for the training of black women in all areas of media work, including the traditionally male terrains of sport, political, and economic reporting. The nature and function of media would have to be restructured in a post-apartheid society to fulfill a more educative role.

Discussion

The discussion in this section ranged far wider than the topic of the paper presented and addressed research into gender issues in general. The discussant argued that the analysis of the triple oppression of black women in South Africa tended to be superficially treated and that the interlinkages in women's oppression had to be better considered. Women had to challenge their role in society and this was being done in a practical way by moves to reconstitute a national federation of women's organisations, which could raise women's demands in the context of the national liberation struggle.

SAERTtSeminar Report

A lively debate on the nature and relevance of feminism took place in one of the two working groups on women's issues. An argument was presented that feminism was a concept foreign to Africa, with the counter being that it was no more foreign than socialism and was indeed a liberating philosophy addressing a fundamental issue of human rights. In similar way, there was a debate on whether certain customs such as the payment of a bride price (lobola) constituted a valuable tradition or whether they represented a reduction of women into commodities in a patriarchal society. Most of the discussion focussed on the task at hand i.e. drawing up a list of research priorities. In this there was general agreement that women's issues should not be relegated to a single separate research programme, but should be incorporated into all the research areas being dealt with at the seminar such as agriculture. labour etc. This would be in Research areas

Issues discussed and determined as research priorities included:

1. Necessary changes to laws affecting the position of women such as family, criminal and property laws. This should, however, be seen in the context of the complete transformation of the legal system in post-apartheid society;
2. The nature of women's work in industry, in agricultural production, in the household, and as domestic workers;
3. Case studies on the role and position of women in processes of transition in other countries, as well as the role of women in liberation movements in South Africa and Namibia;

10.

11.

Relationships in 'traditional' society;

The issue of gender socialisation and the portrayal of women in the media;

The conceptualization of women's oppression in South Africa including the relationship of patriarchal structures to apartheid and capitalism;

The short and long term effects of the apartheid war on children and the family;

The effect of the migrant labour system on women, including the issue of women as migrant workers themselves;

The position of women within issues of health and reproduction;

Research into education and training needs for women. Women's access to training and employment and the potential for affirmative action in favour of women:

A compilation of women's groups and organizations.

SAERTtSeminar Report

SESSION 6 EDUCATION

PRESENTATION: P. Bardill

TITLE: Education in a Post-apartheid South Africa

PRESENTATION: A. Ramorola

TITLE:

The national struggle and people's
education for Qoole's Bower -
prioritising the future

The paper presented by Pat Bardill traces the historical
development of the present education system and of the
struggles against that system. The role of the education
system in maintaining the interests of the white ruling class
is examined and the potential role of education in a
post-apartheid transformation process. The aim of the
Anticipated problems in the development of a
people's education are dealt with,
system of

and it is pointed out that
the future system will be the result of the pres
ent struggle

being waged on the education terrain.

Education is seen as an empowering process

designed to liberate the masses,
positions in the ruling class.

and not to train elites for

The learning process should be
democratised by the rejection of traditional teacher/student
relationships and by breaking down the division between
education and work. The education struggle is placed within

21

SAERT Seminar Report

the context of the national liberation struggle forming an integral part of the current crisis for the apartheid state. Both papers deal with the role of student organisation and the NECC (National Education Crisis Committee).

Discussion

There was a wide ranging discussion on the two papers, some of which took the form of general comments, and some focusing on research needs. It was pointed out that residential segregation would create problems for deracialising education in the future. Ways of overcoming this, including the possibility of bussing, were discussed. Another major consideration in the immediate post-apartheid period would be the presence of a whole generation with hardly any formal education at all due to the continuing closure and disruption of schooling. It was pointed out that some students had not massive literacy and informal education programmes.

Research areas

Other points of discussion are included in the research areas listed below.

1. The position of women in education. This was not seen necessarily as a research topic but rather to be incorporated into other areas of education research;
2. Comparative studies examining both positive and negative aspects of other education systems;
3. The role of progressive student organisations at secondary and tertiary level and their relationship to worker, teacher and other organisations;
4. The need was expressed for research into the psychological effects of the current conflict, including the development of anti-schooling (as opposed to anti-Bantu education) attitudes.

5.
10.
11.
12.
13.
14.

Problems of elitism, and the associated notions of professionalism ought to be examined as well as the possible future role of foreign experts and foundations in undermining (albeit unintentionally) the objectives of people's education;

An assessment of resources be made including an inventory of human power skills being accumulated by South Africans at home and abroad, as well as differences in physical resources such as school buildings etc. in the townships and in the white areas;

The problem of institutional inertia and how present bureaucratic structures can be transformed for a democratic educational order;

Access to education other than having a formal legal right;

participatory;

Research on the nature, priorities and goals of tertiary institutions;

The need for literacy training, adult education, and education outside a formal schooling system;

Research into the development of alternative education and material in the present;

Research into the present situation in education at a national level and development of a national strategy out of the regional experience;

Situating education in the context of other social services such as creches, health etc..

The paper presented in this session addresses itself to the critical issues surrounding employment creation in a post-apartheid economy. Existing estimates of unemployment are examined and the required growth rates to reduce poverty and unemployment calculated. Green estimates that to prevent a worsening of present unemployment and absolute poverty rates would require a 6% annual GDP growth rate. To end absolute poverty within 20 years would require at least an 8% growth rate. There is a trade off between consumption and the provision of public services, and the levels of investment required to achieve these growth rates. The paper argues therefore, that it is unlikely that universal access to employment and household incomes above the poverty line can be achieved in under 7 decades.

Issues of redistribution and re-organisation of the economy, in accordance with a policy of democratisation are discussed. The probable departure of numbers of skilled white personnel, and training and education needs are also addressed. Certain tensions such as those between skilled and unskilled workers, between unionised and unorganised workers, on an urban/rural basis, on a gender basis, and on the issue of the large contingent of foreign workers are mentioned in the paper as requiring attention from a post-apartheid government.

Discussion

In the discussion it was acknowledged that there was considerable overlap with other sessions. One could not

SAERT Seminar Report

discuss issues of employment without addressing general issues of economic transformation and development. The first discussant argued that part of the failure of the South African economy to perform adequately was because it had remained a primary producer. On the issue of land reform he suggested that land reform should not be equated with the creation of a peasantry, and other agrarian options should be examined.

It was also necessary to be more explicit about political scenarios and their implications in discussing a transition.

The second discussant argued that the growth rates presented in Green's paper as being necessary to reduce unemployment were too high, and that the desired results would be achieved with appropriate policies at lower growth rates. In general discussion the contradiction between redistribution, and achieving growth rates necessary for employment creation, was debated. The point was also made that one could not look at these issues without examining the development of capitalism in South Africa. The transformation of various sectors of the economy had to be examined and a considerable role for the state was envisaged in the post-apartheid economy. Industrial and agrarian strategies, public works programmes, support for the informal sector, and a range of other issues relating to employment creation were discussed.

Research areas

In determining research priorities it was recognised that many would be included in other sessions. The issue of land reform would obviously come up in the agrarian session while issues of industrial strategy had already been identified.

ified in an earlier session.

were, however,

1.

2

3.

4.

S

(h

A number of research areas

listed as warranting consideration.

The role of the state and parastatals in a future economy and in employment creation;

Research on fiscal reform;

The provision of universal access to a social wage;

The possibility of public works programmes;

Research into the definition of unemployment and underemployment;

Issues relating to workers from neighbouring states;

Problems of child labour;

The nature of exports and the levels of technology used in the economy;

The position of women in relation to unemployment;

Issues of regional development and decentralisation.

Two papers were presented in the session on planning and the environment. The first, delivered by Dan Smit on behalf of the Environment and Planning Work Group, provided a conceptual framework for discussing research and practice in this field. The second, by Jeff MacCarthy, examined the role of democratic civic associations in promoting the politics of transformation which would lay the basis for a post-apartheid dispensation.

Smit's paper argues that the transformation of the political economy lies at the heart of transformation in areas such as housing, commuter transport, physical infrastructure, land and settlement patterns - areas which he lists as being the concern of the field of environment and planning. Historical developments in this field are outlined, including the spatial engineering of the National Party since 1948 which constituted the imposition of Grand Apartheid. In contrast, however, the struggle of the umbrella civic associations such as DHAC, JORAC, and CAHAC (Durban Housing Action Committee, Joint Rent Action Committee, and Cape Housing Action Committee) are discussed. The attempts by these organisations to control decisions relating to their environment are seen as incipient forms of peoples planning.

SAERT Seminar Report

McCarthy's paper expands on the role of civic associations, providing case studies from Natal. It traces the growth of civic associations and their challenge to the legitimacy of local state structures, arguing that the growth of civic associations should be accorded an important position in urban planning research and training. Current struggles in urban areas are seen as contributing to the formation of post-apartheid policy. The paper presents a survey of black attitudes towards a majority elected system of local governments and a detailed analysis of the struggles of progressive civic organisations, JORAC in It argues that strategies to secure material gains which at the same time direct themselves to building democratic organisation at the local level, will most effectively promote a democratic politics of transformation.

Discussion

The discussant for this session pointed to the need to establish a link between current struggles and the development of a theoretical perspective which the future. informs planning for

A further point on urbanisation and the relationship of urban to rural planning generated some debate. while problems of urban bias were raised. The relationship of progressive organisations and planners to the projects of reformist organisations such as the Urban Foundation, was priorities.

Research areas

1. Research into regional planning and demography. Informatv

ion is needed on population distribution patterns and how these could be Changed;

2. Research on the link between urban and rural planning with a focus on rural planning to provide a more supportive environment which could then reduce urbanisation Pressures:

3. The link between local political demands and future resource allocation. Encouragement should be given to participatory planning with community organisations;

4. Education and training within civic associations. Related to this is the need for communication networks between the older civic associations and newer peri-urban organisations;

5. Research into the democratisation of decision-making at local level;

6. Legal issues related to the urban built environment and the issue of land redistribution in urban areas;

7. Research into power structures and organising strategies in urban and rural areas.

The paper presented in the SADCC session aims to identify areas for research on the relationship between a post-apartheid government and the states comprising the Southern African Development Conference (SADCC). The assumption is that comprehensive economic sanctions will be applied to South Africa and that the liberation struggle will intensify but that this will not significantly damage the base of the industrial economy. It takes as its starting point the goals outlined in the Freedom Charter and briefly outlines different scenarios for post-apartheid relationships in order to raise issues relevant to future policy alternatives. Specific issues dealt with include trade and the balance of payments, migrant labour from SADCC countries, and South African capital penetration in the region. Present and future SADCC policies are also examined.

Discussion

In discussions on the relationship of South Africa to the SADCC countries the point was quite strongly made that more equitable relationships should be established in a future dispensation. The historically distorted relationship of the stronger South African economy to the smaller economies of the region would have to be re-examined in terms of trade agreements, energy and transport, and other components of this relationship.

It was suggested that planning and research should be conducted in conjunction with SADCC as an organisation. This, however, might not be easy as SADCC had not developed beyond

SAERT Seminar Report

a situation of addressing national rather than regional priorities. Destabilisation by South Africa in the region had contributed to the difficulty of SADCC embarking on co-ordinated regional action. It was also pointed out that there was interest in the West in investing in the SADCC countries and the extent of this development would need monitoring in that it would affect future economic relationships.

Research areas

The paper contained certain research priorities, and the discussion session also broke into three groups in order to identify research needs within the issues of capital, migrant labour, and trade.

Capital

1. Research into the extent of South African capital penetration in the region;
2. The nature, extent, and implications of foreign capital in the SADCC countries;
3. World markets for South African commodities;
4. The behaviour of foreign capital in the light of sanctions;
5. Post-colonial experiences in dealing with foreign capital in e.g. Zimbabwe.

Migrant labour (research should be conducted in conjunction with institutes in the region)

1. The position of migrant workers in relation to the South African trade union movement;
2. Recent and future trends in migrant labour in areas such as the mines;
3. Clarification of the status of non-South African labour

SAERTtSeminar Report

in the future, both legal and illegal e.g. citizenship, family law, contracts.

Trade

1. Evaluation of different export strategies and their effect on domestic employment;
2. SADCC industrialization strategy - how to evolve complementary production trade relations in sectors such as transport, energy and water;
3. A regional group to look at a rational energy policy In the face of changing industrial structures. The same with water supplies;
4. The medium term prospects for the port of Maputo if the Eastern Transvaal is not likely to use the port in the future.

SAERTHSeminar Report

SESSION 10 AGRICULTURE

PRESENTATION: P. Daphne

TITLE: Agrarian reigrm in g Egst-gpgrthgid South

Africa: Issues and Qgtions

This session on agrarian issues comprised a paper
M.Mb0ngwa, T.T.Tipoteh and the Wageningpn ANC support
group. Thereafter a plenary diSCUSSion was held lm dvtvxmlhv
research priorities.

The paper analyses the structure 01 the prosunt aquvul
tural economy and looks at the posmihility for its tranulnim
ation in a post-apartheid SOCJety. The relationship of thv
bantustans and bantustan agriculture to the cential ethUmy
is discussed, With the paper argulng that those areas
have historically been underdeveloped in order to svin as
labour reserves. It is therefore misleading to talk of
subsistence agriculture in a situation 01 dependence on
migrant labour where agricultural produrction contrlhutvn unly
minimally to household income. The conmmmeJal or 'whitc'
agricultural sector is also examined, and data prvsonivd
which points to a restructuring of this sector over the last
three decades. This has taken the form of a redurtnon nf
semi-feudal relations such 5 labour tenancy and the dvvvlnp
ment of fully capitalist relations on farms, with an arunmp
anying concentration of ownership, mechanisation, and
loss of employment.

The present structure of rural land ownership 13
examined and the possibilities for nationalisation and
redistribution discussed. There is also a brief analyulu mt
alternative systems of ownership and production on YPletrib'

uted land. The need to reconcile the interests of the landless, those crowded into the present bantustans, and workers on commercial farms is emphasized. It is also pointed out that farm workers' needs to be accelerated now and that the issue of extending people's power to rural areas requires greater attention.

Discussion

The first discussant emphasized the need for a clearer conceptualization of the relationship of the agrarian question to national oppression. Land distribution and the development of capitalist agriculture were linked to the development of a unique form of colonialism and this would have to be a prime consideration when examining solutions to the agrarian question. The Wageningen group pointed out that strategies had to be developed whereby the maximum number of people could benefit from agrarian programmes. The role of women in the bantustans and on commercial farms had also to be incorporated into analysis and policy. The third discussant made the point that linkages to other sectors of the economy had to be incorporated into the discussion, and that the relationship of short term policies to long term objectives needed to be understood.

In the general discussion a large number of inputs relating to research needs as well as to broader conceptual issues were made. The point was made that South Africa differs from other countries in which agrarian reform has taken place in that it has a fully capitalist agricultural sector within an industrialised economy. There is also not a peasantry in the sense of a class of family producers reliant on agricultural production. It was also pointed out that

SAERTHSeminar Report

agricultural policy required a balance of urban, rural and national interests. There would obviously be the requirement for reasonably priced food for the urban areas as well as continued exports for foreign exchange.

Research areas

The political framework within which research should be carried out was taken to be that broadly envisaged by the relevant clauses of the Freedom Charter. The gender issue should appear in all research categories rather than as a separate issue and avenues for participatory research should be found.

1. Conceptual issues. The need to research the relationship of the agrarian question to the historical development of colonialism and land dispossession;

2. The balance of forces. Profiles are needed of rural populations to assess the strength of different interest groups. This would include an examination of the problems and potential for rural organisation, and the issue of administrative structures and establishing people's power in rural areas. The plans of reformist groups would also have to be researched in order to be able to provide alternatives for transformation;

3. 'Land ownership. The present structure of land ownership as well as methods of nationalisation The projected demand for land needs to be assessed and some examination of the balance of interests between different rural groups e.g. farm workers, bantustan residents, is required;

4. Control of production and distribution. Different production systems (state farms, co-operatives, small farms etc.) need to be assessed, as well as issues of

marketing, secondary industry, technology, and Vjabnljty of different farm sizes.

5. Education and training. Projected needs for skills and training need to be researched as well as present availability of skills;

6. Comparative studies of agrarian transformation in other countries should be undertaken. Policies, practice. and debates should be examined particularly in situatlons with similar social structures;

7. The role of agriculture in the national economy needs to be researched further.

The first paper, presented by Maria van Diepen, describes and analyses the interests of the Western trade union movement (WTM) in the development of the democratic trade union struggle in South Africa, as expressed through their perceptions of the problems of the South African trade unions. It is assumed that these perceptions shape the character of the contribution of the WTM towards international solidarity. In this respect, she discusses democracy and unity as two major issues of common interest to the trade unions in the West as well as in South Africa. The paper asks whether the programme of action of the WTM can be adaequate to the priorities and problems of the democratic South African trade unions.

Moses Ngoasheng's paper examines issues of labour policy in a transitional period. As a starting point the nature of present labour policy is discussed in relation to colonization, racial domination, and the development of the migratory labour system. Recent reforms recognising the right of black workers to join unions are seen as attempts to contain worker militancy by more sophisticated means than outright oppression.

SAERT Seminar Report

The paper goes on to argue that labour policy in a transition should not be looked at in isolation of general economic policy. What is required is a democratisation of the economy as a whole, the basis for which is to be found in the Freedom Charter. Specific issues such as wage levels, freedom of movement for workers, the social wage, the right to strike and the future role of unions are discussed. A critical issue is the nature and degree of worker control in the production unit and in the broader economy. There is a potential conflict between partial interests (workers in a production unit) and the general interest. A range of possible relationships between the state and worker organizations in controlling production is thus examined.

Discussion

In responding to the first paper, the discussant suggested that it was possible to find groups within the Western Trade union movement supportive of progressive worker organisation in South Africa. In relation to the transition period, he pointed out that workers would expect immediate improvements in their lot having fought and suffered for years. In other transitions the immediate benefits were often more in terms of improved access to health, housing, education etc. rather than in wage levels. Points were also made on the need for job creation in rural areas, the nature of workers' control, and the role of the working class in the liberation struggle which would then influence the nature of transition.

The last point was taken up in general discussion where it was argued that the working class had to play a vanguard role in the liberation struggle in order to secure its position in the transition. A second issue which generated a number of comments was the conceptualization of the 'working

class', and how women's work in the home and its role in reproduction of the working class, should be perceived. It was further observed that there were categories of work apart from women's work in the home, such as work done by a peasantry, which did not comprise wage labour, and yet were part of labour in a wider sense.

There was discussion on education and training for workers, problems of health and safety, and on the issue of assistance from outside South Africa in terms of funding and academic research.

Research areas

In determining research priorities it was acknowledged that there was an overlap with other sessions and also that a direct union input was necessary in order to draw up a comprehensive list.

1. Research into relationships with union movements outside South Africa;
2. Further research into issues of labour policy and relations in the transition;
3. Problems of occupational health and safety;
4. The development of educational materials in conjunction with South African unions;

Research on the social wage (housing, education etc.);

Research into the issue of organising in rural areas;

Research into the definition of 'labour' i.e. the issue of house work and other forms of non-wage labour;

8. Research into changing structures of production in relation to capital intensity, privatisation, regional restructuring etc..

TITLE: Legal Problems for economic reconstruction in a post-apartheid South Africa

The paper presented in this session deals with the legal aspects of socio-economic transformation in a post-apartheid society. The author, Zola Skweyiya, points out that the view of the liberation movement is that the struggle for political emancipation cannot be separated from the struggle of the working people in South Africa to gain control of the "commanding heights" of the economy. The paper thus focuses on the issues of nationalisation of the mining industry and on the redistribution of land. Attention is also paid to issues of taxation, investment and exchange controls as well as the establishment of a constitution guaranteeing equal rights for all in a non-racial democratic South Africa.

On the land question the paper deals with the necessity for legal measures in a post-apartheid society to rectify centuries of dispossession of the African people.

Scrapping of the Land Act will not be sufficient in itself. Mention is made here of the fact that many rural households are effectively female-headed due to the migrant labour system and this will have to be acknowledged in programmes for development. In relation to the mining industry the implications of nationalisation are examined with the point being made that mining capital has diversified into many other sectors, thus complicating a nationalisation process. The presence of potentially hostile white management at all levels in industry presents an additional problem.

It is argued that legal measures should be taken to support the trade union movement to ensure a broader control

SAERTHSeminar Report

of the economy by the working class in conjunction with the state. The state would have to exercise a large measure of control over the economic transformation, and the present high level of state control might be useful in allowing the democratic forces to take over large sectors of the South African economy. Finally the point is made that legal measures alone will not ensure the success of a socio-economic transformation and that popular participation is essential in policy formulation and implementation.

Discussion

The discussion and research suggestions concentrated on the issues raised by the presentation. Questions of land redistribution, agricultural production, and support measures for rural producers in a post-apartheid dispensation were raised. The position of subsidiaries of nationalised companies, foreign based enterprises, and regulations on the outflow of capital were also discussed. In relation to the discussion on a constitution, it was pointed out that the question of a Bill of Rights was repeatedly being raised by liberal whites, certain groups in Western Europe and by the USA, with the objective of protecting private property and blocking economic transformation. It was suggested that the democratic forces should look at ways of taking the initiative in this debate. Other areas of discussion are contained in the research priorities below.

Research areas

1. The legal package required for a land re-distribution programme, including the role and structure of the agricultural control boards and other support systems;
2. The legal issues relating to nationalisation particularly in the mining industry, including the status of subsidia-

ries, foreign ownership, assets abroad, and the prevention of capital flight;

3. The design of a tax system aimed at redistribution and socio-economic transformation;

4. The question of legal rights, group versus individual rights, the appropriateness of a Bill of Rights, constitutional guarantees and non-discrimination;

5. Research into legal education and training, and the role of law and lawyers in a post-apartheid South

Africa. There is a need for the demystification of law and the question of popular access needs investigation;

6. The overhaul of the criminal justice system requires research as does the justice system in general;

7. Research into aspects of legal status, particularly of women .

)
.
.
n .-
' w
.
' . ' ' . ' awn;
j. A kw!
.
'V
:n .'
. .l
4
u
.
9' .
' - :
f; '
tfwv 1.: